

**Minutes of 1077<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the  
Town Planning Board held on 28.4.2015**

**Present**

Permanent Secretary for Development  
(Planning and Lands)  
Mr Thomas T.M. Chow

Chairman

Mr Stanley Y.F. Wong

Vice-chairman

Mr Roger K.H. Luk

Professor S.C. Wong

Professor P.P. Ho

Professor Eddie C.M. Hui

Dr C.P. Lau

Ms Anita W.T. Ma

Dr W.K. Yau

Professor K.C. Chau

Mr Ivan C.S. Fu

Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang

Ms Janice W.M. Lai

Mr Dominic K.K. Lam

Ms Christina M. Lee

Mr F.C. Chan

Mr David Y.T. Lui

Mr Peter K.T. Yuen

Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport) 3,  
Transport and Housing Bureau  
Miss Winnie M.W. Wong

Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (1)  
Mr C.W. Tse

Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department  
Mr Martin W.C. Kwan

Director of Lands  
Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn

Director of Planning  
Mr K.K. Ling

Deputy Director of Planning/District  
Mr Raymond K.W. Lee

Secretary

**Absent with Apologies**

Ms Julia M.K. Lau

Mr Clarence W.C. Leung

Mr Laurence L.J. Li

Ms Bonnie J.Y. Chan

Mr H.W. Cheung

Dr Wilton W.T. Fok

Mr Sunny L.K. Ho

Mr Patrick H. T. Lau

Mr H. F. Leung

Mr Stephen H.B. Yau

Mr Frankie W.C. Yeung

Mr Philip S.L. Kan

Dr Lawrence W.C. Poon

**In Attendance**

Assistant Director of Planning/Board  
Ms Fiona S.Y. Lung

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board  
Mr Louis K.H. Kau

Senior Town Planner/Town Planning Board  
Ms Doris S.Y. Ting

**Agenda Item 1**

[Open Meeting]

**Matters Arising**

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese]

1. There was no matter arising for the meeting.

**Fanling, Sheung Shui and Yuen Long East District**

**Sha Tin, Tai Po and North District**

**Agenda Item 2**

[Closed Meeting]

Consideration of Representations in respect of the  
Draft Fanling/Sheung Shui Outline Zoning Plan No. S/FSS/19,  
Draft Fu Tei Au and Sha Ling Outline Zoning Plan No. S/NE-FTA/13,  
Draft Hung Lung Hang Outline Zoning Plan No. S/NE-HLH/8 and  
Draft Ma Tso Lung and Hoo Hok Wai Outline Zoning Plan No. S/NE-MTL/2  
(TPB Paper No. 9819)

---

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese]

**Deliberation Session**

2. As the main amendments to the draft Fanling/Sheung Shui (FSS) Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/FSS/19, draft Fu Tei Au and Sha Ling (FTA) OZP No. S/NE-FTA/13, draft Hung Lung Hang (HLH) OZP No. S/NE-HLH/8 and draft Ma Tso Lung and Hoo Hok Wai (MTL) OZP No. S/NE-MTL/2 were to excise the areas for incorporation into the Fanling North (FLN) OZP and the Kwu Tung North (KTN) OZP, the following Members had declared interests on this item:

Ms Julia M.K. Lau - being a representer and a commenter in respect of FLN OZP (FLN-R13 and FLN-C6009)

Mr Patrick H.T. Lau - his company was involved in the submission of proposals for a consultancy study on the Development of KTN and FLN New Development Areas (NDAs), Phase 1 – Design and Construction

3. The interests of Ms Julia M.K. Lau and Mr Patrick H.T. Lau in respect of the KLN and FLN OZPs were considered direct. Members noted that Ms Julia M.K. Lau had not been invited to attend the meeting in her capacity as a Member and Mr Patrick H.T. Lau had tendered apology for not attending the meeting.

4. The Chairman said that a total of 13 representations for the four OZPs were received (six for draft FSS OZP; two for draft FTA OZP; two for draft HLH OZP and three for draft MTL OZP). Those representations were heard collectively by Town Planning Board (the Board) on 9.1.2015. After completion of the hearing, Members considered that it might be more prudent to defer the decisions on those representations until the hearing of the representations and comments in respect of the FLN and KTN OZPs had also been completed. The decisions on the representations to the four OZPs were therefore deferred.

5. The video recording of the hearing session on 9.1.2015 had been provided to Members for reference prior to the deliberation session, and the draft minutes of the hearing session of the four OZPs had been confirmed at the Board's meeting on 23.1.2015. The Chairman asked Members to consider the representations taking into account the written representations and the oral submissions made at that meeting.

6. The Chairman recapitulated that the representers had made the following major points in their written and oral submissions:

Supporting Representation

- (a) R1 of FSS OZP supported all the amendment items for the draft FSS OZP No. S/FSS/19;

Adverse Representations

- (b) the proposed development was only for building a place for parallel trading (R2 of FSS OZP);
- (c) opposed the North East New Territories (NENT) development plan as it would spoil the rural environment and destroy the homes of villagers and agricultural land. The development would only benefit property developers. NENT was a natural buffer between Hong Kong and the Mainland, and should be preserved (R3 of FSS OZP);
- (d) objected to the ‘clean slate’ planning approach for developing the NENT New Development Areas (NDAs) as the existing community and developments would be totally removed and replaced by new buildings. The NENT NDAs development plan had not respected the existing socio-economic fabric. This could lead to another failure similar to the Tin Shui Wai New Town. The NDAs development plan should be withdrawn, and the planning and consultation of the NDAs development should be restarted (R4 of FSS OZP);

[Dr C.P. Lau and Professor K.C. Chau arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

- (e) the 447 ha of agricultural land within the planning scheme area of KTN should be retained instead of resumed for the NDAs development (R5 of FSS OZP, R1 of FTA OZP, R2 of MTL OZP and R1 of HLH OZP);
- (f) there was a large amount of vacant land in other areas to cater for the housing needs of the community. The Government should reconfirm the economic value of agriculture to the society and should not destroy

agricultural land and the existing rural areas. Agricultural land and village areas should be retained with a view to designating the planning scheme area as a base for ‘urban-rural interactive organic farm’ in Hong Kong (R6 of FSS OZP, R2 of FTA OZP, R3 of MTL OZP and R2 of HLH OZP);

- (g) in designing the public transport interchange, the Government had over-estimated the traffic demand, in particular the traffic demand between the Mainland and Hong Kong (R6 of FSS OZP, R2 of FTA OZP, R3 of MTL OZP and R2 of HLH OZP);
- (h) the NDAs had failed to consider the ecological and agricultural concerns in full (R1 of MTL OZP);

[Dr W.K. Yau, Ms Janice W.M. Lai and Mr Ivan C.S. Fu arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

#### Proposals

- (i) to take away the section of the road linking Lok Ma Chau Eastern Connection Road to preserve the Ma Tso Lung stream and the wetland in Hoo Hok Wai (R1 of MTL OZP); and
- (j) to zone the entire Ma Tso Lung stream and its riparian zone as conservation zonings such as “Conservation Area” and “Green Belt”, and to relocate various land uses to adjacent areas, such as brownfield sites in the KTN NDA (R1 of MTL OZP).

7. Members then went through the following responses given during Planning Department (PlanD)’s presentation at the hearing, and/or recorded in the Paper:

- (a) the supporting representation of R1 of FSS OZP was noted;

- (b) R2 of FSS OZP had not provided any justification in support of the claim that the purpose of the draft FSS OZP was to provide a place for parallel trading. The representation was not related to any of the amendment items of the draft FSS OZP which mainly involved adjustments to the planning scheme boundary and the rezoning of two small areas to reflect the existing land uses;
- (c) the grounds of objection of R3 to R6 of FSS OZP were not related to the amendment items of the draft FSS OZP;
- (d) the grounds of objection of R1 and R2 of FTA OZP were not related to the amendment items of the draft FTA OZP;
- (e) the grounds of objection of R1 and R2 of HLH OZP were not related to the amendment items of the draft HLH OZP;
- (f) the grounds of objection of R1 to R3 of MTL OZP were not related to the amendment items of the draft MTL OZP;

#### Proposals

- (g) R1 of MTL OZP's proposals were not related to any of the amendment items of the draft MTL OZP, which only involved adjustments of its planning scheme boundary. As the upper/middle sections of Ma Tso Lung stream fell within the KTN OZP, the representers' proposal would be considered by the Board separately when considering the representations to the KTN OZP. As for the lower section of Ma Tso Lung stream which fell within the "Agriculture" zone under the draft MTL OZP No. S/NE-MTL/2, its zoning had remained unchanged as on the previous draft MTL OZP No. S/NE-MTL/1.

8. Members agreed that the grounds of objections raised by the representers were not related to any of the amendments items of the four OZPs which mainly involved



adjustments of planning scheme boundary to tally with those of the KTN and FLN OZPs. The specific proposal relating to Ma Tso Lung stream which fell within the boundary of the KTN OZP would be considered by the Board under the KTN OZP separately.

9. After deliberation, Members noted the support of R1 of FSS OZP for all the amendments for the draft FSS OZP and decided not to uphold the adverse representations of R2 to R6 of FSS OZP, R1 and R2 of FTA OZP, R1 and R2 of HLH OZP and R1 to R3 of MTL OZP and considered that the four OZPs, namely FSS OZP, FTA OZP, HLH OZP and MTL OZP, should not be amended. Members then went through the reasons for not upholding the representations in paragraph 7.2 of the Paper and considered that they should be suitably amended. The reasons were:

R2 to R6 of FSS OZP

“ the representations are not related to any proposed amendments for the draft Fanling/Sheung Shui Outline Zoning Plan No. S/FSS/19.”

R1 and R2 of FTA OZP

“ the representations are not related to the excision of southern part from the planning scheme area of Fu Tei Au and Sha Ling Outline Zoning Plan for incorporation into the draft Fanling North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/FLN/1.”

R1 and R2 of HLH OZP

“ the representations are not related to the excision of a section of Ng Tung River (River Indus) and two pieces of land to the north and south of Ng Tung River (River Indus) from the planning scheme area of Hung Lung Hang Outline Zoning Plan for incorporation into the draft Fanling North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/FLN/1.”

R1 to R3 of MTL OZP

“ the representations are not related to the excision of southern part from the planning scheme area of Ma Tso Lung and Hoo Hok Wai Outline Zoning Plan for incorporation into the draft Kwu Tung North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/KTN/1 and the amendments to the Notes.”

**Agenda Item 3**

[Open Meeting]

Any Other Business

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese]

10. There being no other business, the meeting was closed at 9:20 a.m..