

1. The meeting was resumed at 9:15 a.m. on 18.11.2014.
2. The following Members and the Secretary were present at the resumed meeting:

Mr Thomas T.M. Chow

Chairman

Mr Stanley Y.F. Wong

Vice-chairman

Mr Roger K.H. Luk

Professor Eddie C.M. Hui

Dr W.K. Yau

Ms Bonnie J.Y. Chan

Mr H.W. Cheung

Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang

Mr Dominic K.K. Lam

Mr F.C. Chan

Mr Francis T.K. Ip

Mr Peter K.T. Yuen

Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department

Mr Frankie W.P. Chou

Director of Lands

Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn

Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Metro Assessment)

Environmental Protection Department

Mr Ken Y.K. Wong

Director of Planning

Mr K.K. Ling

Presentation and Question Sessions

[Open Meeting]

3. The following representatives of the Planning Department (PlanD), representers and representers' representatives were invited to the meeting at this point:

Ms Maggie M.Y. Chin District Planning Officer/Fanling, Sheung Shui
and Yuen Long East (DPO/FS&YLE), PlanD

Mr Otto K.C. Chan Senior Town Planner/Fanling, Sheung Shui 1,
PlanD

Mr Kevin C.P. Ng Senior Town Planner/Fanling, Sheung Shui 2,
PlanD

FLN-R11032, KTN-R10582 – 李笑蘭

FLN-R11062, KTN-R10612 – 李雨夢

李雨夢 - Representer and Representer's
representative

FLN-R11082, KTN-R10632 – 李育成

FLN-R11118, KTN-R10668 – 李子豪

FLN-R11026, KTN-R10576 – 李偉麟

Mr Ng Cheuk Hang (東北城規組) - Representers' representative

FLN-R11059, KTN-R10609 – 李俊亮 (Lee Chun Leung)

Mr Lee Chun Leung - Representer

4. The Chairman extended a welcome and explained the procedure of the hearing. He said that the meeting would be conducted in accordance with the "Guidance Notes on Attending the Meeting for Consideration of the Representations and Comments in respect of the Draft Kwu Tung North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/KTN/1 and Draft Fanling North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/FLN/1" (the Guidance Notes) which had been provided to all

representers/commenters prior to the meeting. In particular, he highlighted the following main points:

- (a) in view of the large number of representations and comments received and more than 3,400 representers/commenters had indicated that they would either attend in person or send an authorised representative to make oral submission, it was necessary to limit the time for each oral submission;
- (b) each representer/commenter would be allotted a total of 10-minute speaking time. However, to provide flexibility to representers/commenters to suit their needs, there were arrangements to allow cumulative speaking time for authorised representatives, swapping of allotted time with other representers/commenters and requesting for extension of time for making the oral submission;
- (c) the oral submission should be confined to the grounds of representation/comment in the written representations/comments already submitted to the Town Planning Board (the Board) during the exhibition period of the respective Outline Zoning Plans (OZPs) or the publication period of the representations; and
- (d) to ensure a smooth and efficient conduct of the meeting, the representer/commenter should not repeat unnecessarily long the same points which had already been presented by others earlier at the same meeting. Representers/commenters should avoid reading out or repeating statements contained in the written representations/comments already submitted as the written submissions had already been provided to Members for their consideration.

5. The Chairman said that each presentation, except with time extension allowed, should be within 10 minutes and there was a timer device to alert the representers and the representers' representatives 2 minutes before the allotted time was to expire and when the allotted time limit was up.

6. The Chairman said that the proceedings of the hearing would be broadcast on-line. The video recording of the presentation made by the representative of PlanD on the first day of the Group 4 hearing (i.e. 13.10.2014) had been uploaded to the Board's website for the meeting and would not be repeated at the meeting. He would first invite the representers/representers' representatives to make their oral submissions, following the reference number of each representer who had registered with the Board's Secretariat on the day. After all registered attendees had completed their oral submissions, there would be a question and answer (Q&A) session which Members could direct enquiries to any attendee(s) of the meeting.

7. The Chairman then invited the representers/authorised representatives to elaborate on their representations.

FLN-R11032, KTN-R10582 – 李笑蘭

FLN-R11062, KTN-R10612 – 李雨夢

8. Ms 李雨夢 made the following main points:

Unsuccessful Housing Policy in Hong Kong

- (a) by making reference to her living experience in Taiwan, it could be seen that the housing policy in Hong Kong was unsuccessful. Many young people in Hong Kong could not afford to buy their own flats but needed to rent small and congested "subdivided units" in the urban areas. Apart from the high rental and poor living environment, young graduates were being further accused of competing for the public housing resources with low income families;

[Dr W.K. Yau returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (b) she was not against constructing more public housing units to meet the acute housing shortage in Hong Kong. However, it was wrong to achieve the target by destructing the homes of the others, like the way in which the North East New Territories New Development Areas (NENT

NDA's) project was doing. Given there were some 2,600 ha of vacant housing sites/short term tenancy sites in the territory, it was questionable why the Government chose not to develop those areas first but to opt for developing the NDAs which had only some 612 ha of land;

- (c) in view of the remoteness of the NENT NDAs from the urban areas, there was also concern as to whether there would be adequate transport infrastructure to meet the needs of the future residents;

[Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn returned to join the meeting at this point.]

The Planning Approach adopted under the NENT NDAs Project

- (d) the NENT NDAs Planning and Engineering Study (NENT Study) was undertaken in an undemocratic manner and there was a lack of public participation during the course of the NENT Study. The Government had never considered how the villagers and people living there would be affected, and whether the elderly in particular could adapt to the new living environment. As a result, the NDAs developed would result in disruption of the original community, breaking of the residents' social ties and connections, and destruction of the rural environment;
- (e) Tin Shui Wai new town was a typical example. While Tin Shui Wai had provided homes for tens of thousands of people, people living there needed to travel a long distance to the urban areas for employment and other social needs. Besides, the social and community support in Tin Shui Wai was poorly developed, which had resulted in many social problems;

“Developer Hegemony” and “Collusion between Government and Business Sector”

- (f) the root of those problems was “developer hegemony” in Hong Kong. If the housing policy in Hong Kong was properly devised, such problems would not have occurred. If the Government recognised that the crux of the question was shortage of housing land in the territory, then those

vacant/unused land in the territory should be used for developing housing units first;

- (g) a large amount of agricultural land had been accumulated by property developers in the past few decades as agricultural land price was low. With the implementation of the NENT NDAs, they could make a lot of profits through the Government resuming their land or public-private cooperation development schemes. It would give the impression of “collusion between Government and business sector”. Besides, she was astonished to learn that the family of the Secretary for Development had involved in land acquisition in the area bounded by the NDAs but he could still not be subject to criminal liability;

Lack of Agricultural Development Policy in Hong Kong

- (h) people might say that a lot of agricultural land in Hong Kong had been left vacant/fallow for a long time and the NENT NDAs could provide a meaningful use for such abandoned arable land. It should, however, be pointed out that Hong Kong had, in fact, a long history of agriculture and agricultural activities still remained prosperous some 20 to 30 years ago. Besides, the abandonment of our agricultural land would result in unstable food supply for our people and hence the loss of our political autonomy. As many of our basic foodstuffs, including beef, pork, chicken, freshwater fishes, rice and vegetables, were imported from the Mainland, food supply could become one of the control measures in case the Central Government intended to tighten her control over Hong Kong people. On the contrary, it was recorded in 1979’s Hong Kong Yearbook that the agricultural policy adopted by the colonial government was to maintain a reasonable level of basic foodstuff supply locally so as not to rely heavily on the import from the Mainland;

[Ms Bonnie J.Y. Chan returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (i) despite the difficulties and high production cost in the agricultural sector, some farmers were still practising cultivation in the territory, like those

farmers in Ma Shi Po. However, the farmers' way of living would be seriously affected by the NENT NDAs, which would mean, in turn, the eradication of one of the economic pillars in Hong Kong, i.e. agricultural activities;

- (j) with the returning of Hong Kong's sovereignty to the Mainland in 1997, the Government became less supportive of agricultural activities in Hong Kong and many farmers were lured to abandon their farmland locally for operating farms in the Mainland. Besides, the Government further adopted political measures to win over the agricultural practitioners. For example, it was noted that 60 places were allotted to the agricultural and fisheries sector in the 1,200-place Chief Executive's Election Committee; and

[Mr Francis T.K. Ip returned to join the meeting at this point.]

Conclusion

- (k) the housing shortage problem in Hong Kong was originated from "developer hegemony" and the fallacies of capitalism. The implementation of the NENT NDAs could not solve these problems but would uproot Hong Kong's agricultural development, rendering many affected families homeless and farmers jobless. The Board should carefully consider whether the NDAs should still proceed.

[Actual speaking time: 20 minutes]

FLN-R11082, KTN-R10632 – 李育成

FLN-R11118, KTN-R10668 – 李子豪

FLN-R11026, KTN-R10576 – 李偉麟

9. Before starting his oral presentation, Mr Ng Cheuk Hang made the following comments on the representation hearing arrangements:

Speaking Time Restriction

- (a) the allotment of 10-minute speaking time for each representer was extremely unfair. He quoted that Dr Hon Kenneth K.L. Chan, a Legislative Councillor, was being stopped from speaking when attending the representation hearing on the Central District (Extension) OZP earlier. To limit the speaking time for each representer was not an appropriate way for the Board to handle the large volume of representations received. Members of the Board should consider why the NENT NDAs had attracted so many representations and, with that, the Government still decided to go ahead. For procedural fairness, the Board should allow each representer to finish his/her oral presentation without setting a time limit;

Hearing Logistics and Declaration of Interest of the Board Members

- (b) another comment was about the placement of metal barricades near the registration counter on the ground floor of North Point Government Offices. That reflected that Members of the Board were afraid of the representers/commenters. Such arrangement was not respectful to the representers/commenters and should be removed; and
- (c) it was noted that some Members of the Board had failed to declare interest on hearing the representations in respect of the Kwu Tung North (KTN) and Fanling North (FLN) OZPs. That would present a very poor image of the Board to the public. Besides, it was noted that the staff of the Board's Secretariat had mistakenly passed outdated information on Members' declarations to the media. All those incidents would lead the public to suspect that there was collusion between Government and business sector.

10. The Chairman reminded Mr Ng of the procedures set out in the Guidance Notes which had been provided to all representers/commenters prior to the meeting in making his oral submission. In particular, the oral submission should be confined to the grounds of representations/comments in the written representations/comments already submitted to the Board. In response, Mr Ng said that the Board had violated the procedures in handling the representations/comments received against the concerned OZPs.

The Board should bear the consequences in case there was any judicial review lodged against the Board's decision in future.

11. In view of the time spent to clarify with Mr Ng on the hearing procedures, the Chairman said that additional 5 minutes speaking time would be allotted to Mr Ng.

12. Mr Ng made the following main points:

Importance of Agricultural Development in Hong Kong

- (a) the area bounded by the NENT NDAs accounted for some 25% of Hong Kong's active agricultural land but the self-sufficiency rate of food supply in Hong Kong was as low as 7%. For comparison, it was the government's policy in some Mainland cities like Beijing, Shanghai and Dongguan that the self-sufficiency rate of food supply should be kept at 30%. It was wrong for Hong Kong to maintain such a low self-sufficiency rate of food supply. If the NDAs were to proceed, it would lead to further reduction of the local food supply. The situation would become even worse when there were unexpected incidents in the Mainland affecting the timely delivery of food to Hong Kong;
- (b) apart from the above, the toxic vegetable incident in the Mainland was another reason why Hong Kong should maintain its local agricultural development as many families were concerned that toxic vegetables might affect the health of their children and family members;
- (c) although it was true that Hong Kong needed more land for meeting our housing needs, one should not forget that farmland was equally important to the sustainable food supply for our future generations;
- (d) the segregation of farmers from their arable land or the pooling together farming activities within a large piece of land was infeasible, undesirable and not sustainable from the agricultural development point of view. Based on his observation, farmers in Hong Kong used much less fertilizers than farmers in the Mainland. Ma Shi Po was a typical

example. However, the resumption of farmland by the Government for the NENT NDAs would mean the end of farming activities in Hong Kong;

- (e) in August this year, an old lady living in Kei Lun Tsuen, Kwu Tung found her village house being demolished by the developer when she went out for shopping. That reflected how important the NENT NDAs would be to the developers as it could bring about huge financial returns. However, the importance of agricultural land to the farmers and the local villagers was being neglected by the Government;
- (f) Long Valley was originally zoned “Green Belt” (“GB”) on another OZP but it was now incorporated into the KTN OZP for the NDA development. It should, however, be noted that, by doing so, it would only increase the greening ratio of the planning scheme area covered by the KTN OZP but not increasing the total area zoned “GB” in this area;
- (g) the area stretching from Deep Bay to Sha Tau Kok in the territory served as an important green buffer between Hong Kong and Shenzhen. It was also an important agricultural base in Hong Kong. However, large-scale land resumption in the NENT NDAs would result in eradication of agricultural activities there. Similar situation would be expected to occur under other upcoming planning and development projects in Hong Kong, for example Yuen Long South, Hung Shui Kiu and Kam Tin South;

Fairness of the Compensation Policy

- (h) referring to the Choi Yuen Tsuen case in Shek Kong, he learnt that compensation was calculated on the basis of the number of vegetable plants grown on the farmland. That way of calculating compensation was considered unfair and ridiculous bearing in mind that if the land was not resumed, the farmers could use the land for growing crops in a sustainable manner;

- (i) it was mentioned in Town Planning Board Paper No. 9748 that the compensation arrangement was not determined by the Board. However, the Board, through the plan-making process, would decide who would be affected by the NENT NDAs and need to move out from their living places. In view of the far-reaching implications of those two OZPs, the Board should call a halt to the NDAs and revisit the whole development with a view to exploring whether the 'no removal, no clearance' request of the local villagers could be entertained;

Viability of Agricultural Rehabilitation

- (j) if the NENT NDAs continued to proceed, the Choi Yuen Tsuen incident would be repeated again. Although the Government emphasised that agricultural rehabilitation was allowed for under the current policy, it should be noted that farmers could not be detached from their farmland. If their land were resumed and farmers were re-housed to the public housing units, agricultural rehabilitation would not be feasible;

Role of the Government in curbing the Housing Shortage in Hong Kong

- (k) land reserve might not be an effective tool in curbing the shortage of housing units in Hong Kong. In fact, population growth in Hong Kong could be controlled by the population policy, for example by restricting the number of immigrants to Hong Kong. Besides, it should also be noted that the birth rate in Hong Kong was declining in recent years;
- (l) the failure in the land allocation system had resulted in the long public housing waiting list and people in Hong Kong could only afford to buy small but expensive flats in the private property market. For meeting Hong Kong's housing shortage, priority should be given to develop the brownfield sites in the urban areas, vacant land in the rural area (for example the site in Wang Chau which was originally identified for public housing development but was eventually dropped due to local objections), short term tenancy sites in the New Territories or sites currently being used for temporary uses in the rural area, but not those areas which were the homes of many local villagers and/or agricultural land used by the

farmers;

Sustainable Development in Hong Kong and the Right to Choose the Way of Living

- (m) implementation of the NENT NDAs meant that the young generation's opportunity of using the agricultural land as well as their right to enjoy the greenery rural environment would be deprived of. That was in contradiction to the principles of sustainable development being vigorously promoted by the Government ;
- (n) the NENT NDAs, which would lead to destruction to our rural area and eradication of agricultural activities in the territory, was considered not sustainable. The reason why the young generation raised strong objection to the NDAs was that they would like to have the opportunity to enjoy agricultural living, enjoy the greenery in the rural area, and build up a community for all, i.e. the aspiration for 'urban-rural symbiosis' (城鄉共生). The Government should respect the aspiration of the young generation and let them decide their own future. However, the rights and aspirations of the young generation were not respected as reflected by the way the Government was handling the NDAs;
- (o) farmers in Hong Kong had never sought the support or assistance of the Government in the past nor was there any policy to help promote agricultural development in Hong Kong. In case their homes and farmland were resumed/taken away by the Government for the NENT NDAs, they would have no choice but to apply for comprehensive social security assistance, thus creating a burden to the social security system in Hong Kong;
- (p) the area covered by the NENT NDAs was already a well-developed community although its size might not be as big as that of a new town. Nevertheless, such rural type community should still be respected by the Government;

- (q) the role played by agriculture in Hong Kong was diminishing in recent years as compared to the role played by the secondary and tertiary industries in Hong Kong. Still, the importance of agricultural activities should not be under-estimated and neglected by the Government. It should be noted that urban life and rural life were in fact dependant on each other. That was the reason why some Mainland cities targeted to maintain a self-sufficiency rate of food supply as high as 30% so as not to rely on the imported food. He did not understand why Hong Kong could be satisfied with a 7% self-sufficiency rate of food supply;

Conclusion

- (r) on 8 October 2014, 東北城規組 convened a press conference to urge that all Members of the Board should be held responsible for the NENT NDAs incident and resign. While there might be difficulties for all Members of the Board to resign, the Board was requested to think critically whether there was a pressing need to proceed with the NDAs; and
- (s) the Board was also requested to consider and weigh carefully against the development needs of Hong Kong, the needs of the future generation and their right to choose the way of living, and the implications of the OZPs in respect of the NENT NDAs before making a decision on the representations received.

[Actual speaking time: 35 minutes]

[Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

FLN-R11059, KTN-R10609 – 李俊亮 (Mr Lee Chun Leung)

13. In response to the enquiry of Mr Lee Chun Leung, the Chairman explained that each representer would be allotted a 10-minute speaking time in making oral submission and that did not include the speaking time in the Q&A session.

14. Mr Lee Chun Leung made the following main points:

Needs of the Affected Parties

- (a) he walked past the ex-North Point Estate site that morning and considered that the Estate, being located adjacent to the waterfront, close to the public transport facilities and within walking distance from the shopping facilities, was once a nice living place for its residents but now had been demolished and its residents were relocated elsewhere. He worried whether the same situation would occur to the residents currently living in the area bounded by the NENT NDAs. Besides, he was concerned that the development sites in the NDAs would only be sold to the developers for high-rise residential buildings, shopping centres and office buildings, and the affected parties would benefit nothing from the NDAs;
- (b) there were a number of residential care homes for the elderly (RCHEs) at Dills Corner Garden (DCG) which would be affected by the NENT NDAs and the old people living there would need to be reprovisioned elsewhere. The issue was not simply to find new RCHE places for those affected old people. The Government should take into account the feelings of and the problems encountered by these old people when implementing the NDAs;
- (c) apart from the NENT NDAs, there were also a number of major development projects in the territory in the pipeline. It was necessary for the Board/the Government to think through carefully the implications of these development schemes before deciding on whether they should be proceeded;

[Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang returned to join the meeting at this point.]

Assumptions adopted in the NENT NDAs Project

- (d) it was mentioned in the summary of major grounds/proposals of representations of Group 4 and PlanD's responses that the KTN and FLN

NDAs together would provide a total of about 60,000 flats to accommodate a planned population of about 173,000. With these figures, it seemed that some 2.88 persons, on average, would be accommodated within each residential unit. He cast doubt on the assumption and queried what had been assumed in deriving those figures;

- (e) the planning assumptions adopted in the NENT NDAs might have implications for the provision of GIC facilities, such as school places, hospital beds and open space in the NDAs. The adequacy of GIC facilities in the NDAs would hinge on the accuracy of these planning assumptions;

Fairness of Compensation Policy

- (f) farmers were practising agricultural activities on-site. It was incorrect for the Government to compensate the farmers solely based on the number of vegetation grown on the field at a spot time without taking into account the fact that it would affect the farmers' livelihood if the land was resumed;

Village Re-site

- (g) it was also mentioned in the summary of major grounds/proposals of representations of Group 4 that two sites in KTN Planning Area 24 and FLN Planning Area 15 were reserved for local rehousing of eligible clearances affected by the NENT NDAs, which would include provision of infrastructure to help support the reprovisioned villagers. He was concerned that by doing so, the rural environment would be disturbed and that might affect the farming activities of the affected farmers/villagers; and

Relocation of Government Departments to NDAs

- (h) the Government should take the lead to relocate some of its offices to the NENT NDAs to bring about economic vibrancy and attract the business

sector to move there.

[Actual speaking time: 10 minutes]

15. As the representers and representers' representatives had completed their presentation, the Chairman invited questions from Members.

16. The Chairman asked DPO/FS&YLE to explain the arrangement for agricultural and village re-site. In response, Ms Maggie M.Y. Chin, DPO/FS&YLE, said that in terms of agricultural re-site, the Government would help those affected by the NDAs project who wished to continue agricultural activities to identify suitable site for relocation. Also, affected farmers could apply for Short Term Waiver with the Lands Department so as to allow them to build on-farm domestic structures that were necessary for agricultural activities. In terms of village re-site, eligible indigenous villagers could apply to build New Territories Exempted Houses within the designated "Village Type Development" zones in the NENT NDAs.

17. Referring to the oral presentation made by Mr Lee Chun Leung, the Chairman asked what the rationale behind the planning assumption of "three persons per flat" was. In view of the planned population, whether there would be sufficient GIC facilities provided for the NENT NDAs. In response, Ms Chin said that one of the planning and development objectives of the NENT NDAs was to provide residential units to meet the medium to long-term housing needs. With the aim to achieve a balanced development in the NDAs, sufficient social and community facilities were planned for the future NDAs and in accordance with the requirements of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines. Adopting 2.97 to 3.2 persons per household was based on the assumptions adopted by other planning studies conducted in the past. The estimated figure helped determine the amount of social and community facilities such as hospital beds and school places needed to serve the future NDA residents. On that basis, the land required for the development of these facilities were identified and reserved on the two OZPs accordingly.

18. Ms Chin further said that the concern raised by Mr Lee on the possible impact of the NENT NDAs on the RCHEs at DCG was noted. The Government would continue to liaise with the stakeholders in relation to the reprovisioning of the existing elderly

homes at DCG. Land adjacent to the existing elderly home had already been reserved for the development of a new elderly home and the NDA programme would progress in phases so as to ensure that a smooth transfer of the elderly homes could be implemented. The first phase of demolition would now be commenced in 2018 with the remaining phase be postponed to 2023 so as to tally with the population in-take of the purpose-built elderly homes complex in KTN.

19. In response to the Chairman's enquiry on relocating government departments to NENT NDAs, Ms Chin said that some 58 ha of land in FLN and KTN NDAs were reserved for GIC uses. Those areas were primarily for Government or other community uses such as schools and community facilities.

20. A Member asked how many farmers were there within the area bounded by the NENT NDAs. In reply, Ms Chin said that according to the 2011 Census, there was a total of some 4,000 farmers/fishermen in the territory. Within the boundaries of NDAs, there were about 65 persons claiming themselves to be farm workers/fishermen.

[Mr Roger K.H. Luk left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

21. Another Member noted that many representers had expressed the views that farmers/villagers in the NENT NDAs did not want to move away and asked whether the Government had any information on this aspect. In response, Ms Chin said that according to the NENT Study conducted between 2009 and 2011, there would be almost 400 households in FLN involving 1,250 local residents, and 600 households in KTN involving 2,500 local residents, affected by the NDAs. Although the Government did not have an exact figure in relation to the number of local people that already indicated their reluctance to be relocated, she did receive two phone calls from two local elderly residents who indicated their wishes for relocation. On the other hand, there were voices from the representers and representers' representation in the past hearing sessions indicating their reluctance to be relocated.

[Mr Roger K.H. Luk returned to join the meeting at this point.]

22. Ms Chin continued to say that regarding the potential loss of the existing social

network, it should be noted that more than half of the population in Hong Kong were now living in new towns where their social network were established. Based on the successful new town model in the past, an extra step had been taken in the planning of the NENT NDAs to include new vision such as rural-urban integration, where 95 ha of land in the NDAs were designated for agricultural uses including the Long Valley Nature Park.

23. Ms Chin went on to say that on the issues of land resumption and compensation, there were sites reserved for relocation where eligible villagers could apply to move into the new housing units. In terms of providing sufficient and adequate social facilities in NENT NDAs, there were social workers teams working in the area to gather opinions from villagers. Their work helped the Government better understand local residents' needs and determine the kinds of social facility to be provided in the future NDAs.

[Mr F.C. Chan left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

24. Mr Ng Cheuk Hang said that it was difficult to quantify the number of villagers/farmers who would like to be relocated or not as details of the compensation scheme and rehousing arrangement had yet to be announced by the Government. Besides, many of the old villagers currently residing in the area did not want to leave the existing community as they had lived there for a long time. Mr Ng suggested that Members and Government officials should visit the affected villages if they wanted to have a better understanding of the situation.

25. As all the representers and representers' representatives attending the meeting had completed their presentations and Members had no further question to raise, the Chairman thanked the representers, representers' representatives and the PlanD's representatives for attending the meeting. They left the meeting at this point.

26. The meeting was adjourned at 10:40 a.m.