

1. The meeting was resumed at 9:00 a.m. on 27.1.2015.
2. The following members and the Secretary were present at the resumed meeting:

Mr Thomas T.M. Chow

Chairman

Mr Stanley Y.F. Wong

Vice-chairman

Mr Roger K.H. Luk

Professor S.C. Wong

Professor P.P. Ho

Professor Eddie C.M. Hui

Dr W.K. Yau

Ms Bonnie J.Y. Chan

Professor K.C. Chau

Mr H.W. Cheung

Dr Wilton W.T. Fok

Mr Ivan C.S. Fu

Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang

Mr Dominic K.K. Lam

Ms Christina M. Lee

Mr F.C. Chan

Mr Peter K.T. Yuen

Deputy Director of Lands (General)

Mr Jeff Y.T. Lam

Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department

Mr Martin W.C. Kwan

Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Metro Assessment),  
Environmental Protection Department

Mr Ken Y.K. Wong

Director of Planning  
Mr K.K. Ling

Presentation and Question Sessions

[Open Meeting]

3. The Chairman said that as no commenters had turned up at 9:00a.m., the meeting would be adjourned until the next commenter arrived.

4. The meeting was resumed at 9:40 a.m.

5. The following representatives of the Planning Department (PlanD) and commenters' representative were invited to the meeting at this point:

Ms Maggie M.Y. Chin - District Planning Officer/Fanling, Sheung Shui and Yuen Long East (DPO/FS&YLE), PlanD

Mr Otto K.C. Chan - Senior Town Planner/Fanling, Sheung Shui 1, PlanD

Mr Kevin C.P. Ng - Senior Town Planner/Fanling Sheung Shui 2, PlanD

FLN-C3375, KTN-C3375 - Mok Wing See, Vinci

Ms Mok Wing See, Vinci - Commenter

FLN-C3260, KTN-C3260 - Lui Ping Man

Ms Choi Hoi Ling (東北城規組) - Commenter's representative

6. The Chairman extended a welcome and explained the procedure of the hearing. He said that the meeting would be conducted in accordance with the "Guidance Notes on Attending the Meeting for Consideration of the Representations and Comments in respect of the Draft Fanling North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/FLN/1 and the Draft Kwu Tung

North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/KTN/1” (Guidance Notes), which had been provided to all representers/commenters prior to the meeting. In particular, he highlighted the following main points:

- (a) in view of the large number of representations and comments received and more than 3,400 representers/commenters had indicated to the Town Planning Board (the Board) that they would either attend in person or send an authorised representative to make oral submission, it was necessary to limit the time for each oral submission;
- (b) each representer/commenter would be allotted a total of 10-minute speaking time. However, to provide flexibility to representers/commenters to suit their situations, there were arrangements to allow cumulative speaking time for authorised representatives, swapping of allotted time with other representers/commenters and requesting an extension of time for making the oral submissions;
- (c) the oral submissions should be confined to the grounds of representation/comment in the written representations/comments already submitted to the Town Planning Board (the Board) during the exhibition period of the respective Outline Zoning Plans (OZPs) or the publication period of the representations;
- (d) to ensure a smooth and efficient conduct of the meeting, the Chairman might request the representer/commenter not to repeat unnecessarily long the same points which had already been presented by others at the same meeting. Representers/commenters should avoid reading out or repeating statements contained in the written representations/comments already submitted, as the written submissions had already been provided to Members for their consideration.

7. The Chairman said that each presentation, except with time extension allowed, should be within 10 minutes and there was a timer device to alert the

representers/commenters and their representatives 2 minutes before the allotted time was to expire and when the allotted time limit was up.

8. The Chairman said that the proceedings of the hearing would be broadcast online. The Chairman said that the video recording of the presentation made by the representative of PlanD on the first day of the Group 4 hearing (i.e. 13.10.2014) had been uploaded to the Board's website for the meeting and would not be repeated at the meeting, which was in accordance with the Guidance Notes. He would first invite the commenters/authorized representatives to make their oral submissions, following the reference number of each commenter who had registered with the Board's Secretariat on the day. After all registered attendees had completed their oral submissions, there would be a question and answer (Q&A) session at which Members could direct enquiries to any attendee(s) of the meeting.

9. The Chairman then invited the commenter and commenter's representative to elaborate on their comments.

FLN-R3375, KTN-R3375 - Mok Wing See, Vinci

10. Ms Mok Wing See, Vinci made the following main points:

- (a) even though Hong Kong was an international metropolis, there was not enough attention on its food self-sufficiency ratio. Even for many developed areas like Korea and Taiwan, they had their own policy to preserve their farmland to avoid their food market from being monopolized by other countries. Even Dongguan Province in the Mainland had started to preserve their farmland. Hong Kong did not seem to have any sense of crisis at all;
- (b) the resumption of land for the Northeast New Territories New Development Areas (NENT NDAs) would only benefit big corporations or consortium. Many farms in Ping Che and Ma Shi Po were very well developed with good promotion networks for Hong Kong people to know more about our local farming. The Government should

seriously consider using the Fanling Golf Course site and other vacant land like vacant schools so as to minimize the extent of land resumption. There were a number of well-established sawmills, soy sauce factories and orchards in Kwun Tung village with very long history which should be supported by the Government rather than to be cleared; and

- (c) many areas were left vacant for many years in the urban areas, e.g. Tai Hom Tsuen was cleared and left vacant for a long time and there were abandoned schools and ball courts in Mid-level. Moreover, the coverage of our Country Parks was very extensive but their utilization rate was low. The Government should seriously consider using these areas rather than resumption of agricultural land in the NENT NDAs.

[Actual speaking time : 4 minutes]

FLN-R3260, KTN-R3260 - Lui Ping Man

11. Ms Choi Hoi Ling made the following main points:

- (a) reference was made to an article titled “The Myth of Green Projects” written by Dr Man Sze Wai;
- (b) the concepts of “sustainable development”, “environmental protection” and “green city” had in fact become tools for profit-making by developers. There was a lack of consistent policy for recycling of wastes. Developers would only build deluxe housing estates with environmental-friendly facilities inside the estates without any care about the pollution of the development caused to the surrounding areas;
- (c) the resumption of existing villages for building “green” New Town such as the Hung Shui Kiu NDA was in fact a disrespect for the under-privileged as there was no sharing at all. The concept of environmental protection carried the meaning of “commodification” as directed by the developers;

- (d) the “commodification” of environmental projects was in fact done by both the Government and developers, e.g. the concept of pedestrian streets was mainly for boosting consumption rather than creating a public space as those done in the U.K.;
- (e) “green” projects including sustainable development and “green” city would only be a deceiving concept if it did not take care of the people’s needs. Many of the environmental improvement and urban renewal projects were segregating, stigmatising and pushing against those under-privileged groups, unlike those projects in Finland and the USA which were mainly for improving the livelihood of the minorities and integrating better the high and low income groups; and
- (f) as a contrast to the Hong Kong’s segregating/alienating style of “green” projects, various organisations were set up by farms for protecting the biodiversity of animals and plants. Those organisations understood that local farming was a good partner of biodiversity of animals and plant. It also provided an opportunity for urban dwellers to explore ways to achieve self-sufficiency and to reduce the adverse impacts of mass production by large consortium in using chemical pesticides and growing products of genetically modified species.
- (g) she was now living in Tai Kong Po which was seriously disturbed by the Express Rail Project. Because of the Express Rail Project, the well was polluted and oil stains were found in the water. Some people would like to live in urban areas and others would like to live in rural areas. The Government should not develop all the rural areas as urban developments; and
- (h) there was no choice for Hong Kong people to choose as the Government considered that urban development was necessary. Though land resources were limited in Hong Kong, some rural areas were left idle as the owners were speculating for developments and

refused to rent the land to farmers. Unlimited developments were not good for the next generation. Attention should not be given only to money and GDP, while ignoring the need for our physical body, the nature and human relationship. That would not be sustainable.

[Actual speaking time : 10 minutes]

12. As the commenter and commenter's representative had finished their presentations, the Chairman invited questions from Members.

13. A Member enquired whether the food self-sufficiency ratio as quoted by Ms Mok Wing See, Vinci was from the perspective of a country, a region or a city level. In response, Ms Mok said that it was necessary to care about the food self-sufficiency ratio from all those three levels. As in the last example she quoted, the Dongguan Province was well aware of the need to have a balanced development and they had a better sense of crisis than Hong Kong. She questioned why Hong Kong only paid attention to technology and flat production and did not consider seriously the food self-sufficiency ratio. For Japan, although it was a very well-developed country, they were aware of the need for a balance between the urban and rural developments. Hong Kong should make the best use of its vacant land and also those with low utilization rate before resumption of the agricultural land. Even though the risk of being manipulated by other countries was relatively low, Hong Kong still needed to consider its food self-sufficiency ratio. Korea was a good example, as they had paid great importance to their agricultural development in parallel with their economic development.

14. In response to Ms Mok's presentation, Mr K.K. Ling, Director of Planning said that there was already a development plan of Tai Hom Tsuen for provision of public housing flats.

15. In response to a Member's enquiry, Ms Mok said that Tai Hom Tsuen had been vacant for a long time and there were a lot of vacant land in the urban areas, e.g. in Mid-level, To Kwa Wan and the Western District which were not readily accessible to the public. The Country Parks covered very extensive areas and some areas were not even known to the public. As such, parts of the Country Parks could be used for development.

The Government should seriously consider using the vacant land instead of clearing those villages and well-established farms. Some of the villages in NENT had been there for generations and formed part of the history of Hong Kong. They should not be destroyed just for the sake of money, which was very short-sighted. There should be a balanced development.

16. As the commenter/commenter's representative attending the session had completed their presentations and Members had no further question to raise, the Chairman thanked the commenter, the commenter's representative and the Government representatives for attending the meeting. They all left the meeting at this point.

17. The Chairman said that the meeting was adjourned and would resume at 9:00 a.m. on 28.1.2015.

18. The meeting was adjourned at 10:10 a.m.