

Detailed Departmental Comments

1. Comments of Director of Environmental Protection

- (a) he notes that the “Residential cum Hotel Scheme” and the “Full Residential Scheme” proposed by the applicant are only for indicative purpose;
- (b) based on the AQIA, ENIA and the Sewage Discharge Estimation submitted by the Applicant in support of the application, he notes that no insurmountable environmental impact would be anticipated from the proposed development;
- (c) should the application be approved by the Board, the applicant or its representative will need to apply to DLO/ST, LandsD for lease modification. In view that the potential environmental impacts, in particular traffic and fixed noise impacts identified in the ENIA, should be properly addressed and mitigated during the detailed design stage and an Sewerage Impact Assessment (SIA) would be required during the detailed design stage to cater for any potential change in development scheme, that may affect the potential generation of sewage, a mechanism to safeguard the environmental acceptability of the proposed redevelopment is necessary. As such, relevant lease conditions requiring for a Noise Impact Assessment (NIA) and SIA would be necessary;
- (d) his detailed comments on the ENIA are listed in (e) to (n) below for the applicant’s information and future preparation of the NIA under lease condition, should the application be approved by the TPB:
- (e) As pointed out by Applicant in Appendix 4 - Environmental Noise Impact Assessment Report (ENIA), in particular sections 6.3 and 7.4, of his Supporting Planning Statement, the required noise mitigation measures for road traffic noise and fixed noise sources will be reviewed in the detailed design stage. Without further information about such detailed design at this stage, the observations on the ENIA given below are only preliminary.
- (f) Section 3.1 - Noise Criteria: For the sake of clarification, the NIA should spelt out whether there will be any changes to the remaining 194 hotel rooms and whether they do rely on opened windows for ventilation. If these hotel rooms do rely on opened windows for ventilation, the noise assessments for road traffic noise and fixed noise sources shall include these noise sensitive receivers and noise mitigation measures shall be duly considered with a view to maintaining 100% compliance rate as claimed in Applicant's ENIA.
- (g) Section 4.1 - Site Survey: When reporting the observations of a site survey, the time of the site survey should be given. Particular attention should be given to those potential noise sources which have operations in sensitive hours, like mid-night and early morning, and with prominent noise emission against a relatively low background noise level.

- (h) Section 5.3 - Traffic Forecast: Noted that there is no endorsement from the Transport Department on the set of traffic forecast data yet. Without confirmation of the validity of the set of traffic forecast data, road traffic noise impact assessment based on such set of data cannot be accepted as valid.
- (i) Section 6.2 - Acoustic Window (baffle type): In the consideration of using acoustic window as a form of noise mitigation measure, the following information should be provided:
 - (i) describe principle of acoustic window and setting of window panes for achieving noise reduction;
 - (ii) provide details of window configurations and flat size/type for supporting the proposed noise reduction figures worked out based on noise measurement results or from previous studies;
 - (iii) confirm the positions of the outer fixed glazing and opened window are in favourable setting (e.g. the air gap is not opening towards the dominant noise source);
 - (iv) spell out whether compliance with the ventilation requirement has been checked/confirmed for the proposed acoustic window at the required setting of window panes; and
 - (v) spell out the mechanism to notify the future occupants of the setting of window panes for achieving noise reduction;
- (j) Section 6.3: In order to ensure proper implementation of the recommended noise mitigation measures, a schedule of noise mitigation measures should be included;
- (k) Section 8 - Conclusion: Applicant shall undertake the implementation of the recommended noise mitigation measures of the NIA. A letter of undertaking from Applicant has to be enclosed as an Annex of the NIA report upon finalization;
- (l) Appendix 4 - Predicted Road Traffic Noise Levels (Base Scenario): Heights of the assessment points in mPD should be given in one decimal place in accordance with the requirement of the Calculation of Road Traffic Noise (CRTN);
- (m) Appendix 5 - Predicted Road Traffic Noise Levels (with Noise Mitigation Measures): For the sake of clarification, a footnote has to be added under the tables of noise levels, saying "For the mitigated scenario with mitigation measures in form of acoustic window (baffle type), the predicted noise levels are not the actual noise level at the external facade after the application of the acoustic windows. These predicted noise levels are the equivalent noise levels at 1 m from the external facade after accounting the reduction in noise levels inside the flat offered by the proposed acoustic window (baffle type)."; and
- (n) Road Traffic Noise Model: The modeling file should be included in the NIA submission for proper record purpose.

2. Comments of Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene

- (a) if there is any catering services / activities proposed to be patronized by members the public, a suitable licence / permit should be obtained from Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene before the operation of such catering services / activities;
- (b) if the proposal involves any commercial/trading activities, no environmental nuisance should be generated to the surroundings. Also, for any waste generated from the commercial/trading activities, the applicant should handle on their own/ at their expenses; and
- (c) for the domestic waste collection:
 - (i) for any waste generated from building and residential development, the applicant should arrange its disposal properly at her own expenses;
 - (ii) if domestic waste collection service of FEHD is required, prior comments from this Department on the waste collection plan should be sought;
 - (iii) the refuses collection point (RCP) of domestic waster and the commercial waster should be clearly separated. The share use of RCP for both domestic and commercial waste is not recommended;
 - (iv) the RCP should be designed to such a condition that within which a refuse collection vehicle (RCV) of 3.0m in width and 10m in length can make a 3 point turn and park without restriction;
 - (v) a designated operational space with dimension 5m (W) x 12m (L) should be provided in the RCP and the headroom of RCP should not be less than 4.5m;
 - (vi) the RCP should be provided with a water point and foul water drainage system for clean-up of the RCV and discharge of foul water before leaving of RCV;
 - (vii) all driveway/EVA to and from the RCPs should be 4m (single direction) in width for road safety reason and the prevention of traffic safety hazards. Besides, the entrance/exit should not be less than 4.5m in width;
 - (viii) as the RCP may located at the basement, it should be provided with adequate ventilation and an effective RCV exhaust extractor with related coupling / detaching device;
 - (ix) the ground surface of the driveway should be designed to withstand the weight of a vehicle up to 25T GVW;
 - (x) no part of the access road including the part connecting the entrance/exit and the roadway of RCV should exceed the gradient of 1 in 10 and in no case the change of slope at any point should exceed 8 degrees; and
 - (xi) the headroom along the RCV driveway/EVA from the ingress/egress to RCP should be at least 4 m.

3. **Comments of the Chief Officer (Licensing Authority), Home Affairs Department**

- (a) the proposed conversion works shall be approved by the Building Authority and the licensee should submit a copy of the acknowledgement letter for the completed works issued by the Building Authority to the Licensing Authority;
- (b) detailed licensing requirements under the Hotel and Guesthouse Accommodation Ordinance will be conveyed to the licensee upon receipt of alteration and addition proposal from the licensee of the hotel;
- (c) prior to obtaining the written agreement of the Licensing Authority, the licensee shall not alter, amend or otherwise change the layout of the existing licensed hotel; and
- (d) the licensee should return the hotel licence to the Licensing Authority, if the licensee ceases to operate, keep, manage or otherwise have control of the Site as a hotel.

Existing Hotels in Sha Tin District

Name of Hotel [Lot No.]	Outline Zoning Plan (OZP)	Zoning	Approved Planning Application for Hotel Use (if applicable) [Date of Meeting]	Completion Year	Nos. of Hotel Room*
Regal Riverside Hotel [STTL 160]	Approved Sha Tin OZP No. S/ST/34	“Commercial”	N/A	1986	882
Royal Park Hotel [STTL 183 (Part)]	Ditto	“Commercial/Residential”	N/A	1989	443
Horizon Suite Hotel [STTL 461] (the application site)	Draft Ma On Shan OZP No. S/MOS/23	“Other Specified Uses” annotated “Hotel”	N/A	2002	831
Hyatt Regency Hong Kong, Sha Tin [STTL 437RP & Extension There to (Part)]	Approved Sha Tin OZP No. S/ST/34	“Government, Institution or Community”	A/ST/532 [20.4.2001]	2008	567
Courtyard by Marriott Hong Kong Sha Tin [STTL 347]	Ditto	“Commercial”	N/A	2012	539
Alva Hotel by Royal [STTL 248]	Ditto	“Industrial (1)”	A/ST/843 [21.3.2014]	2018	618

* Source: Office of the Licensing Authority, Home Affairs Department (As at 31.1.2021)