

HONG KONG TOWN PLANNING BOARD

Confidential
(downgraded on 8.5.2009)

Minutes of 933rd Meeting of the Town Planning Board held on 3.4.2009

Agenda Item 6

Submission of the Draft Development Scheme Plan for the Urban Renewal Authority
Shanghai Street/Argyle Street Development Scheme (MK/01)
(TPB Paper No. 8314)

Deliberation Session

1. The Chairperson said that the discussion of the Board should focus on the boundary of the draft Development Scheme Plan (DSP), the DSP approach and the planning intentions and uses as stated in the Notes and the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the draft DSP.

Boundary of the draft DSP

2. A Member considered the boundary of the draft DSP acceptable, and supported the inclusion of the 10 pre-war shophouses and four intervening post-war buildings in the draft DSP. The post-war buildings would allow flexibility for the future design and provide the necessary solution space for the provision of essential building services according to the current standards. This Member also agreed that the two buildings adjoining the Scheme Area being relatively new and in fair conditions should not be included. Other Members agreed.

DSP Approach

3. A Member said that given the diminishing number of pre-war shophouses in Hong Kong, the proposed DSP approach was necessary to pre-empt piecemeal redevelopment of the shophouses within the Scheme Area. This view was supported

by another Member. The Chairperson added that without a DSP, there was no mechanism to prevent owners from redeveloping their properties under the current "Residential (Group A)" zoning. Piecemeal redevelopment would undermine the cluster effect of the shophouses, and defeat the purpose of their preservation. The DSP prepared under section 25 of the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) Ordinance could set out clearly the intention of preservation and how it would be implemented, and ensure the affected owners and tenants be compensated in accordance with URA's policies. Members agreed that the DSP approach was more effective to achieve the objective of preservation and revitalisation of the shophouses at Shanghai Street.

[Professor Edwin H.W. Chan arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

Notes and ES of the draft DSP

4. Members noted the contents of the Notes and the ES and agreed that they had been drawn up to reflect the nature of the Development Scheme and the planning intention of the pre-war shophouses and the post-war buildings.

5. In response to a Member's enquiry on whether the Board would be further briefed on the Social Impact Assessment (SIA) Report, the Secretary explained that the SIA Report (Stages 1 and 2) was prepared by URA under the requirements of the Urban Renewal Strategy and had formed part of the current submission to the Board for information. The findings of the SIA Report were also summed up in the Paper. Should the Board agree to deem the draft DSP as being suitable for publication for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (TPO), the public would still have the opportunity to make representations and comments on the draft DSP under the statutory planning procedures. All representations and comments received would be submitted to the Board for consideration. As to the issue on project viability which might be raised by the public when the draft DSP was published, the Secretary informed Members that based on the previous ruling by the Court of Appeal on the URA project at Staunton Street/Wing Lee Street, the Board could take into account the project viability in making a decision on the DSP. However, sufficient information had to be provided by URA if the Board was to duly examine such an aspect. For the Staunton Street/Wing Lee Street Development

Scheme, despite the Board's request, the URA had refused to disclose its financial position of that project to the Board on the grounds of confidentiality.

6. The Secretary informed Members that according to the Town Planning Board Guidelines No. 29A, the Board's decision on the draft DSP would be kept confidential for three to four weeks after the meeting and would be released when the draft DSP was published under section 5 of TPO. Members would be informed by the Secretariat of the date of release of the Board's decision.

7. After further deliberation, the Board decided to:

- (a) deem the draft Shanghai Street/Argyle Street Development Scheme Plan (DSP) No. S/K3/URA3/A at Annex 2 and the Notes in Annex 3 of the Paper as being suitable for publication as provided for under section 25(6) of the Urban Renewal Authority Ordinance, so that the draft DSP should be exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance;
- (b) endorse the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the draft DSP at Annex 4 of the Paper and adopt it as an expression of the Board's planning intention and objectives of the draft DSP, and agree that the ES as being suitable for public inspection together with the draft DSP;
- (c) agree that the draft DSP, its Notes and ES were suitable for submission to the Yau Tsim Mong District Council for consultation/information upon exhibition of the draft DSP; and
- (d) note the Social Impact Assessment Report (Stages 1 and 2) at Annex 1a (i.e. Appendices F and G) of the Paper.

Agenda Item 7

Submission of the Draft Development Scheme Plan for the Urban Renewal Authority
Prince Edward Road West/Yuen Ngai Street Development Scheme (MK/02)
(TPB Paper No. 8313)

Deliberation Session

8. The Chairperson said that the discussion of the Board should focus on the boundary of the Development Scheme Plan (DSP), the DSP approach and the planning intentions and uses as stated in the Notes and the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the draft DSP.

Boundary of the draft DSP

9. The Chairperson said that the draft DSP had included 10 pre-war shophouses and excluded a 15-storey residential block located in-between as the latter was relatively new and in good condition. Two pre-war shophouses at Nos. 210-212 Prince Edward Road West though separated by the 15-storey residential block had been included in the draft DSP as they formed part of the pre-war shophouse cluster having identical height and façade design. Members noted and agreed on the boundary of the draft DSP.

DSP Approach

10. Members agreed that the DSP approach was necessary to pre-empt piecemeal redevelopment within the Scheme Area so as not to undermine the preservation efforts. Also, the DSP could enable the affected owners and tenants to be compensated and rehoused in accordance with URA's policies.

Notes and ES of the draft DSP

11. Members noted the contents of the Notes and the ES and agreed that they had been drawn up to reflect the nature of the Development Scheme and the planning intention of the pre-war shophouses.

12. The Secretary informed Members that according to the TPB Guidelines No. 29A, the Board's decision on the draft DSP would be kept confidential for three to four weeks after the meeting and would be released when the draft DSP was published under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance. Members would be informed by the Secretariat of the date of release of the Board's decision.

13. After further deliberation, the Board decided to:

- (a) deem the draft Prince Edward Road West/Yuen Ngai Street Development Scheme Plan (DSP) No. S/K3/URA2/A at Annex 2 and the Notes in Annex 3 of the Paper as being suitable for publication as provided for under section 25(6) of the Urban Renewal Authority Ordinance, so that the draft DSP should be exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance;
- (b) endorse the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the draft DSP at Annex 4 of the Paper and adopt it as an expression of the Board's planning intention and objectives of the draft DSP, and agree that the ES as being suitable for public inspection together with the draft DSP;
- (c) agree that the draft DSP, its Notes and ES were suitable for submission to the Yau Tsim Mong District Council for consultation/information upon exhibition of the draft DSP; and
- (d) note the Social Impact Assessment Report (Stages 1 and 2) at Annex 1a (i.e. Appendices F and G) of the Paper.