

TOWN PLANNING BOARD

Minutes of 759th Meeting of the Metro Planning Committee held at 9:00 a.m. on 14.2.2025

Present

Director of Planning
Mr Ivan M.K. Chung

Chairperson

Mr Stanley T.S. Choi

Professor Jonathan W.C. Wong

Mr Ricky W.Y. Yu

Professor Roger C.K. Chan

Mr Ben S.S. Lui

Professor Bernadette W.S. Tsui

Ms Kelly Y.S. Chan

Dr Tony C.M. Ip

Professor Simon K.L. Wong

Mr Derrick S.M. Yip

Assistant Commissioner/Urban,
Transport Department
Mr B.K. Chow

Chief Engineer (Works),

Home Affairs Department
Mr Paul Y.K. Au

Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Territory South),
Environmental Protection Department
Miss Queenie Y.C. Ng

Assistant Director/Regional 1,
Lands Department
Ms Catherine W.S. Pang

Deputy Director of Planning/District
Ms Donna Y.P. Tam

Secretary

Absent with Apology

Ms Sandy H.Y. Wong

Vice-chairperson

In Attendance

Assistant Director of Planning/Board
Ms Caroline T.Y. Tang

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Mr Jeff K.C. Ho

Assistant Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Ms Alanna W.H. Chan

Agenda Item 1

Confirmation of the Draft Minutes of the 758th MPC Meeting held on 24.1.2025

[Open Meeting]

1. The draft minutes of the 758th MPC meeting held on 24.1.2025 were confirmed without amendment.

Agenda Item 2

Matters Arising

[Open Meeting]

2. The Secretary reported that there were no matters arising.

Case for Streamlining Arrangement

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions only)]

Presentation and Question Sessions

3. The Committee noted that there was one case selected for streamlining arrangement and the Planning Department had no objection to the application. Details of the planning application, Member's declaration of interest for the case and the Committee's view on the declared interest were in **Annex**.

Deliberation Session

4. After deliberation, the Committee decided to approve the application on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board subject to the approval conditions stated in the Paper. The Committee also agreed to advise the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

Hong Kong District

[Ms Floria Y.T. Tsang, Senior Town Planner/Hong Kong (STP/HK), and Mr Jacky C.L. Lee, Town Planner/Hong Kong, were invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Items 3 and 4

Section 16 Applications

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/H6/93 Proposed Underground Vehicular Tunnel (Connecting Lee Garden One and Lee Garden Three) in “Commercial (2)” and “Commercial” Zones and area shown as ‘Road’, Area below Hysan Avenue between Lee Garden One (33 Hysan Avenue) and Lee Garden Three (10 Hysan Avenue), Hong Kong

A/H6/94 Proposed Underground Vehicular Tunnel (Connecting Lee Garden One and Lee Garden Two) in “Commercial (2)” and “Commercial” Zones and area shown as ‘Road’, Area below Yun Ping Road between Lee Garden One (33 Hysan Avenue) and Lee Garden Two (2-38 Yun Ping Road), Hong Kong
(MPC Paper No. A/H6/93A & 94A)

5. The Committee agreed that as two section 16 applications for proposed underground vehicular tunnels connecting the basement car parks of Lee Garden One to those of Lee Garden Three (T1) and Lee Garden Two (T2) respectively were related and similar in nature, and the application sites (the Sites) were located in close proximity to each other within the same “Commercial” (“C”) and “Commercial (2)” (“C(2)”) zones and areas shown as ‘Road’, they could be considered together.

6. The Secretary reported that the Sites were located in Causeway Bay and Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited (Arup) was one of the consultants of the applicants. The following Members had declared interests on the items:

- Professor Simon K.L. Wong - being the director of a company which rented premises for catering services in the vicinity;
- Ms Kelly Y.S. Chan - being an independent non-executive director of a company with rental premises for shop use in the vicinity; and
- Dr Tony C.M. Ip - his firm having current business dealings with Arup.

7. The Committee noted that Professor Simon K.L. Wong had not joined the meeting yet. As the interests of Professor Simon K.L. Wong and Ms Kelly Y.S. Chan were considered indirect, and Dr Tony C.M. Ip had no involvement in the applications, the Committee agreed that they could join/stay in the meeting.

Presentation and Question Sessions

8. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Ms Floria Y.T. Tsang, STP/HK, briefed Members on the background of the applications, the proposed developments, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department (PlanD) had no objection to the applications.

[Professor Simon K.L. Wong and Mr Ricky W.Y. Yu joined the meeting during PlanD's presentation.]

9. Some Members raised the following questions:

Lease Modification Process

- (a) noting that the planning permissions for the two previous applications No. A/H6/78 and 79 approved by the Committee in 2016 for the same underground vehicular tunnel use with similar alignments and layouts at the Sites lapsed in 2024 and the lease modifications for implementing those two tunnels had not been completed, the reasons for the lengthy lease modification process;

Traffic and Car Parking Concerns

- (b) noting that the queueing at existing car park entrances of Lee Garden One, Lee Garden Two and Lee Garden Three (viz. Lee Garden One to Three) led to traffic congestion at Pennington Street, Leighton Road, Hoi Ping Road and Hysan Avenue, whether the two proposed tunnels would worsen the situation and traffic congestion in the area;
- (c) noting that there were currently 560 parking spaces provided at Lee Garden One to Three and 22 parking spaces (i.e. about 4% of the existing total provision) would be permanently lost at these developments after construction of the two tunnels, whether the parking provision could meet the relevant requirements in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG), and whether the applicants could re-provide a certain number of car parking spaces to compensate for the loss;
- (d) if the provision of car parking spaces in Lee Garden One to Three failed to meet the relevant requirements, whether sufficient parking spaces would be provided before the applicants divested all or part of the developments in the future;
- (e) whether there would be any change in the loading and unloading (L/UL) areas for goods vehicles at Lee Garden One to Three; and

Mitigation Measures during the Construction Period

- (f) the arrangement for construction vehicles accessing Lee Garden One to Three during the construction period and mitigation measures to minimise impacts on nearby road networks.

10. In response, Ms Floria Y.T. Tsang, STP/HK, with the aid of some PowerPoint slides, made the following points:

Lease Modification Process

- (a) the applicants had been actively working with the Lands Department (LandsD) on the lease modification process since the planning permissions for the two previous applications No. A/H6/78 and 79 were granted. After the approval of the previous applications in 2016, the proposed tunnels were initially bundled with proposed footbridges in the area by the same applicants in the same lease modification application. During the process, policy support was granted to waive the land premium for the aforementioned footbridges, which were subsequently gazetted under the Roads (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance (Cap. 370) in 2023, and the applicants separated the lease modification of the footbridges from that of the proposed tunnels. The two tunnels, which connected only among private developments, were subject to a land premium at market value. As such, the applicants needed additional steps and time to complete the lease modification process for the two tunnels and to resolve the land premium issue. Recently, construction of the footbridges had commenced, and the lease modification of the two tunnels was near completion;

Traffic and Car Parking Concerns

- (b) there would be no new car park entrance proposed under the current applications. The proposed tunnels would provide alternative route choices for vehicles to access and leave the car parks of Lee Garden One to Three. By using the two tunnels, drivers could avoid navigating at-grade to identify vacant spaces. This would reduce traffic on local roads and improve overall traffic conditions in the area. The Transport Department (TD) had also advised the applicants to deploy staff for patrolling traffic at the car park entrance and guiding motorists to park their cars at other nearby car parks with vacant spaces;
- (c) currently, a total of 560 car parking spaces were provided in Lee Garden One to Three. According to the proposed scheme, there would be 22

fewer parking spaces than the current provision. Nevertheless, the nearby commercial development at Caroline Hill Road, which was a joint project by Hysan Development and Chinachem Group, would provide approximately 600 car parking spaces, and was anticipated to be completed in 2026. The construction of the proposed tunnels would commence after the full provision of car parking spaces under the commercial development at Caroline Hill Road in 2026. In light of this, there would be sufficient car parking provision in the area;

- (d) there was no specific requirement for car parking provision stipulated in the concerned leases of the Sites. Subject to the views of relevant government departments, PlanD might liaise with LandsD regarding the stipulation of car parking spaces requirements in the leases to ensure that a certain number of car parking spaces would be provided;
- (e) currently, there were designated areas for L/UL activities of goods vehicles in the car parks of Lee Garden One to Three. The current arrangement for those activities would remain unchanged and would not be affected by the proposed tunnels. The applicants would co-ordinate and manage L/UL activities of Lee Garden One to Three and liaise with the shop operators to avoid traffic congestion during the construction period; and

Mitigation Measures during the Construction Period

- (f) several traffic management measures were proposed for the construction period of the proposed tunnels, including (i) limiting the overall construction traffic demand to a maximum of 14 vehicles per day, with no more than four construction vehicles accessing the Sites per hour; (ii) arranging access for construction vehicles only during off-peak hours; (iii) using only small trucks for the tunnel construction due to the limited headroom of the car parks; and (iv) deploying staff to monitor traffic at the car park entrance and guide motorists to park their cars in other nearby car parks with vacant spaces. Furthermore, approval conditions related to the submission and implementation of the Construction Traffic Management

Scheme before the commencement of construction works to the satisfaction of the Commissioner for Transport were recommended.

11. Apart from the abovementioned traffic management measures during and after the construction period of the proposed tunnels, Mr B.K. Chow, Assistant Commissioner/Urban (AC/U), TD supplemented that as committed in the traffic review report from the applicants, at least 80% of the current car parking spaces would be maintained at all times during the construction stage. The construction of the proposed tunnels should commence after the completion of the commercial development at Caroline Hill Road scheduled for 2026.

12. Two Members further asked whether TD had a plan to reroute the mini-bus and relocate the mini-bus stops at Lan Fong Road to the commercial development at Caroline Hill Road in the future and whether TD had reviewed the possibility of prioritising vehicles turning right from Hysan Avenue to Hoi Ping Road, as many accessed Lee Garden Three this way and caused traffic congestion. In response, Mr B.K. Chow, AC/U, TD explained that it was more convenient for people to interchange mini-buses at Lan Fong Road as the stops were closer to the Causeway Bay MTR Station. The mini-bus service to be provided at the public light bus terminus in the future Caroline Hill Road development was still under planning. TD had been actively reviewing the overall traffic situation in Causeway Bay area and would keep in view the traffic conditions and provide improvement measures whenever necessary.

Deliberation Session

13. The Chairperson recapitulated that the Sites were the subjects of two previously approved applications for the same underground vehicular tunnel use with similar alignments and layouts. Owing to the need for additional steps and time for the lease modification process, the previous planning permissions lapsed and fresh planning applications were required. The proposed tunnels were expected to improve the traffic conditions in the area by providing alternative route choices for vehicles to access Lee Garden One to Three.

14. Members generally supported the applications. A Member opined that the Lee Garden One to Three should be viewed as three separate developments rather than a single

development. Minimum requirement for the provision of car parking spaces as stipulated in HKPSG should be met separately for Lee Garden One, Lee Garden Two and Lee Garden Three, which would help avoid any shortfall in car parking provision in case the applicants divested the Lee Garden developments in the future.

15. Another Member expressed concerns about the queueing at the car park entrances in the area. He opined that the proposed tunnels might alleviate the traffic congestion at Lan Fong Road and Yun Ping Road, but increase pressure on Hoi Ping Road and Pennington Street. In response, Mr B.K. Chow, AC/U, TD said that TD was aware of the queueing issue and had requested the applicants to deploy staff for monitoring traffic at the car park entrance. Meanwhile, the Hong Kong Police Force was also informed to manage the traffic in the area and take enforcement action as necessary. In some new developments, the developers were advised to consider reserving sufficient spaces for vehicle queueing within their own developments to alleviate possible obstruction to public roads created by traffic queue for access to the car parks.

16. A Member opined that the proposed tunnels could provide drivers with alternative routes to access and leave Lee Garden One to Three through underground connections, which would be more convenient for drivers and help relieve pressure on at-grade road traffic. The Member pointed out that for commercial reasons, the applicants would provide incentives to attract drivers to park in car parks with more vacancies, which would also alleviate traffic congestion. Another Member expressed that it was imperative to adopt a holistic approach to provide information about vacant parking spaces in the Causeway Bay area. Many additional parking spaces would be provided in the area after completion of the commercial development at Caroline Hill Road. By utilising new technology, such as mobile applications, and installing signage and digital display systems at parking entrances to show the location, direction and number of vacant spaces of the car parks in the area, the parking management would improve, thereby alleviating traffic congestion.

17. After deliberation, the Committee decided to approve the applications, on the terms of the applications as submitted to the Town Planning Board. Each of the permission should be valid until 14.2.2029, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the

permission was renewed. Each of the permission was subject to the approval conditions stated in the Paper. The Committee also agreed to advise the applicants to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

[The Chairperson thanked PlanD's representatives for attending the meeting. They left the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 6

Any Other Business

[Open Meeting]

18. There being no other business, the meeting was closed at 9:45 a.m.

**Minutes of 759th Metro Planning Committee
(held on 14.2.2025)**

Case for Streamlining Arrangement

Application approved on a permanent basis

Item No.	Application No.	Planning Application
5	A/K14/833	Proposed Shop and Services in “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Business” Zone, Workshops 1 and 2, G/F, 320-322 Kwun Tong Road, Kwun Tong, Kowloon

Declaration of Interest

The Committee noted the following declaration of interest:

Item No.	Member’s Declared Interest	
5	The application premises were located in Kwun Tong.	- Ms Kelly Y.S. Chan for being an independent non-executive director of a company with rental premises for shop use in the vicinity.

As the interest of Ms Kelly Y.S. Chan was direct, the Committee agreed that she could stay in the meeting but should refrain from participating in the discussion for Item 5.