TOWN PLANNING BOARD

Minutes of 753rd Meeting of the Rural and New Town Planning Committee held at 2:30 p.m. on 8.11.2024

Present

Director of Planning Chairperson

Mr Ivan M.K. Chung

Mr Daniel K.S. Lau Vice- chairperson

Mr K.W. Leung

Dr Venus Y.H. Lun

Mr Timothy K.W. Ma

Mr Daniel K.W. Chung

Mr Ryan M.K. Ip

Mr Rocky L.K. Poon

Professor B.S. Tang

Mr Simon Y.S. Wong

Chief Traffic Engineer/New Territories West, Transport Department Ms Vilian W.L. Sum

Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department Mr Paul Y.K. Au Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Territory North), Environmental Protection Department Ms Clara K.W. U

Assistant Director/Regional 3, Lands Department Mr Lawrance S.C. Chan

Deputy Director of Planning/District Ms Donna Y.P. Tam

Secretary

Absent with Apologies

Mr Vincent K.Y. Ho

Dr C.M. Cheng

In Attendance

Assistant Director of Planning/Board Ms Caroline T.Y. Tang

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board Mr K.K. Lee

Town Planner/Town Planning Board Ms Sandy S.Y. Yik

Agenda Item 1

Confirmation of the Draft Minutes of the 752nd RNTPC Meeting held on 25.10.2024
[Open Meeting]

1. The draft minutes of the 752nd RNTPC meeting held on 25.10.2024 were confirmed without amendment.

Agenda Item 2

Matters Arising

[Open Meeting]

- 2. The Secretary reported that the Metro Planning Committee (MPC) had decided to adopt similar streamlining arrangement as currently adopted by the Rural and New Town Planning Committee (the Committee) to consider straight-forward applications and agreed on 8.11.2024 the selection criteria and types of uses/developments eligible for streamlining. Upon review and for the sake of consistency, the Secretary, with the aid of a PowerPoint slide, invited Members to consider if three additional types of permanent uses, including (i) shop and services on ground floor in "Residential (Group E)" ("R(E)") zone; (ii) shop and services, and eating place in pier zone; and (iii) public vehicle park in public housing development, which had been agreed for streamlining by MPC and considered also suitable for streamlining in the context of new town and rural areas, should be included in the Committee's list of streamlined applications for consideration in a group provided that other agreed selection criteria were met.
- 3. The Secretary supplemented that considerations for applications for shop and services on ground floor in "R(E)" zone would be similar to those in "Industrial" and "Other Specified Uses" annotated "Business" zones, which had been streamlined for some time. According to the relevant Notes of Outline Zoning Plans, small-scale shop and services and eating place uses (subject to a maximum number of kiosks or gross floor area) in pier zone were considered as ancillary to the pier use and did not require planning permission. For all such cases and those requiring planning permission in pier zone, there was an established mechanism to monitor the use of pier premises by relevant government departments, including the Transport Department and the Government Property Agency, taking into

consideration the compatibility and scale of the ancillary uses and their impacts on ferry operation. Similar to other applications under the streamlining arrangement, albeit obviating the need for the Planning Department's representatives to attend the meeting to brief Members on those applications, Members could still raise questions on the cases before deliberation. After consideration, the Committee agreed that the three types of applications mentioned in paragraph 2 above could be processed through streamlining arrangement starting from the next meeting.

Deferral Cases

Sections 12A and 16 Applications

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions only)]

Presentation and Question Sessions

4. The Committee noted that there were 17 cases requesting the Town Planning Board to defer consideration of the applications. Details of the requests for deferral, Members' declaration of interests for individual cases and the Committee's views on the declared interests were in **Annex 1**.

Deliberation Session

5. After deliberation, the Committee <u>decided</u> to <u>defer</u> decisions on the applications as requested by the applicants pending submission of further information, as recommended in the Papers.

[Ms Clara K.W. U joined the meeting at this point.]

Cases for Streamlining Arrangement

Section 16 Applications

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions only)]

Presentation and Question Sessions

6. The Committee noted that there were 11 cases selected for streamlining arrangement and the Planning Department had no objection to the applications for temporary uses or considered that the temporary uses could be tolerated on a temporary basis for the applied periods. Details of the planning applications were in **Annex 2**.

Deliberation Session

7. After deliberation, the Committee <u>decided</u> to <u>approve</u> the applications on a temporary basis for the applied periods on the terms of the applications as submitted to the Town Planning Board subject to the approval conditions, if any, stated in the Papers. The Committee also <u>agreed</u> to <u>advise</u> the applicants to note the advisory clauses, if any, as set out in the appendix of the Papers.

Sai Kung and Islands District

[Ms Lisa Y.M. Chau, Senior Town Planner/Sai Kung and Islands (STP/SKIs), was invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 6

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions only)]

A/TKO/130 Proposed Religious Institution (Church) in "Residential (Group A)"

Zone, Shops 15 and 15A, Level 1, Bauhinia Garden Commercial

Complex, 11 Tong Chun Street, Tseung Kwan O

(RNTPC Paper No. A/TKO/130)

8. The Secretary reported that the application site was located in Tseung Kwan O. The following Members had declared interests on the item:

Dr C.M. Cheng - for owning a property in Tseung Kwan O; and

Mr Ryan M.K. Ip - for his spouse owning a property in Tseung Kwan O.

9. The Committee noted that Dr C.M. Cheng had tendered an apology for being unable to attend the meeting and Mr Ryan M.K. Ip had not joined the meeting yet.

- 10. With the aid of some plans, Ms Lisa Y.M. Chau, STP/SKIs, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed use, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department (PlanD) had no objection to the application.
- 11. Members had no question on the application.

Deliberation Session

12. After deliberation, the Committee <u>decided</u> to <u>approve</u> the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should be valid until <u>8.11.2028</u>, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The permission was subject to the approval condition stated in the Paper. The Committee also <u>agreed</u> to <u>advise</u> the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

[The Chairperson thanked PlanD's representative for attending the meeting. She left the meeting at this point.]

Sha Tin, Tai Po and North District

[Mr Jeffrey P.K. Wong, Senior Town Planner/Sha Tin, Tai Po and North (STP/STN), was invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 12

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/NE-SSH/158 Proposed House (New Territories Exempted House - Small House) in

"Village Type Development" and "Green Belt" Zones, Government

Land in D.D. 209, Kei Ling Ha San Wai, Sai Kung North

(RNTPC Paper No. A/NE-SSH/158A)

Presentation and Question Sessions

13. With the aid of some plans, Mr Jeffrey P.K. Wong, STP/STN, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed development, departmental comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department had no objection to the application.

14. In response to a Member's question on the slope maintenance responsibility of the concerned Small House grant, Mr Lawrance S.C. Chan, Assistant Director/Regional 3, Lands Department, said that the issue would generally be handled at the land grant processing stage taking into account comments from relevant government departments. Depending on the situation, the Certificate of Exemption for site formation works under the Buildings Ordinance (Application to the New Territories) Ordinance may not be issued.

Deliberation Session

15. After deliberation, the Committee <u>decided</u> to <u>approve</u> the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should be valid until <u>8.11.2028</u>, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The Committee also <u>agreed</u> to <u>advise</u> the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

Agenda Item 13

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/NE-TK/821

Proposed House (New Territories Exempted House - Small House) in

"Agriculture" Zone, Lot 243 S.A ss.1 in D.D.23, Ting Kok, Tai Po

(RNTPC Paper No. A/NE-TK/821)

- 16. With the aid of some plans, Mr Jeffrey P.K. Wong, STP/STN, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed development, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department (PlanD) did not support the application.
- 17. Members had no question on the application.

Deliberation Session

- 18. The Chairperson recapitulated that the proposed Small House footprint fell entirely outside the "Village Type Development" zones and village 'environs' of the concerned villages, which was not in line with the Interim Criteria for Consideration of Application for New Territories Exempted House/Small House in New Territories.
- 19. After deliberation, the Committee <u>decided</u> to <u>reject</u> the application. The reasons were:
 - "(a) the proposed development is not in line with the planning intention of the "Agriculture" zone which is primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes. It is also intended to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes. There is no strong planning justification in the submission for a departure from the planning intention;
 - (b) the proposed development does not comply with the Interim Criteria for Consideration of Application for New Territories Exempted House/Small House in New Territories in that more than 50% of the proposed Small House footprint falls outside the "Village Type Development" ("V") zone and the village 'environs' of any recognised villages; and
 - (c) land is still available within the "V" zones of San Tau Kok, Po Sam Pai and Wai Ha which is primarily intended for Small House development. It is considered more appropriate to concentrate the proposed Small House development within the "V" zones for more orderly development pattern, efficient use of land and provision of infrastructure and services."

[The Chairperson thanked PlanD's representative for attending the meeting. He left the meeting at this point.]

Fanling, Sheung Shui and Yuen Long East District

[Ms Lucille L.S. Leung, Senior Town Planner/Fanling, Sheung Shui and Yuen Long East (STP/FSYLE), was invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 16

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/NE-KTS/543 Proposed House (New Territories Exempted House - Small House) in

"Agriculture" Zone, Lot 1228 S.A in D.D. 100, Chan Uk Po, Tsiu

Keng, Sheung Shui

(RNTPC Paper No. A/NE-KTS/543)

Presentation and Question Sessions

20. With the aid of some plans, Ms Lucille L.S. Leung, STP/FSYLE, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed development, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department (PlanD) had no objection to the application.

21. Members had no question on the application.

Deliberation Session

22. After deliberation, the Committee <u>decided</u> to <u>approve</u> the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should be valid until <u>8.11.2028</u>, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The Committee also <u>agreed</u> to <u>advise</u> the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

[The Chairperson thanked PlanD's representative for attending the meeting. She left the meeting at this point.]

Tuen Mun and Yuen Long West District

[Mr Dino W.L. Tang, Senior Town Planner/Tuen Mun and Yuen Long West (STP/TMYLW), and Mr Wilfred K.H. Chu, Town Planner/Tuen Mun and Yuen Long West (TP/TMYLW), were invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 34

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/YL-PN/81 Propo

Proposed Public Utility Installation (Fresh Water Distribution Main) and Filling and Excavation of Land in "Coastal Protection Area" Zone,

Government Land in D.D. 135, Sheung Pak Nai, Yuen Long

(RNTPC Paper No. A/YL-PN/81)

- 23. With the aid of some plans, Mr Wilfred K.H. Chu, TP/TMYLW, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed installation, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department had no objection to the application.
- A Member asked whether the residential dwelling to be served by the proposed works was an existing use. In response, Mr Wilfred K.H. Chu, TP/TMYLW, said that the structure to be served by the proposed fresh water distribution main was associated with a valid surveyed squatter structure for kitchen and agricultural storage purposes according to the record of the Lands Department. The current domestic structure observed on-site existed before the gazettal of the first statutory plan for the area.

Deliberation Session

- 25. The Chairperson remarked that the application was submitted by the Water Supplies Department, which indicated that the proposed water main was an essential infrastructure project for providing potable water supply to local residents.
- After deliberation, the Committee <u>decided</u> to <u>approve</u> the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should be valid until <u>8.11.2028</u>, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The Committee also <u>agreed</u> to <u>advise</u> the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

[Post-meeting note: With two public comments not included in the Paper, the application would be submitted to the Committee for further consideration at the next meeting.]

Agenda Item 35

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/YL-PS/733

Temporary Open Storage of Building Materials and Machinery for a Period of 3 Years in "Village Type Development" Zone, Lots 115 RP (Part), 116 RP and 201 RP (Part) in D.D. 126, Ping Shan, Yuen Long (RNTPC Paper No. A/YL-PS/733)

- 27. With the aid of some plans, Mr Dino W.L. Tang, STP/TMYLW, briefed Members on the background of the application, the applied use, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department (PlanD) did not support the application.
- 28. Noting that the applicant claimed to use the application site (the Site) mainly for vehicle manoeuvring and storage/parking of cranes as an extension to the existing open

storage use covered by an approved application No. A/YL-PS/711, a Member enquired about the background of the current application and the reasons for approving applications No. A/YL-PS/711, 697 and 680, which were located to the immediate north and northeast of the Site. In response, with reference to recent site photos, Mr Dino W.L. Tang, STP/TMYLW, said that the Site was predominantly occupied by open storage of building materials and machinery with some vehicle manoeuvring spaces. According to the applicant's submission, the whole site would be used for open storage of building materials and machinery, the application should be considered basing on its main use which was open storage. Applications No. A/YL-PS/711, 697 and 680 at sites largely zoned "Government, Institution or Community" and "Residential (Group A) 6" fell within Category 2 areas under the Town Planning Board Guidelines No. 13G, and were approved mainly on the considerations of complying with the relevant Town Planning Board Guidelines and that the utilisation of the three sites for temporary use would not affect the implementation of the planned public housing development and the long-term planning intention of the sites. On the contrary, the Site fell within Category 4 areas and the village "environs' of Ha Mei San Tsuen, and the applied use under the current application was considered not in line with the planning intention of "Village Type Development" ("V") zone and not compatible with the existing village setting within the "V" zone which had been well established.

29. In response to the same Member's question about the terrain of the Site, Mr Dino W.L. Tang, STP/TMYLW, said that while the Site was situated at a lower elevation than Ha Mei San Tsuen Road, environmental nuisances from the applied use to the residential dwellings to the south of the said road were anticipated due to proximity.

[Mr Ryan M.K. Ip joined the meeting during the question and answer session.]

Deliberation Session

- 30. After deliberation, the Committee <u>decided</u> to <u>reject</u> the application. The reasons were:
 - "(a) the applied use is not in line with the planning intention of "Village Type Development" zone, which is primarily to reflect existing recognised and other villages, and to provide land considered suitable for village expansion

and reprovisioning of village houses affected by Government projects. Land within this zone is primarily intended for development of Small Houses by indigenous villagers. There is no strong planning justification given in the submission for a departure from the planning intention, even on a temporary basis; and

(b) the applied use is not in line with the Town Planning Board Guidelines on 'Application for Open Storage and Port Back-up Uses under Section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance' (TPB PG-No. 13G) in that there is no previous approval granted at the site; there are adverse departmental comments on the application and the applicant fails to demonstrate that the applied use would not have adverse environmental impact on the surrounding areas."

[The Chairperson thanked PlanD's representatives for attending the meeting. They left the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 37

Any Other Business

[Open Meeting]

31. There being no other business, the meeting was closed at 3:10 p.m.

Minutes of 753rd Rural and New Town Planning Committee (held on 8.11.2024)

Deferral Cases

Requests for Deferment by Applicant for 2 Months

Item No.	Application No. *	Times of Deferment
3	Y/NE-LYT/16	1 st
4	Y/HSK/1	1 st
10	A/NE-MTL/11	1 st
11	A/NE-LT/774	1 st
14	A/NE-TKL/777	1 st
15	A/NE-TKLN/90	1 st
17	A/YL-KTN/1018	2 ^{nd^}
18	A/YL-KTN/1032	2 ^{nd^}
19	A/YL-KTN/1050	1 st
23	A/YL-SK/387	1 st
24	A/YL-SK/388	1 st
27	A/TM-SKW/130	1 st
28	A/YL-HTF/1180	1 st
29	A/YL-LFS/522	2 ^{nd^}
30	A/YL-LFS/523	2 ^{nd^}
31	A/YL-LFS/533	1 st
33	A/YL-LFS/535	1 st

Note:

Declaration of Interests

The Committee noted the following declaration of interests:

Item No.	Members' Declared Interests	
4	AECOM Asia Company Limited	- Mr Vincent K.Y. Ho for having current
	(AECOM) was one of the	business dealings with AECOM
	consultants of the applicant.	
30	The application was submitted by	
	CLP Power Hong Kong Limited	president cum cohead of Public Policy
	(CLP).	Institute of Our Hong Kong Foundation
		which had received donations from CLP

The 2nd Deferment was the last deferment and no further deferment would be granted unless under special circumstances and supported with strong justifications.

The Committee noted that Mr Vincent K.Y. Ho had tendered an apology for being unable to attend the meeting and Mr Ryan M.K. Ip had not joined the meeting yet.

^{*} Refer to the agenda at https://www.tpb.gov.hk/en/meetings/RNTPC/Agenda/753 rnt_agenda.html for details of the planning applications.

Minutes of 753rd Rural and New Town Planning Committee (held on 8.11.2024)

Cases for Streamlining Arrangement

(a) Applications approved on a temporary basis for a period of 3 years until 8.11.2027

Item No.	Application No.	Planning Application
5	A/SK-HC/356	Proposed Temporary Public Vehicle Park (Excluding Container Vehicle) in "Comprehensive Development Area" and "Village Type Development" Zones and area shown as 'Road', Various Lots in D.D. 244, Ho Chung, Sai Kung
7	A/NE-FTA/253	Temporary Warehouse (excluding Dangerous Goods Godown) with Ancillary Facilities and Associated Filling of Land in "Agriculture" Zone, Lots 360B S.A (Part), 360B RP (Part), 360C S.A (Part), 360C RP (Part), 360D S.A (Part), 360D RP (Part) and 360E (Part) in D.D. 87 and Adjoining Government Land, Kong Nga Po, Sheung Shui
8	A/NE-HLH/76	Temporary Open Storage of Construction Machinery and Materials and Associated Filling of Land in "Agriculture" Zone, Lots 173 (Part) and 175 RP (Part) in D.D. 87, Ta Kwu Ling
9	A/NE-LYT/826	Proposed Temporary Private Vehicle Park (Private Cars Only) in "Residential (Group C)" Zone, Lots 807 S.E, 827 RP (Part) and 828 RP in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, Fanling
20	A/YL-KTN/1052	Proposed Temporary Warehouse (Excluding Dangerous Goods Godown) and Associated Filling of Land in "Agriculture" Zone, Lots 956 and 959 RP in D.D. 107, Fung Kat Heung Road, Kam Tin, Yuen Long
21	A/YL-KTS/993	Proposed Temporary Logistics Centre and Associated Filling of Land in "Agriculture" Zone, Lot 403 RP (Part) in D.D. 103 and Adjoining Government Land, Kam Tin, Yuen Long
22	A/YL-KTS/1027	Proposed Temporary Eating Place in "Village Type Development" Zone, Kat Hing Wai Lot 208 (Part) and Lot 407 S.B (Part) in D.D. 109, 182 Kam Tin Road, Kam Tin, Yuen Long
26	A/YL-TT/678	Proposed Temporary Shop and Services and Associated Filling of Land in "Village Type Development" and "Agriculture" Zones, Lots 580 S.N (Part) and 580 RP (Part) in D.D. 117 and Lots 1790 S.F (Part) and 1835 (Part) in D.D. 119, Tai Tong, Yuen Long
36	A/YL-TYST/1284	Temporary Open Storage of Recycling Materials (Metal, Plastic and Paper), Construction Equipment/Materials and Electrical Appliances with Ancillary Workshop and Office in "Residential (Group A) 3", "Open Space" and "Village Type Development" Zones and area shown as 'Road', Lots 324 (Part), 325, 326 (Part), 327 S.E RP (Part), 1420 RP and 1421 (Part) in D.D. 119, Tong Yan San Tsuen, Yuen Long

(b) Applications approved on a temporary basis for a period of 5 years until 8.11.2029

Item No.	Application No.	Planning Application
25	A/YL-TT/665	Proposed Temporary Animal Boarding Establishment with Ancillary
		Facilities and Associated Filling of Land in "Agriculture" Zone, Lot
		1756 (Part) in D.D. 118, Tai Tong, Yuen Long
32	A/YL-LFS/534	Proposed Temporary Public Vehicle Park (Excluding Container
		Vehicle) and Shop and Services with Ancillary Facilities and
		Associated Filling of Pond and Land in "Village Type Development"
		Zone, Lots 1530, 1539 (Part), 1540, 1542, 1543 (Part) and 1549 (Part)
		in D.D. 129, Lau Fau Shan, Yuen Long