

**Minutes of 898th Meeting of the
Town Planning Board held on 26.10.2007**

Present

Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)
Mr. Raymond Young

Chairman

Mr. Michael K.C. Lai

Dr. Greg C.Y. Wong

Ms. Carmen K.M. Chan

Professor Nora F.Y. Tam

Mr. Nelson W.Y. Chan

Mr. David W.M. Chan

Mr. Leslie H.C. Chen

Professor Peter R. Hills

Mr. Tony C.N. Kan

Mr. Edmund K.H. Leung

Professor Bernard V.W.F. Lim

Dr. C.N. Ng

Dr. Daniel B.M. To

Mr. Alfred Donald Yap

Mr. Walter K.L. Chan

Mr. Felix W. Fong

Ms. Anna S.Y. Kwong

Dr. James C.W. Lau

Ms. Starry W.K. Lee

Mr. K.Y. Leung

Director of Planning
Miss Ophelia Y.S. Wong

Director of Environmental Protection
Ms. Anissa Wong

Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport)
Transport and Housing Bureau
Ms. Ava Chiu

Director of Lands
Miss Annie Tam

Deputy Director of Planning/District
Mr. Augustine W.K. Ng

Secretary

Absent with Apologies

Dr. Peter K.K. Wong

Dr. Lily Chiang

Professor David Dudgeon

Professor N.K. Leung

Mr. Stanley Y.F. Wong

Ms. Sylvia S.F. Yau

Mr. B.W. Chan

Ms. Maggie M.K. Chan

Mr. Raymond Y.M. Chan

Mr. Y.K. Cheng

Professor Paul K.S. Lam

Assistant Director(2), Home Affairs Department
Ms. Margaret Hsia

In Attendance

Assistant Director of Planning/Board
Mr. S. Lau

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Ms. Brenda K.Y. Au

Senior Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Mr. W.S. Lau

Agenda Item 1

[Open Meeting]

Confirmation of Minutes of the 896th and 897th Meetings held on 5.10.2007 and 12.10.2007

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

1. The minutes of the 896th and 897th Meetings held on 5.10.2007 and 12.10.2007 were confirmed without amendments.

Agenda Item 2

[Open Meeting]

Matters Arising

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

- (i) Approval of Outline Zoning Plan (OZP)/Development Scheme Plans (DSPs)

2. The Secretary reported that on 2.10.2007, the Chief Executive in Council (CE in C) approved the following three plans under section 9(1)(a) of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance):

- (i) Urban Renewal Authority (URA) Stone Nullah Lane/Hing Wan Street/King Sing Street DSP (re-numbered as S/H5/URA2/2)
- (ii) URA Staunton Street/Wing Lee Street DSP (re-numbered as S/H3/URA1/2)
- (iii) Jardine's Lookout & Wong Nai Chung Gap OZP (re-numbered as S/H13/12)

The approval of the DSPs /OZP was notified in the Gazette on 18.10.2007.

[Mr. Michael K.C. Lai arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

(ii) Reference of OZPs

3. The Secretary reported that on 2.10.2007, the CE in C referred the following three approved OZPs back to the Board for amendment under section 12(1)(b)(ii) of the Ordinance:

- (i) Tsing Yi OZP No. S/TY/22
- (ii) Ha Tsuen OZP No. S/YL-HT/8
- (iii) Kennedy Town & Mount Davis OZP No. S/H1/14

The reference back of the approved OZPs for amendment was notified in the Gazette on 18.10.2007.

(iii) Abandonment of Town Planning Appeal

Town Planning Appeal No. 12 of 2006 (12/06)

Temporary Container Tractor/Trailer Park and Open Storage
of Building Materials for a Period of 12 Months
in “Other Specified Uses” annotated

“Comprehensive Development to include Wetland Restoration Area” zone,
Lot 769(Part) in DD 99, San Tin, Yuen Long

(Application No. A/YL-ST/298)

4. The Secretary reported that the subject appeal was against the decision of the Board on 26.5.2006 to reject on review an application (No. A/YL-ST/298) for temporary container tractor/trailer park and open storage of building materials for a period of 12 months at a site zoned “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Comprehensive Development to include Wetland Restoration Area” on the draft San Tin Outline Zoning Plan No. S/YL-ST/7. On 21.9.2007, the appeal was abandoned by the Appellant of his own accord. The abandonment was confirmed by the Town Planning Appeal Board (TPAB) on 12.10.2007 in accordance with Regulation 7(1) of the Town Planning (Appeals) Regulations.

(iv) Appeal Statistics

5. The Secretary reported that as at 26.10.2007, 13 cases were yet to be heard by the TPAB. Details of the appeal statistics are as follows:

Allowed	:	20
Dismissed	:	103
Abandoned/Withdrawn/Invalid	:	125
Yet to be Heard	:	13
Decision Outstanding	:	6
<hr/>		
Total	:	267

Agenda Item 3

[Open Meeting]

Hong Kong 2030 : Planning Vision and Strategy (HK2030 Study) Final Report
(TPB Paper No. 7934)

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese and English.]

6. The following representatives from the Planning Department (PlanD) were invited to the meeting:

Mr. Alfred Y.K. Lau - Chief Town Planner/Strategic Planning
Ms. Amy Y.M. Cheung - Senior Town Planner/ Strategic Planning

7. The Chairman extended a welcome and invited Mr. Alfred Y.K. Lau to brief Members on the Paper.

[Mr. Nelson W.Y. Chan, Ms. Anna S.Y. Kwong and Dr. C.N. Ng arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

Presentation Session

8. Mr. Alfred Y.K. Lau introduced the background of the Study. With the aid

of a Powerpoint presentation, Ms. Amy Y.M. Cheung presented the findings of the Study and made the following main points:

Study Purpose and Process

- (a) the Study was a review of the Territorial Development Strategy which provided a strategic framework to guide land development and infrastructure in the next 20 to 30 years;
- (b) the Study was conducted in four stages and the public were consulted at every key stage of the Study. Various impact assessments were conducted in the study process to ascertain the sustainability of the proposed strategy;
- (c) a panel of non-governmental expert advisors had also been set up to advise on the Study and to foster a partnership approach between Government and external sectors;

Areas of Concern

- (d) the Study had identified four areas of concern, namely aspirations for a quality living environment, closer ties with the Mainland, changing economy and dynamic demographic trends;
- (e) on demographic trends, the Study estimated that:
 - (i) the population growth would slow down. Over the next 30 years, it was estimated that the population would increase at the rate of about 0.5million per decade, as opposed to the rate of about one million per decade in the latter half of the last century;
 - (ii) the household size would decrease from 3.1 persons per household in 2001 to 2.6 persons per household by 2031;
 - (iii) cross-boundary passenger movements between Hong Kong and

the Mainland had increased from 60 million in 1995 to 160 million in 2006;

(iv) the number of mobile population would increase from about 0.2 million in 2001 to about 0.4 million in 2031; and

(v) the proportion of persons aged 65 or above would rise from the current 12% to 26% in 2036;

(f) on the changing economy, Hong Kong's dependence on the service sector had increased. In 1980, the service sector accounted for 73% of the gross domestic product (GDP), and the percentage had increased to 91% in 2005. To sustain our economic growth, about 4 million jobs would be required in 2030 but because of the ageing population, the workforce would shrink to about 3.3 million;

[Professor Bernard V.W.F. Lim arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

Study Assumptions

(g) the Study assumed that the inadequate workforce would mainly be mitigated by a number of factors, for example, more females entering the job market, the raising of the retirement age, or the import of workers;

(h) the Study also made the following assumptions in 2030: a population of 8.4 million, a working population of 3.9 million, availability of 4 million jobs, annual GDP growth of 3% as well as a cumulative housing requirement of 0.924 million units and cumulative prime office requirement of 2.7 million m² on top of the level of provision in the base year of 2003;

[Dr. Greg C.Y. Wong left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

Recommended Strategy

- (i) a new approach of promoting more sustainable growth, stressing the preference for optimizing brownfield sites over opening up greenfield land, and focusing on improving quality was adopted in the Study;
- (j) the recommended strategy focused on the following 3 broad directions to help Hong Kong achieve its vision as “Asia’s World City”:
 - (i) providing a quality living environment;
 - (ii) enhancing economic competitiveness; and
 - (iii) strengthening links with the Mainland;

Concepts for Spatial Development Pattern

- (k) the concepts included:
 - (i) do more with less - to explore development opportunities in the Metro Area and existing new towns;
 - (ii) rail-based pattern – to optimize development opportunities along three railway axes (northern development axis, central development axis and southern development axis);
 - (iii) balance development and conservation – to preserve as much countryside as possible; and
 - (iv) connect on all fronts – to further develop regional transport networks;

Development Densities

- (l) 70% of the additional population would be accommodated in the existing built-up areas (including new towns) and the other 30%

would be in the new development areas and the rural parts of the New Territories (N.T.). The proportion of population in the Metro Area and N.T. would change from the current ratio of 60:40 to 55:45;

- (m) the urbanized area would increase slightly from the current 20% to 22% of total land area in 2030 and the land area of Country Parks would also increase from 44% to about 46%;
- (n) the prevalent development intensities in the main urban areas would be broadly retained. Individual locations in the congested areas and at harbourfront would be reviewed for lower development intensity;

New Development Areas (NDAs)

- (o) two new NDAs, one at Kwu Tung North, Fanling North and Ping Che/Ta Kwu Ling (the Three-in-One Scheme) and the other at Hung Shui Kiu, each to accommodate 100,000 to 200,000 population were proposed;
- (p) other than housing land, the NDAs could also serve to meet other special land use requirements. Infrastructure and community facilities would be provided flexibly to meet local needs;

Rural Rehabilitation

- (q) the rural problems could not be completely resolved by the NDAs or through upzoning. The Study recommended a rehabilitation approach by introducing such beneficial uses as ecotourism and organic farming to these areas;

[Dr. Greg C.Y. Wong returned to join the meeting at this point.]

Area Improvement Plans

- (r) further schemes on area improvement should be carried out to improve

the pedestrian environment, micro-climate, greening, the setting for heritage buildings as well as to revitalize degenerated districts and to enhance the local economy;

Prime Offices

- (s) the future prime office demand was estimated to be about 0.1 million m² per year. The strategy for prime office development was to identify new sites at the existing Central Business District (CBD) (including undeveloped sites at West Kowloon and sites currently occupied by government uses) and to plan for office nodes outside the CBD (by strengthening the existing Quarry Bay cluster through rezoning and area improvement and reserving land at Kai Tak for longer term development);

[Mr. Tony C.N. Kan left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

Cross-boundary Infrastructure and Development in the Frontier Closed Area

- (t) to strengthen our ties with the Mainland, there was a need to speed up the development of our cross-boundary infrastructure. The HK-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge was proposed for construction and an additional link with a new control point at Liantiang/Heung Yuen Wai was under study. Apart from the HK Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-HK Express Rail Link now under planning, two possible rail links at the west were also proposed for the longer term;
- (u) development in the boundary areas could also help to strengthen our links with the Mainland, especially Shenzhen. Studies were being conducted on the Lok Ma Chau Loop and the use of land to be released by the reduction of the Frontier Closed Area;

Impact Assessments

- (v) various impact assessments (environmental, economic/financial, land

use planning, social and transport) had been conducted. The sustainability of the recommended proposals in the Study was confirmed with identified issues, such as more people would be exposed to excessive traffic noise in the longer term, flagged up for attention at later planning stages;

Response Mechanism

- (w) the proposed response mechanism provided guidance on how to adjust the development framework and amend the implementation programme in response to unexpected circumstances. There would be different response measures under the “low population growth and moderate economic growth” and “high population growth and high economic growth” scenarios. The development strategy would be monitored and reviewed, and public dialogue would be maintained in the process;

[Mr. Tony C.N. Kan returned to join the meeting at this point.]

Implementation

- (x) the Development Bureau had issued an Action Agenda outlining the implementation of ongoing and new initiatives under the Bureau in line with the Study’s directions. They included protection of heritage, implementation of area improvement and greening plans, implementation of NDAs, review of development densities, improvement of rural townships, identification of more sites for prime office and speeding up the planning and development of cross-boundary infrastructure and the boundary areas as detailed in Annex C of the Paper; and
- (y) PlanD would work with relevant bureaux/departments to follow up on other recommendations of the Study.

Discussion Session

9. The comments/questions raised by individual Members were summarized as follows:

General

- (a) the Study, which provided a strategic planning framework for the next 20 to 30 years, was welcomed and commended. The Study was comprehensive and had taken into account key issues on demographic and economic changes with various impact assessments and risk analysis conducted to ascertain the sustainability of the recommended strategy;
- (b) the recognition of our environmental capacity as constraint in the Study and the identification of “no-go” areas to protect our ecological and other natural resources as well as heritage was supported;
- (c) the Study should take into account some global environmental issues like climatic change, energy crisis and reduction of green house gas emissions in order to keep in pace with other countries;
- (d) despite additional investment, the domestic rail share in transport would be maintained at about 36%. The average travel distance and time of private cars would also rise slightly and the total journeys made by private cars would increase significantly to 34%. More thoughts should be given to increase the use of rail transport which was environmentally more friendly;
- (e) there was inadequate coverage on the problem of the ageing population. The implications of the problem would not be restricted to housing but would also affect medical, social, transport and other services. More elderly friendly facilities like lifts in railway stations should be provided. Various aspects of planning for the ageing population should start early;
- (f) as population assumptions were critically important, it was necessary to

make the population forecast and demographic structure data as correct as possible;

Development Densities

- (g) high density development was an efficient use of land resources and infrastructure, but could affect living quality if not properly planned. The proposed slight increase from 20% to 22% of the total land area for use as urban areas was a good balance between development and conservation;
- (h) noting that the percentage of land used for country parks and urban areas would increase from 44% to 46% and from 20% to 22% respectively, a Member queried where the additional land supply would come from;
- (i) microclimate was an important consideration in reviewing the development densities of individual areas and should be covered in greater detail in the Study Report. Those very congested areas, including public housing areas, should be gradually thinned out;

NDA's/New Towns

- (j) as population accommodated in the N.T. would increase from 40% to 45%, it was essential to learn from the lessons of Tung Chung and Tin Shui Wai New Towns and provide adequate and timely community facilities to the NDAs. The Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) should be applied flexibly in the provision of community facilities;
- (k) how to build up the social network was of paramount importance in the NDAs. The problem of Tin Shui Wai was due to the absence of an effective social network to provide support to the residents;
- (l) the public and private housing mix in the NDAs should be balanced.

The predominance of public housing as in the case of Tin Shui Wai should be avoided;

- (m) consideration should be given to create more job opportunities in the NDAs as well as the New Towns, and to provide affordable transport to facilitate the residents to work in the urban areas;
- (n) in developing the NDAs, a bolder approach should be adopted. The zoning concept should be reviewed, and residence and place of work could be co-located within the same zone in the form of mixed-use developments. New ideas on urban design including a gradual gradation of building heights should also be explored;

Rural Rehabilitation

- (o) there was much room for improvement in rural planning. At present, the rural areas were characterized by Small Houses and open storage yards;
- (p) the present situation of rural rehabilitation was not satisfactory. Suitable policy should be formulated to provide economic incentives for rehabilitation of spoilt areas like open storage areas;
- (q) much land in the N.T. was under the "Agriculture" zoning and quite a number of planning applications were rejected for not being in line with the planning intention. There might be a need to review the land use zoning;

Improvement of Old Areas

- (r) the proposal to revitalize degenerated urban areas through area improvement schemes, not only by the current demolition and redevelopment approach, was supported;
- (s) apart from revitalization, there should be policy and concrete measures

to improve the maintenance and redevelopment of old buildings in the old urban areas;

Planning of the Boundary Areas

- (t) the strengthening of cross-boundary links with the Mainland was fully supported;
- (u) a university town, similar to the one at Nanshan of Shenzhen, could be considered in boundary areas. It would promote academic interflow and enhance Hong Kong as a centre of education. The vacated campuses in the urban areas could be released for other needs;

Response Mechanism

- (v) it was not clear how some sudden changes like the possible influx of refugees would be handled;
- (w) between now and 2030, there could be a few economic cycles. How the development strategy would be affected and how we would respond should also be considered. It was important to ensure sufficient employment opportunities;

Implementation

- (x) the proposals should be translated into concrete measures with implementation timeframe and benchmarks for monitoring of progress. The Action Agenda issued by the Development Bureau focused on short to medium term actions. The TPB should be briefed on the progress of implementation at regular intervals;
- (y) apart from the Development Bureau, the Government should also consider how the proposals in the Study would affect other policy areas like transport;

- (z) implementation of the proposals would take time and there might be socio-economic changes in the process necessitating changes in the land use proposals or affecting the timely provision of supporting community facilities. Better coordination to respond to such changes was required;

Other Issues

- (aa) the Study set a good example of sustainable development for a congested city for reference of other Chinese cities. PlanD should liaise with the counterparts in the Mainland to share the experience;
- (bb) consideration should be given to include the Study into the curriculum of general education; and
- (cc) as many squatter areas were located on potentially hazardous slopes, consideration should be given to improve the environment of those squatter areas.

10. In response, Mr. Alfred Y.K. Lau and Ms. Amy Y.M. Cheung made the following main points:

General

- (a) global environmental issues had been considered in the course of the Study but had not been given too much coverage. A study on climatic change had recently been carried out by the new Environment Bureau and the environmental issues would be followed up more closely;
- (b) on sustainability of the transport system, Hong Kong had done very well by international standard. The domestic rail share of 36% in the transport system was very high. There would be more people using the rail system in terms of absolute numbers. It should also be noted that 90% of the trips made was by public transport;

- (c) the data on demographic projection and structure were mainly based on the information provided by the Census and Statistics Department, and relevant issues, such as the ageing population problem, had been duly considered in the Study;

Development Intensities

- (d) the increases in the percentage of land used for country parks and urban areas were accompanied by a corresponding reduction in agricultural land and other land not yet developed in the rural N.T.;
- (e) the progressive review of Outline Zoning Plans to reduce development intensities and the implementation of Greening Master Plans (GMPs) and Area Improvement Plans (AIPs) would also help to improve the microclimate in the congested urban areas;

NDA's/New Towns

- (f) in development of the NDAs, supporting community facilities and infrastructure would be provided flexibly and could be provided in tandem with population intake;
- (g) NDAs would unlikely be public housing-led. The proportion of private housing could be higher than public housing. The housing mix would be further examined in the planning study of the NDAs;

Rural Rehabilitation

- (h) there was room for further improvement on rural planning and rehabilitation. The matter was complicated as it involved several policy bureaux, as well as the interests of various stakeholders and land owners, such as port back-up operators. PlanD would consider further on the matter;

Improvement of Old Areas

- (i) the implementation of Area Improvement Plans and Greening Master Plans in the urban areas would improve the environment and townscape which could be a catalyst for revitalizing degenerated old areas and enhancing the local economy. While an improvement framework was provided, whether and how the old buildings would be redeveloped would be left to the market mechanism;

Response Mechanism

- (j) there were measures proposed to deal with unexpected circumstances. Sudden population changes (like possible increase in the mobility of “Mobile Residents” and out flow of population) and economic changes were two major possible areas of change, and were subject to monitoring and periodic reviews by PlanD;

Implementation

- (k) implementation of the recommendations of the Study which were under the purview of the Development Bureau was highlighted in the Action Agenda. These included heritage conservation, review of development densities, NDAs, the provision of prime office land, cross-boundary infrastructure and local area improvement. Depending on the nature of the initiatives, the implementation programmes varied. The recent restructuring of the policy bureaux with works departments put under the Development Bureau would achieve better coordination and implementation of the initiatives. Outline Zoning Plans prepared or revised and AIPs would be submitted to the Board for consideration. The Board would also be briefed on the progress of implementation of the recommendations of the Study as and when appropriate;
- (l) the three broad directions of providing a quality living environment, enhancing economic competitiveness and strengthening links with the Mainland recommended in the Study were adopted by the Government

and would be integrated in various policy areas. In transport planning, the Transport and Highways Departments would take into account the recommended development scenario and other relevant data in their reviews of the Comprehensive Transport Study and Railway Development Strategy; and

- (m) the Outline Zoning Plans provided a planning framework to regulate land uses and would be regularly reviewed. The types of developments to be provided were mainly determined by the market.

11. On consideration of Hong Kong's obligation towards resolving global environmental issues, Ms. Anissa Wong supplemented that Hong Kong had pledged in the context of the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation to achieve reduction in energy intensity by 25% by 2030 (with 2005 as the base year). While the bulk of energy used was in the commercial and transport sectors instead of the industrial sector, it was the Government's policy to enhance energy saving and efficiency. Mandatory Building Energy Codes and Extension of the Energy Efficiency Labeling Scheme were being pursued as pledged in the Chief Executive's 2007 Policy Address. Consideration of sustainability and energy saving should be incorporated in building and project design. It was also the Government's policy to encourage a greater reliance on rail transport and to promote the patronage of the public transport to reduce the use of private cars. The development strategy in the Study was a conceptual framework and when proposals were translated into concrete plans, the sustainability elements would be incorporated.

12. On sustainable transport, Ms. Ava Chiu advised that the transport policy was rail-based. The car ownership rate in Hong Kong was very low, when compared with other cities. The proposed MTR West Island Line and South Island Line would help encourage a modal shift away from the use of private cars. Various measures including provision of more escalator links to the new MTR stations could also increase the patronage of rail transport. The Government would also seek to require motorists to switch off idling vehicle engines to improve roadside air quality. The question of 'affordable' transport was more complicated. The merging of the KCRC and MTRC would help to lower the transport fare to some extent. The transport fare was also subject to market mechanism and in processing applications for fare increase submitted by the transport operators, the factor of affordability would be duly considered.

[Professor Bernard V.W.F. Lim, Ms. Anna S.Y. Kwong, Mr. Tony C.N. Kan, Mr. K.Y. Leung, Dr. Daniel B.M. To, Mr. Felix W. Fong, Ms. Ava Chiu and Mr. Walter K.L. Chan left the meeting temporarily during the above discussion.]

[Mr. Leslie H.C. Chen and Miss Annie Tam arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

13. The Chairman made the following points in response to Members' comments:

- (a) the implementation of the NDAs was definite and concrete. Detailed planning and engineering studies would be carried out shortly and the public would be consulted on the detailed proposals. On the provision of supporting community facilities in the NDAs, the planning standards in the HKPSG would be applied flexibly;
- (b) rural rehabilitation was a problem that needed to be addressed. PlanD would submit a paper on open storage uses in the N.T. to the Board for consideration soon;
- (c) the planning of cross-boundary infrastructure and measures to enhance ties with Shenzhen would be steered by a high level committee with representations from both Governments. Consideration might be given to setting up consolidated educational facilities in the boundary areas; and
- (d) The Labour and Welfare Bureau was engaged in formulating policies for our ageing population. The Elderly Commission set up under the Bureau was to advise the Government on matters relating to the well-being of the elderly.

14. In conclusion, the Chairman said that the recommendations in the Study would take some time to implement. He asked PlanD to report the progress of implementation to the Board at regular intervals.

15. The Chairman thanked the representatives of PlanD for attending the meeting. They left the meeting at this point.

16. The meeting was adjourned for a 5-minute break at 11:10 a.m.

[Ms. Carmen K.M. Chan, Professor Peter R. Hills, Dr. Daniel B.M. To, Mr. Walter K.L. Chan and Ms. Anissa Wong left the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 4

[Open Meeting]

Hung Hom District Study – Report on Stage 2 Public Engagement Programme and Draft District Plan
(TPB Paper No. 7932)

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese and English.]

17. The following Members declared interests on the item:

- | | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|
| Ms. Starry W.K. Lee | - | being a Member of the Kowloon City District Council covering the study area |
| Professor Bernard V.W.F. Lim | - | his company, Centre of Architectural Research for Education, Elderly, Environment and Excellence Ltd. (CARE), being an independent consultant for the Public Engagement Programme of the Study |
| Dr. Leslie H.C. Chen | - | having previous business dealings with CARE |

18. Members considered that the interests of the above three Members were indirect and agreed that they could stay at the meeting and participate in the discussion of the item.

19. The following representatives from the Planning Department (PlanD) and the consultants were invited to the meeting:

Mr. Raymond Lee	Chief Town Planner/Sub-Regional, PlanD
Ms. Sally Fong	Senior Town Planner/Sub-Regional
Mr. Alan Macdonald) Urbis Limited
Mr. William Pugh)
Mr. Ray Tang	Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Ltd.
Mr. Daniel Cheung	Centre of Architectural Research for Education, Elderly, Environment and Excellence Ltd. (CARE)
Ms. Betty Ho	PlanArch Consultants Limited

20. The Chairman extended a welcome and invited the representatives to brief Members on the Paper.

Presentation Session

21. Mr. Raymond Lee introduced that on 7.9.2007, the Board was briefed on the proposals of the draft District Plan formulated under the Study and the framework for the Stage 2 Public Engagement Programme (PEP). Members considered that more information on the rationale behind the preferred options and on the traffic assessments was required in order to provide more constructive comments and PlanD was also asked to prepare 3-D images on the proposals to facilitate discussion.

22. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Mr. Alan Macdonald made the following main points:

KCRC Freight Yard and International Mail Centre (IMC) Site

- (a) the two sites were assumed to be relocated in the long run;
- (b) three options (Option 1 – Low-rise Option, Options 2 and 3 – Mixed Commercial Use) with varying development intensities as detailed in paragraph 6 of the Paper had been examined;

(c) Option 3 was considered the preferred option because:

- it could provide a critical mass of development enhancing the vibrancy of the area;
- almost 50% of the area could be reserved as public open space and waterfront promenade; and
- the built form would be in keeping with the character of the area and the view to the Coliseum through the site would be maintained ;

“Comprehensive Development Area” (“CDA”) and Adjoining Open Space Site

(d) three options (Option 1 – Limited Commercial Development, Option 2 – Medium Density Mixed Development and Option 3 – Optimum Density Development) with varying development intensities as detailed in paragraph 9 of the Paper had been examined;

(e) Option 3 was the preferred option because:

- with increased hotel and office space, it would support a wider variety of retail and leisure uses;
- the development intensity was consistent with neighbouring medium-rise waterfront developments, but significantly lower than the high-rise developments to the north;
- the tower arrangement created visual corridors that enhanced visual permeability; and
- integration of the CDA with the surrounding would promote a vibrant streetscape and street level activities along the perimeter;

Hung Luen Road “Residential (Group A)2” (“R(A)2”) Site

- (f) various options including the current plot ratio (PR) of 9 as stipulated on the OZP, and a reduced PR of 6 (with the options of a two-tower and a three-tower design) had been considered;
- (g) a two-tower development with 33 domestic storeys above a 2-storey retail podium at an overall PR of 6 was recommended as the preferred option because:
 - the current PR 9 with 3 tower blocks was too dense for the locality;
 - reduction of PR allowed less site coverage and more space for greenery; and
 - the reduced building bulk and two-tower built form allowed visual permeability and enhanced air circulation.

Tai Wan Shan Park

- (h) a number of options, from landscape enhancement to mixed retail and amenity use of various scales, had been considered;
- (i) the Study recommended to relocate the existing basketball court and playground elsewhere and to re-designate the eastern portion of the site for waterfront related commercial and leisure uses which would enhance the vibrancy of the waterfront;

Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA)

- (j) a broad-brush TIA had been undertaken to assess the traffic impact of the proposals. As the proposals had adopted a lower development intensity than the current levels stipulated on the OZP, the traffic generated would not bring about adverse traffic impact on the adjacent road network. The proposed Shatin to Central Link and the possible MTR extension would help to ameliorate the existing traffic congestion;

and

- (k) to improve connectivity between the Hung Hom harbourfront and the hinterland was a major objective of the Study. The enhancement measures on pedestrian circulation were well received by the public.

23. With the aid of 3-D animation, Mr. Raymond Lee showed the development scenarios of the “CDA” and “R(A)2” sites.

24. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Mr. Daniel Cheung then reported on the results of the PEP and made the following main points:

- (a) the PEP included a roving exhibition, public forum and consultation with District Councils. As at 20.10.2007, 450 feedback forms and 10 written submissions had been received;
- (b) public feedback on the proposals to improve the connectivity of the area, enhance the public realm and streetscape, control development intensity and relocate incompatible land uses was on the whole positive ;
- (c) there were strong local sentiments for further reduction of the development intensity and building height of the “CDA” and “R(A)2” sites and against the relocation of the basketball court and introduction of small-scale café-type retail use at the Tai Wan Shan Park; and
- (d) the public comments received would be further analysed for the planning consultants to review the proposals.

Discussion Session

25. In response to a Member’s enquiry on the traffic improvement proposals, Mr. Alan Macdonald said that as vehicular access to the development sites was important, two additional access points were proposed for the freight yard and IMC site. The CDA site was well served by the existing roads. The TIA conducted had confirmed the

accessibility and acceptability of the development proposals. One major focus of the Study was to improve pedestrian accessibility and circulation. In this connection, the enhancement measures on pedestrian circulation using the development sites, and the linkage improvement from Tsim Sha Tsui East with Hung Hom, would greatly improve the connectivity of the waterfront with the hinterland and the adjoining areas.

26. Another Member said that the proposed PRs for the KCRC freight yard and IMC site and the “CDA” site were still high and there was room to further reduce the proposed development intensity. This Member commented that as shown in the 3-D animation, the two proposed towers at the “R(A)2” site were taller than the existing buildings behind them and suggested to adopt a gradation concept in urban design. The Member further asked whether any 3-D images had been prepared for the two proposed hotels at the freight yard and IMC site.

27. Mr. Raymond Lee said that Members’ comments on the development intensity and building height of the proposals, particularly for the “CDA” and “R(A)2” sites, would be addressed together with the public comments received and the proposals would be further reviewed. As for 3-D images for the proposed development at the freight yard and IMC site, it had not been prepared as the proposal for the site was still at a very preliminary stage. The 3-D images would be prepared when there was concrete proposal for the site, and the Board would be consulted by then.

28. Members had no further questions to raise. The Chairman asked PlanD to take the views of Members and the public into account in revising the draft District Plan proposals. The Chairman thanked the representatives of PlanD and the study consultants for attending the meeting. They left the meeting at this point.

[Professor Nora F.Y. Tam left the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 5

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Session only)]

Review of Application No. A/H17/118

Eating Place, Shop and Services, School and Place of Entertainment (Cinema) (Proposed

Alteration and Addition to the Existing Commercial Portion at 109 Repulse Bay Road) in “Residential (Group B)” zone, 101 and 109 Repulse Bay Road – Rural Building Lots 167 and 142

(TPB Paper No. 7927)

[The hearing was conducted in English and Cantonese.]

29. Mr. Felix W. Fong, who owned a property in Repulse Bay Road, and Dr. James C.W. Lau, who had current business dealings with one of the applicants i.e. the Repulse Bay Co. Ltd., declared interests on the item. Mr. Michael K.C. Lai also declared an interest as the organization he served was a client of P&T Architects and Engineers Ltd. and Members considered that there was no apparent conflict of interest. Mr. Lai was allowed to stay at the meeting and participate in the discussion of the item.

[Mr. Felix W. Fong and Dr. James C.W. Lau left the meeting at this point.]

Presentation and Question Session

30. Ms. Christine Tse, District Planning Officer/Hong Kong of the Planning Department (PlanD), and the following applicants’ representatives were invited to the meeting at this point:

Mr. Martyn Sawyer
Mr. Kenneth To
Ms. Janice Wong
Mr. Palle Ledet Jensen
Ms. Tina Wong
Ms. Esther Chow
Mr. Frankie Cheng
Ms. Kitty Wong

31. The Chairman extended a welcome and explained briefly the procedures of the review hearing. The Chairman then invited Ms. Christine Tse to brief Members on the background to the application.

32. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Ms. Christine Tse did so as

detailed in the Paper and made the following main points:

- (a) the applicant sought permission for the proposed alteration and addition to the commercial portion (Repulse Bay Shopping Centre) of the development on the application site for eating place, shop and services, school and place of entertainment (cinema) uses, which fell within an area zoned “Residential (Group B)” (“R(B)”);
- (b) the reasons for the Metro Planning Committee (MPC) rejecting the application on 13.7.2007 were set out in paragraph 1.2 of the Paper;
- (c) no further justification for the review application was submitted by the applicant;
- (d) departmental comments – the departmental comments were as summarized in paragraph 3.1 of the Paper, highlighting that there were no adverse departmental comments on the application;
- (e) public comments – 11 public comments were received on the review application. 5 commenters who were existing tenants of the Repulse Bay Shopping Centre and residents of the residential development at the application site supported the application on the grounds of meeting rising local demand and improvement of existing services to the residents and community, reduction of vehicular trips as well as not affecting the current colonial ambience of the Shopping Centre. The remaining 6 commenters who were mainly nearby residents objected to the application on the grounds of additional traffic, adequate provision of commercial facilities in the vicinity and elsewhere, as well as the adverse effect on the character of the area; and
- (f) PlanD’s view – PlanD did not support the application for reasons stated in paragraph 5.1 of the Paper. The proposed additional commercial floor areas were not in line with the planning intention of the “R(B)” zone and there was insufficient information to justify the provision of the proposed uses, in particular the cinemas.

33. The Chairman then invited the applicants' representatives to elaborate on the application.

34. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation and with reference to a model displayed at the meeting, Mr. Martyn Sawyer made the following main points:

- (a) the applicant was committed to preserving the special character and atmosphere of the area, as evidenced by the re-creation of the famous Verandah Restaurant in the redevelopment of the Repulse Bay Hotel in 1982;
- (b) the Shopping Centre, which was two decades old, was due for renovation to meet the changing needs of the residents. In the proposed renovation, the applicants were mindful of not affecting the appearance of the colonial style building and would retain the existing character;
- (c) the proposed additional commercial gross floor area (GFA) of 2153.7m² was not excessive. The resultant total plot ratio at 109 Repulse Bay Road was lower than the maximum plot ratio of 3 permitted under the Outline Zoning Plan;
- (d) there were no adverse comments from concerned departments. The Architectural Services Department commented that there was no significant increase in building bulk, no change in the overall appearance of the building and no adverse visual impact arising from the proposed alteration and addition works;
- (e) the increase in GFA was mainly for the provision of basement support facilities and supermarket extension. The area of basement support facilities was converted from the existing under-utilized pedestrian circulation area of the car park to provide space for loading/unloading of goods and storerooms for the restaurants. The extension of the supermarket on the ground floor was required to provide higher quality

services to meet the needs of customers;

- (f) the two proposed high quality mini “Director’s cinemas” were on the first floor and only occupied an area of 383.3m² with 28 and 48 seats respectively. They were intended to add variety to the Shopping Centre. The Buildings Department had accepted the co-existence of the cinema and school uses under the Buildings Ordinance. The concerned pre-school and kindergarten had also submitted their support letters which were included in the materials to be distributed to Members for their reference after the presentation; and
- (g) the proposed alteration and addition would not affect the character of the building and there would be no adverse visual, amenity and traffic impacts.

35. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Mr. Kenneth To made the following main points:

- (a) the proposed uses were intended to serve the local residents and hence were in line with the planning intention of the “R(B)” zone where commercial uses serving the residential neighbourhood might be permitted on application;
- (b) there had been a significant increase in population in the Repulse Bay and surrounding areas. The proposed increase in commercial GFA to serve the residents was modest; and
- (c) the provision of cinemas was a market choice. There was no planning reason to restrict the provision of cinemas in big shopping malls only but not in residential neighbourhoods. The two small neighbourhood cinemas were compatible with the planning intention.

36. The questions raised by Members were summarized as follows:

- (a) noting that the cinemas would occupy the existing courtyard as shown

in Plan A-5, whether there was any way to retain the Chinese landscaped garden including scaling down the cinemas;

- (b) whether the other components of the scheme would still be pursued if the proposed cinemas were not accepted by the Board;
- (c) assuming that the cinemas element was taken out, whether the landscaped garden could be re-created above the extended supermarket area;
- (d) whether the basement support facilities would displace any existing parking spaces which would be re-provided outdoor and what was the total provision of parking and loading/unloading facilities; and
- (e) whether the proposed outdoor parking spaces would have any adverse effect on traffic.

37. In response, Messrs. Martyn Sawyer and Kenneth To made the following main points:

- (a) the courtyard was an existing access area with stairs linking up two floors. It was landscaped in Chinese style with a waterfall and a fish pond, but it was not part of the original Repulse Bay Hotel design. It would be affected by the supermarket extension on the ground floor in any event. With the proposed cinemas on the first floor, the roof of the cinemas would be at the same level as the existing podium garden of the residential portion. The roof would be landscaped and accessible to the residents. To compensate for the loss of this landscaped area to the public, the applicants would provide a landscaped area with water feature in the open lawn area;
- (b) the applicants would go ahead with the extension of the supermarket even without the cinemas. While theoretically the Chinese garden could be replicated on the roof of the supermarket extension, the re-created landscaped area would not be accessible to the public or the

residents due to the difference in level with the adjoining podium;

- (c) the basement support facilities only occupied the under-utilized pedestrian circulation area in the car park and would not affect any existing parking spaces. The outdoor parking spaces were additional ones. In the proposed scheme, there were a total of 84 parking spaces, 7 loading/unloading bays, 2 taxi lay-bys, and 5 mini-bus lay-bys for the schools. Compared with the existing provision, there would be 5 additional parking spaces, 3 additional loading/unloading bays, and the lay-bys were new; and
- (d) the proposed outdoor parking spaces would not add any burden on traffic. A TIA had been conducted and confirmed that there would be no adverse traffic impact. The TIA was accepted by the Transport Department.

[Ms. Anna S.Y. Kwong left the meeting at this point.]

38. Members then spent some time examining the model of the development displayed at the meeting.

39. As the applicants' representatives had no further comment to make and Members had no further question to raise, the Chairman informed them that the hearing procedures for the review had been completed and the Board would further deliberate on the application in their absence and inform the applicants of the Board's decision in due course. The Chairman thanked the applicants' representatives and representative from PlanD for attending the meeting. They all left the meeting at this point.

Deliberation Session

40. The Chairman said that during the consideration of the application by the MPC, there was concern expressed on the proposed cinemas. In this respect, a few Members considered that the provision of cinemas was a commercial decision. Two Members said that given the small scale of the cinemas, they should be mainly serving the neighbourhood.

41. A Member said that the occupation of the courtyard area by the cinemas was a major concern of the MPC, and it was clarified by the applicants' representatives that the courtyard could not be retained because of the extension of the supermarket. This Member accepted the justifications put forward by the applicants' representatives on the supermarket extension and considered it essential to reprovide accessible quality landscaped area on the roof-top. Another Member said that the courtyard was unique in atmosphere but a balanced consideration should be made. This Member considered that the applicant would provide quality landscaping to match the design and building style of the existing development.

42. A Member said that another concern on the conflict of the co-existence of cinema and school uses was also resolved. Apart from the acceptance of the Buildings Department, the two concerned schools also supported the application. This Member suggested to include more water features in the compensatory landscaped area in the open lawn area offered by the applicant but Chinese garden design should be avoided. Another Member agreed that the design of the proposed landscaped area should match the colonial style of the building, so a Chinese-style garden might not be appropriate.

43. A Member said that as the supermarket extension was limited in scale and there were suitable traffic arrangements and adequate parking provision, the application was considered acceptable.

44. Taking Members' comments, the Chairman said that the application was acceptable given the modest increase in commercial GFA and there would be no adverse impacts on traffic, visual amenity and the character of the area. There were also merits in the applicants' proposal for providing a roof garden above the cinemas, which would be accessible to the residents, and their undertaking to reprovide a quality landscaped area with water feature in the open lawn area.

45. Miss Ophelia Y.S. Wong said that PlanD did not object to the application at the s.16 application stage. At the MPC meeting, two concerns were raised, one related to the proposed cinema use which might not be compatible with the planning intention for the "R(B)" zone, which was intended primarily for medium-density residential developments with commercial uses serving the residential neighbourhood, and the other

one related to the loss of the landscaped area at the existing courtyard. Having considered the information provided by the applicants' representatives during the hearing, the two issues had been satisfactorily addressed. She added that to allow for design flexibility, the proposed condition in paragraph 5.3(d) of the Paper should be adequate and it would be more appropriate to include an advisory clause asking the applicants to note Members' views when designing the landscaped areas.

46. After further deliberation, the Board decided to approve the application on review on the terms of the application as submitted to the Board. The permission should be valid until 26.10.2011, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission renewed. The permission was subject to the following conditions:

- (a) the design and provision of the internal transport facilities of the proposed development to the satisfaction of the Commissioner for Transport or of the Town Planning Board;
- (b) the design and provision of water supply for fire fighting and fire safety installations to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board;
- (c) the submission and implementation of a drainage proposal to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board; and
- (d) the submission and implementation of a tree preservation scheme and a landscape proposal to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning or of the Town Planning Board.

47. The Board also agreed to advise the applicants of the following:

- (a) to note the comments of Members of the Town Planning Board on the design and quality of the landscaped areas;
- (b) to apply to District Lands Officer/Hong Kong West and South, Lands

Department for lease modification;

- (c) to note the comments of Director of Fire Services regarding the compliance of Code of Practice for Means of Access for Firefighting and Rescue; and
- (d) to note the comments of Chief Engineer/Hong Kong & Islands, Drainage Services Department regarding the requirements for incorporating necessary drainage details into drainage plans for submission to the Building Authority for approval.

Agenda Item 6

[Open Meeting]

Application to the Chief Executive under section 8(2) of the Town Planning Ordinance for Extension of Time Limit for Submission of Draft Ting Kok Outline Zoning Plan No. S/NE-TK/13 to the Chief Executive in Council for Approval
(TPB Paper No. 7933)

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

48. The Secretary briefly introduced the Paper.

49. After deliberation, the Board agreed that the Chief Executive's agreement should be sought under section 8(2) of the Ordinance to extend the time limit for submission of the draft Ting Kok Outline Zoning Plan No. S/NE-TK/13 to the Chief Executive in Council for a further period of six months from 12.12.2007 to 12.6.2008.

Agenda Item 9

[Open Meeting]

Any Other Business

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

50. There being no other business, the meeting was closed at 1:00 p.m.