

TOWN PLANNING BOARD

TPB Paper No. 10475

For Consideration by
the Town Planning Board on 28.9.2018

**DRAFT MA TAU KOK OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/K10/23
CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/23-1 TO 6
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/23-C1 TO C142**

**DRAFT MA TAU KOK OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/K10/23
 CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/23-1 TO 6
 AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/23-C1 TO C142**

Subject of Representations/ Representation Sites	Representers	Commenters
<p><u>Amendment Item (Item A):</u> Revision to the building height restriction (BHR) of a “Government, Institution or Community” (“G/IC”) site at Lung Kong Road from 5 and 8 storeys to 60 metres above Principal Datum (mPD)</p>	<p><u>Total: 6</u></p> <p><u>Support Item A (1)</u></p> <p>R1: The Kowloon City Christians’ Church (KCCC) 九龍城基督徒會</p> <p><u>Oppose Items A and B (4)</u></p> <p>R3 to R6: individuals</p>	<p><u>Total: 142</u></p> <p><u>Support R1 and/or Item A (140)</u></p> <p>C2: submitted by R1, KCCC</p> <p>C3 to C141: individuals, shops/organisations</p> <p><u>Providing Views on Item A (1)</u></p> <p>C1: 吳寶強 (Kowloon City District Council (KCDC) member)</p> <p><u>Providing Views</u></p> <p>C142: submitted by R2, individual</p>
<p><u>Item B:</u> Rezoning of a site at the junction of Ko Shan Road and Shansi Street from “G/IC” and “Residential (Group A)” (“R(A)”) and an area shown as ‘Road’ to “R(A)3” with stipulation of BHR</p>	<p><u>Oppose Items A, B and C2 (1)</u></p> <p>R2: individual</p>	
<p><u>Item C2:</u> Rezoning of a strip of land along Ko Shan Road from an area shown as ‘Road’ to “R(A)”.</p>		

Note: The names of all representers and commenters are attached at **Annex III**. Soft copy of their submissions (except technical reports) is sent to Town Planning Board (the Board) Members via electronic means/CD-Rom at **Annex IV** (for the Board Members only); and is also available for public inspection at the Board’s website at https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/Website_S_K10_23_ENG.html. A full set of hard copy is deposited at the Secretariat of the Board for Members’ inspection; and is also available for public inspection at the Planning Enquiry Counters of the Planning Department (PlanD) in North Point and Sha Tin.

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 On 9.3.2018, the draft Ma Tau Kok Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K10/23 (the Plan) (**Annex I**) was exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance). The Schedule of Amendments setting out the amendments incorporated into the Plan is at **Annex II**. The amendments mainly involve (a) revision to the BHR of a “G/IC” site at 61-63 Lung Kong Road (Lok Sin Tong (LST) site) from 5 and 8 storeys to 60 mPD (Item A); (b) rezoning of a site at the junction of Ko Shan Road and Shansi Street (KSR site) from “G/IC” and “R(A)” and an area shown as ‘Road’ to “R(A)3” with stipulation of BHR (Item B); (c) rezoning of Shansi Street from “G/IC” to an area shown as ‘Road’ (Item C1); and (d) rezoning of a strip of land along Ko Shan Road from an area shown as ‘Road’ to “R(A)” (Item C2) (**Plan H-1**).
- 1.2 During the two-month exhibition period of the draft OZP, a total of six representations were received. On 18.5.2018, the representations were published for three weeks for public comments and 142 comments on the representations (comments) were received. On 13.7.2018, the Board agreed to consider the representations (**R1 to R6**) and comments (**C1 to C142**) collectively in one group.
- 1.3 This paper is to provide the Board with information for consideration of representations and related comments. Summary of the representations and comments with responses are at **Annexes Va** and **Vb** respectively. The representers and commenters have been invited to attend the meeting in accordance with section 6B(3) of the Ordinance.

2. BACKGROUND

Lok Sin Tong’s Redevelopment at Lung Kong Road (LST site)

- 2.1 Under the ‘Special Scheme on Privately Owned Sites for Welfare Uses’ (Special Scheme) launched by the Labour and Welfare Bureau (LWB), the LST Benevolent Society (LSTBS) has submitted a redevelopment proposal for a welfare complex at the junction of Lung Kong Road and Carpenter Road, Kowloon City (**Plans H-2a** and **H-2b**). The conceptual scheme is shown on **Plans H-2e** to **H-2i** and the main development parameters are summarized in **Table 1** below. The Food and Health Bureau, LWB/Social Welfare Department (SWD) and Home Affairs Department (HAD) had given policy support to LST to pursue the proposed redevelopment.

Site Area (about)	1,830m ²
Plot Ratio (PR) (about)	8.8
Site Coverage (about)	95% (below 15m) 69% (over 15m)
No. of Block	1
Building Height (mPD)	Maximum 60mPD

Building Height (No. of Storeys)	Northern portion: 12 above ground Southern portion: 4 above ground Basement: 1	} (Plans H-2e & H-2f)
Main Proposed Welfare Facilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Nursing Home and Care and Attention Home for the Elderly with about 400 beds (1/F to 6/F) - Day Care Centre for the Elderly - Early Education and Training Centre - Primary Health Care Centre - Ethnic Minority Supporting Service Centre 	
Ancillary Car parking Spaces	11 (total) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 5 for light buses - 2 for light goods vehicle (LGV) - 2 for ambulance - 1 for private car for people with disabilities - 1 for refuse collection vehicle 	

Table 1: Main development parameters of the LST's redevelopment

- 2.2 The LST site is zoned "G/IC" on the OZP. To facilitate the redevelopment proposal, the BHR for the site was amended from 5 and 8 storeys to 60mPD (**Plans H-2e to H-2i**).
- 2.3 The LST site is currently occupied by a 5-storey LSTBS headquarters and clinic and a 3-storey LST Primary School (**Plan H-2c**). LST will stop operation of the school on-site after September 2019, and the planned school closure has been approved by the Secretary for Education (SED).

Public Housing Development at KSR Site

- 2.4 To meet the acute housing demand of the community, the Government has been increasing land supply through a multi-pronged approach with short, medium and long-term measures to achieve the target to provide a total of 460,000 housing units, including 280,000 public housing units, in the coming decade. As part of the short to medium term measures, the Government has conducted various land use reviews of sites with potential for housing use including "G/IC" sites without designated use. As announced in the 2014 Policy Address, a total of some 150 sites with potential for rezoning for housing developments have been identified. Among which, a piece of Government land of about 3,000m² abutting Ko Shan Road, Chatham Road North and Shansi Street (**Item B on Plans H-1, H-3a and H-3b**) has been identified as having potential for public housing development.
- 2.5 To take forward the proposal, the KSR site was rezoned mainly from "G/IC" to "R(A)3" with the same PR restrictions as other "R(A)" zones on the OZP and a BHR of 130mPD. The proposed public housing development to be developed by the Hong Kong Housing Authority (HA) comprises a single block building with an ancillary carpark at podium levels and a public carpark at basement level (**Plans H-3f to H-3j**). The main development parameters are summarized in **Table 2** below:

Site Area (about)	3,000m ²
Maximum PR	
Domestic	7.5
Non-domestic	1.5
Site Coverage (about)	70% (non-domestic portion) 23% (domestic portion)
No. of Block	1
Building Height (mPD)	Maximum 130mPD
Building Height (No. of Storeys)	35 domestic floors over 3-storey podium and 1 basement car park level
No. of Flats (about)	450
Car parking facilities	- 35 ancillary parking spaces for private cars - 16 public car parking spaces (11 for light buses / LGVs and 5 for private cars)

Table 2: Main development parameters of the KSR's public housing development

- 2.6 The KSR site is currently held under a temporary government land allocation by Highways Department (HyD) for a temporary works area for the SCL (**Plans H-3c to H-3d**). The site was previously used for temporary public car park under short term tenancy and has been temporary allocated as a works area for SCL since 2012.
- 2.7 On 9.2.2018, the Metro Planning Committee (MPC) of the Board considered the proposed amendments to the approved Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/22 and agreed that the proposed amendments were suitable for public inspection under section 5 of the Ordinance. The relevant MPC Paper No. 1/18 and minutes of the meeting (English version only) are available at the Board's website at https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/papers/MPC/598-mpc_1-18.pdf and https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/meetings/MPC/Minutes/m598mpc_e.pdf respectively. The technical assessment reports¹ prepared by LSTBS and HA in support of the proposed amendments for the LST and KSR sites respectively are available for public inspection at the Planning Enquiry Counters of PlanD in North Point and Sha Tin.

3. LOCAL CONSULTATION

- 3.1 Prior to submission of the proposed amendments to the approved Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/22 for consideration by the MPC, the Housing and Infrastructure Committee (HIC) of KCDC was consulted on 18.1.2018. Their major comments are summarized as follows:

¹ Technical assessments for the LST site covering traffic and visual aspects, and technical assessments for the KSR site covering traffic, visual, environmental and quantitative risk aspects were conducted.

LST site

- (a) Members raised concerns on traffic congestion and requested the provision of public parking spaces, a community hall and/or more social welfare services in the redevelopment. A member considered that a higher BHR can allow provision of more floor space.

KSR site

- (b) Majority of Members suggested that the site should be used for public rental housing (PRH) rather than subsidized sale flat (SSF). It can serve as a decanting site for redevelopment of the existing public housing estates in the area. Some members requested for the provision of more public car parking spaces and/or some social/community facilities within the redevelopment.

- 3.2 Relevant extract of minutes of the HIC meeting held on 18.1.2018 is at **Annex VI**. Views and concerns raised by the KCDC members and responses from government departments, HA and LSTBS had been incorporated into the MPC Paper No. 1/18 for the proposed OZP amendments, which were considered and agreed by MPC on 9.2.2018.
- 3.3 Upon gazetting of the draft Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/23, a paper was circulated to members of the HIC of KCDC in March 2018. One KCDC member submitted a comment (C1) providing views on Item A which are set out in paragraph 5.2 below.

4. THE REPRESENTATIONS**4.1 Subject of Representations**

One representation (**R1**) supports Item A, and requests for relaxation of BHR for another “G/IC” site which is not the subject of the current amendment items. The remaining five representations (**R2**² - **R6**) oppose Items A and B; and **R2** also opposes Item C2. A summary of grounds of representations and comments and PlanD’s responses, with inputs from relevant government departments, is attached at **Annexes Va** and **Vb**. Their views can be summarized as follows:

4.2 Major Grounds of Representations*Supportive (1 representation: **R1**)*

- 4.2.1 KCCC supports Item A on the grounds that the proposed relaxation of BHR would allow provision of more floor space for community facilities at the LST site. Whilst not providing any proposal on Item A, **R1** proposes to relax the BHR for a “G/IC” site to the east of the LST site at 40 Lung Kong Road (**R1**’s site) from 3 storeys to 60mPD (**Plan H-4a**). **R1**’s site is not

² **R2** indicated that she opposes Item C1 (Rezoning of Shansi Street from “G/IC” to an area shown as ‘Road’) if it entails impacts on existing trees, but there are no trees on Shansi Street that was rezoned to reflect the existing road condition (**Plan H-3d**).

the subject of amendments under the OZP. **R1**'s request is to facilitate a redevelopment proposal for a 12-storey (plus basement) complex comprising education and religious facilities with ancillary uses at a PR of 8.8. A redevelopment proposal with impact assessment on visual and traffic aspects is submitted by **R1**.

Adverse (5 representations: R2 to R6)

Item A

4.2.2 In respect of the relaxation of BHR for the LST site, the major grounds of these representations are summarized below:

Suitability for proposed development

- (a) The LST site is not suitable for a high rise residential development as it is constrained by existing flyovers and road networks³ (**R3** to **R6**).
- (b) A tall building would create wall effect (**R5** and **R6**) and aggravate the traffic congestion problem (**R6**).

Historical and cultural interest

- (c) The redevelopment of the LST site will be contrary to and jeopardize the proposals of retaining the area, in which the LST site is located, as a Rehabilitation and Revitalization Priority Area (RRPA) under the recommendation of Urban Renewal Plan (URP) for Kowloon City by the Kowloon City District Urban Renewal Forum (DURF) (green area on **Drawing H-1**). Moreover, LST Primary School has a long history and there are plaques of historical and cultural significance (**Plan H-2d**), and the redevelopment has no regard for heritage (**R2**).

Item B

4.2.3 In respect of the proposed public housing development at the KSR site, the major grounds of the representations (**R2** to **R6**) are summarized below:

Suitability for proposed development

- (a) The KSR site is not suitable for residential development. There are noise and air pollutions from road traffic (both at grade and elevated) (**R2** to **R6**) and traffic congestion issues (**R3** to **R6**). It is mentioned that acoustic windows/balconies would be incorporated into building design to alleviate the potential road traffic noise. Nevertheless, if windows are also closed, it cannot provide ventilation (**R2**).

³ The LST's redevelopment is for welfare use and the only proposed use of a residential nature in the LST site is the nursing home and care and attention home for the elderly with 400 beds on 1/F to 6/F. There are no flyovers in the vicinity of the LST site.

- (b) The KSR site is near a liquefied petroleum gas (LPG) facility in Lok Man Sun Chuen (**Plan H-3k**). The proximity of the LPG makes the site unsuitable for residential housing (**R3 to R6**). There is an unusual quantitative risk aspect regarding the LPG facility (**R2**).

Tree preservation

- (c) Data in HA's broad brush tree survey that 37 trees on the site are common species with poor health condition and low amenity value is misleading (**R2**). The site contains many valuable and mature trees (**R2 to R6**). The trees are mostly in a cluster on the Shansi Street side, and there are some bordering the site on the north and south (**R2**).

Provision of open space and Government, institution and community (GIC) / recreational facilities

- (d) The KSR site was zoned to provide recreational facilities and is currently used as a works site for the MTR Shatin to Central Link (SCL) (**R2**). The trees should be retained along with the site in some forms of GIC facilities, given the loss of other GIC and open space for the construction of the new MTR line (**R3 to R6**).
- (e) The district is 50% deficient in open space. There is a strong need for outdoor active recreational amenities like basketball courts in the immediate district (**R2**).

Item C2

- 4.2.4 **R2** opposes Item C2 on the ground that the purpose of the rezoning is to provide an excuse to cut down the row of trees between the "G/IC" site and the public pavement.

4.3 Representers' Proposals

- 4.3.1 The representers have not put forward any proposal for Items A and C2.

Item B

- 4.3.2 The KSR site and the existing trees should be retained, for GIC (**R2 to R6**) or green lung (**R3 to R6**) uses. **R2** also suggests that the KSR site could be used as a public car park with basketball courts on the roof, or it could be used to provide elderly day-care services.

5. COMMENTS ON REPRESENTATIONS

- 5.1 A total of 142 comments have been received. Among them, a KCDC member (**C1**)

provides views on Item A and an individual (C142⁴ (submitted by R2)) provides views about tree felling in general. C2 (submitted by R1) provides supplementary information in relation to R1's site and the remaining 139 commenters (C3 to C141) mainly express similar views as supporting Item A and/or R1's request to relax BHR on its site to facilitate a redevelopment. The major comments are summarized as follows:

Provision of public car park and community hall at LST site (1 comment: C1)

5.2 C1, a KCDC member, requests the provision of a public car park in the LST site to address the shortage of public car parking spaces in the locality. In addition, to provide a community hall at LST site to allow more venues for cultural performances, community activities and meeting of owners' corporations.

Tree preservation (1 comment: C142)

5.3 C142, which is submitted by R2, provides views that a number of mature trees would be lost in Ma Tau Kok area and details about tree planting proposals are not given.

Relaxation of BHR at R1's site (140 comments: C2 to C141)

5.4 C2, which is submitted by R1, supplements a revised set of plans and provides clarifications on R1's redevelopment, regarding greening ratio, provision of ancillary parking spaces and measures to mitigate noise and air nuisances.

5.5 C3 to C141, submitted by individuals, shops/organisations generally request for relaxation of BHR at R1's site from 3 storeys to 60mPD mainly on grounds that (i) there is limited floor space inside the existing KCCC building, (ii) it will allow provision of more GIC facilities including a community hall⁵ in Kowloon City, and/or (iii) relaxed BHR of 60mPD is compatible to that in the nearby residential developments. Among those 139 comments, 37 of them indicated support for Item A.

6. PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS AND ASSESSMENTS

6.1 The Representation Sites and the Surrounding Areas

LST site

6.1.1 The LST site is described in paragraph 2.3 above.

6.1.2 The surroundings of the LST site are:

- (a) within a mixed residential/commercial neighbourhood bounded by Carpenter Road, Sa Po Road, Prince Edward Road West and Junction

⁴ C142 did not specify which representation the comment is related to.

⁵ The indicative scheme for the redevelopment on the R1's site only included educational and religious uses, and there is no proposal for a community hall.

Road. The neighbouring area is predominantly medium-rise residential developments with ground floor shops and restaurant uses. Some new residential developments are of taller building height. This area is predominantly zoned “R(A)2” that is subject to domestic and total PR restrictions of 7.5 and 9 respectively as well as BHRs of 80mPD or 100mPD⁶ (**Plan H-1**);

- (b) with some low-rise GIC developments. Along the east side of Lung Kong Road are an education centre (on **RI**'s site), a refuse collection point, a post office and a telephone exchange station (**Plan H-2a** and **H-2b**); and
- (c) to its north is the Carpenter Road Park and Kowloon Walled City Park within “Open Space” (“O”) zone (**Plan H-2b**).

KSR site

6.1.3 The KSR site is described in paragraph 2.6 above.

6.1.4 The surroundings of the site are:

- (a) within a high-rise residential neighbourhood with a mix of public and private housing. To its north, east and south are mainly private residential buildings and the Lok Man Sun Chuen public housing estate is located to its northwest (**Plan H-3a**);
- (b) to its west is the Ko Shan Road Park and the Ko Shan Theatre is located within the park (**Plan H-3b**); and
- (c) Chatham Road North and the elevated East Kowloon Corridor at a level of about 19mPD about the eastern boundary of the site.

6.2 Planning Intentions

6.2.1 The planning intention of the “G/IC” zone in relation to Item A is as follows:

The “G/IC” zone is intended primarily for the provision of GIC facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of the Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments.

6.2.2 The planning intention of the “R(A)” zone in relation to Items B and C2 are as follows:

- (a) The “R(A)” zone is intended primarily for high-density residential

⁶ “R(A)2” sites are subject to BHR of 80mPD as stipulated on the OZP, while sites with an area of 400m² or more are allowed a BHR of 100mPD as stipulated in the Notes.

developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building.

- (b) The KSR site is zoned “R(A)3” under Item B while a strip of land along Ko Shan Road to reflect the existing as-built residential use is zoned “R(A)” under Item C2. Development/redevelopment within “R(A)” and “R(A)3” zones is subject to a maximum PR of 7.5 for a domestic building or 9.0 for a building that is partly domestic or non-domestic, and a BHR as shown on the Plan (i.e. 130mPD for “R(A)3” zone under Item B and 120mPD for the “R(A)” zone under Item C2), or the PR or height of existing building whichever is greater.
- (c) To allow the provisioning of public car parking spaces to meet the local demand, ‘Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)’ is a Column 1 use under the Notes of the “R(A)3” zone.

6.3 Responses to Grounds of Representations

Supportive

Item A

- 6.3.1 The supportive view of **R1** on Item A is noted. **R1** also proposes to relax the BHR from 3 storeys to 60mPD at **R1**’s site. **R1**’s site is not the subject of any amendment items under the current draft OZP.
- 6.3.2 To pursue its proposal, **R1** may consider submitting their development scheme with relevant technical assessments in the form of a s.12A application for amendment to OZP, which will be processed and considered by the Board in accordance with the provisions of the Ordinance. Alternatively, if the proposal can obtain policy support of relevant bureaux and government departments’ agreement to the technical feasibility of their scheme, PlanD may submit the relevant OZP amendment to the Board for consideration direct similar to the amendment for the LST site.

Adverse

Item A

Suitability for proposed development (R2 to R6)

- 6.3.3 The LST site is zoned “G/IC” on OZP, and the current amendment is only to relax the BHR for the site to facilitate redevelopment to provide more social welfare facilities to serve the community. The proposed development is for welfare uses, which are in line with the planning intention of “G/IC” zone, and will be implemented via Special Scheme launched by the LWB. Except for nursing home/care and attention home, the other uses (i.e. day care centre for the elderly, early education and

training centre, primary care centre and ethnic minority supporting service centre) within the redevelopment are not residential in nature. To support the proposed welfare complex at the site, the LSTBS has conducted supporting technical assessments on traffic and visual aspects, which are enclosed in MPC Paper No. 1/18⁷.

- 6.3.4 From the environmental aspect, the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP) considers that LST's redevelopment would not cause insurmountable problems nor adverse impacts on air quality. At the detailed design stage, LSTBS will undertake air quality impact assessment (AQIA), noise impact assessment (NIA) and sewerage impact assessment (SIA) to ascertain whether mitigation measures are required to be incorporated in the redevelopment.
- 6.3.5 From air ventilation point of view, the LST site does not fall within any of the identified major breezeways. The increase of building height of the site from 5 and 8 storeys to 60mPD would not induce any significant adverse air ventilation impact on the surrounding pedestrian wind environment. The VA concluded that the proposed redevelopment is considered not visually excessive and is compatible with the surrounding area. Measures including setback of building by 2m along Nam Kok Road as well as greening proposals will further mitigate any visual impacts.
- 6.3.6 Regarding traffic impact, the Commissioner for Transport (C for T) is of the view that according to the Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) submitted by LSTBS, the traffic trips related to the proposed welfare complex can be absorbed by the nearby road network and no significant traffic impact will be induced.
- 6.3.7 Concerned government departments confirmed their earlier views that the LST's redevelopment will not cause insurmountable problems on environmental and traffic aspects.

Historical and cultural interest (R2)

- 6.3.8 According to the recommendation of URP for Kowloon City formulated by Kowloon City DURF in January 2014, Nga Tsin Wai Road Area in which the LST site is located is recommended as a RRPA (**Drawing H-1**), which is "to adopt rehabilitation and revitalisation schemes to inject new vibrancy and to make environmental improvements to the Area, and also to preserve the local character during renewal process. Such proposal does not place restriction on the redevelopment of individual old buildings in the Area". While priority is given to rehabilitation and revitalization in the RRPA, there is no restriction on the redevelopment of individual old buildings.

⁷ The extract of Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) and the full report of Visual Appraisal (VA) are enclosed at the MPC Paper, while the full assessment reports are available for public inspection at PlanD's Planning Enquiry Counters.

- 6.3.9 There are granite lintels bearing the inscriptions “Lung Tsun” (龍津) and “Lok Sin Tong” (樂善堂) at the entrance gate of LST Primary School (**Plan H-2d**). While the buildings and structures at the site are not graded historic buildings, the Antiquities and Monuments Office (AMO) is of the view that the granite lintels are a historical memorial with high historical interest and efforts should be made to preserve them. LSTBS indicated that they would preserve the granite lintels, and intends to display them in the redevelopment. In addition, an exhibition corner will be provided in the proposed redevelopment to display the historic elements or features related to LSTBS. The general public are welcome to visit the exhibition corner during its opening hours. AMO supports LSTBS to preserve the granite lintels in the redevelopment and would be pleased to offer technical advice on LSTBS’ proposed arrangements of the gateway and lintels in due course. The specific arrangements may be further worked out by LSTBS with advice from AMO at the detailed design stage.

Item B

Suitability for proposed development (R2 to R6)

- 6.3.10 The required technical appraisals/assessments on various aspects had been carried out by HA in support of the rezoning of the KSR site to “R(A)3” to facilitate the public housing development, which are enclosed in MPC Paper No. 1/18⁸.
- 6.3.11 With regard to noise impacts, HA indicated that mitigation measures including building setback from roads, non-noise sensitive podium structure, acoustic windows, enhanced acoustic balconies and fixed glazing will be incorporated into the proposed development to alleviate the potential noise impact from the road traffic. The DEP agrees with the Environmental Assessment Study (EAS) conducted by HA that the proposed public housing development, with appropriate mitigation measures, meets the relevant requirements under the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) and insurmountable traffic noise impacts are not anticipated. Furthermore, the horizontal separation between the residential building and the carriageways satisfies the buffer distance requirement under HKPSG, and insurmountable air quality impact is not anticipated.
- 6.3.12 On traffic aspect, C for T is of the view that according to the TIA submitted by HA, the proposed development would not inflict any adverse traffic impact on both road network and pedestrian facilities in the vicinity.
- 6.3.13 The nearby LPG storage is located in and supplies LPG to Lok Man Sun Chuen (**Plan H-3k**). HA has conducted a Quantitative Risk Assessment

⁸ The extract of TIA and Quantitative Risk Assessment, the VA and a Summary of Preliminary Environmental Assessment Study are enclosed in the MPC Paper, while the full assessment reports are available for public inspection at PlanD’s Planning Enquiry Counters.

(QRA) which ascertained that the risk levels are acceptable according to the HKPSG after taking into account the increase in the number of persons working or living there due to the proposed redevelopment. The QRA report has been agreed by the Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services (DEMS).

Tree preservation (R2 to R6)

- 6.3.14 A broad brush tree survey was conducted by HA in 2015 to identify dominant tree species, their maturity and rarity, and any plant species of conservation interest within the site. HA advised that the tree survey was conducted in accordance with the latest Development Bureau (DevB)'s Technical Circulars on tree preservation and greening aspects. According to the tree survey, there are no Old and Valuable Tree (OVT) and tree of specific conservation interest identified and there are about 37 trees of common species on the site. All existing trees are without regular maintenance since when it was used as a temporary open carpark under short term tenancy. The health condition and amenity value are poor and low, and the stability of them are not certain. The existing trees at the peripheral of site along Ko Shan Road are located at a slope verge area due to the level difference between Ko Shan Road and the site. Transplanting of those trees on slope verge are not practical while the survival rates after transplanting is low due to their unbalanced root system. The existing trees at the middle of site are located in the unstable planter walls made by cement and masonry.
- 6.3.15 HA will conduct detailed tree survey upon handover of the site from MTRCL. The tree loss will be compensated as much as possible subject to detailed design. The calculation of greenery coverage would be referenced to Practice Note for Authorized Persons, Registered Structural Engineers and Registered Geotechnical Engineer APP-152. The greening target is for minimum 20% of gross site area with half of greenery provided at-grade. A minimum of 3 trees per 100m² of the total green coverage would be provided.

Provision of open space and GIC/recreational facilities (R2 to R6)

- 6.3.16 Based on the requirements in HKPSG, as shown in **Annex VII**, the planned provision for various major community facilities in the area is generally sufficient except for secondary school classrooms (-64 classrooms). For secondary school classrooms, they are assessed on a wider district basis, and there is a surplus provision of 713 classrooms in Kowloon City District.
- 6.3.17 For open space provision, there is a surplus provision of about 4 ha of district open space in Ma Tau Kok area (**Annex VII**). For local open space, while there is a shortfall (about -7 ha) in the area, there is a surplus provision of about 3.3 ha (including the Kau Pui Lung Road Playground near the KSR site) in the wider Kowloon City District. Local open space at 1m² per person in accordance with the HKPSG will be provided within the KSR development to meet the demand generated by the residents.

Furthermore, the KSR site is close to the Ko Shan Road Park and the LST site is close to the Carpenter Road Park and Kowloon Walled City Park. In addition, active recreational facilities such as basketball courts and soccer pitches are provided in various major open space in the area to serve the local residents, e.g. Ko Shan Road Park, To Kwa Wan Recreation Ground and Ma Tau Wai Road Playground (**Plan H-5**).

- 6.3.18 Some major open spaces in Kowloon City including Ma Tau Wai Service Reservoir Playground, Sheung Lok Street Garden, Hoi Sham Park and Kowloon Tsai Park, are located near the Ma Tau Kok area (**Plan H-5**).

Item C2 (R2)

- 6.3.19 The amendment under Item C2 covers part of the podium of an existing development, and is to reflect the existing as-built residential use, and there is no tree at such strip of land (**Plan H-3e**).

6.4 **Responses to Representers' Proposals (R2 to R6)**

Item B

- 6.4.1 Land suitable for housing development in Hong Kong is scarce and there is a genuine need for optimising the use of land available to meet the pressing demand for public housing. The KSR site is considered suitable for public housing development. It is compatible with the surrounding environment, sustainable from traffic, environment, air ventilation, visual and landscape perspectives.
- 6.4.2 Regarding tree preservation and retaining the site as GIC and green lung, the responses in paragraphs 6.3.14 to 6.3.15 are relevant.
- 6.4.3 HA indicated that 16 public car parking spaces will be provided in the basement of the KSR's development to address the demand in the locality, as requested by C for T. The Director of Social Welfare (DSW) has no adverse comment on **R2**'s proposal of providing elderly services in the KSR site and advised that social welfare facilities such as neighbourhood elderly centre, child care centre and integrated family service centre could be considered for provision in the development. HA considered that due to site constraints, no social welfare or community facilities will be provided in the KSR site. Notwithstanding, noting that the relevant social welfare facilities are always permitted in the "R(A)3" zone under the Notes of the OZP, HA is invited to liaise with SWD and consider including some GIC facilities in the development at the detailed design stage where feasible.

6.5 **Responses to Grounds of Comments**

Provision of public car park and community hall at LST site (C1)

- 6.5.1 The LST site is relatively small and there is major technical and

operational difficulty to provide additional basement levels for public car parking spaces. In order to meet the acute demand for social welfare services, certain types of use (e.g. elderly and rehabilitation services) have to be given top priority and some facilities have to be located not more than 24m above ground. LSTBS reconfirmed that it is not feasible to provide any public car parking spaces and a standard-designed community hall above ground in the redevelopment. Nevertheless, LSTBS will further discuss with the concerned government department for the possibility to provide some visitors' car parking spaces and to allow booking of conference rooms / activity rooms in the redevelopment for non-government organisations, non-profit organisations or schools at the detailed design stage.

- 6.5.2 When assessing the need for a new community hall, the Director of Home Affairs (DHA) and the concerned District Officers (DO) would consider all the relevant factors as stipulated in the HKPSG, including population size and current provision of similar community facilities in the vicinity. They will also consider the availability of suitable sites. DO (Kowloon City) (DO(KC)) points out that there are two community halls in Kowloon City District, namely Hung Hom Community Hall and Kai Tak Community Hall; and a community hall near Ho Man Tin Estate is under planning. In addition, Tung Tau Community Centre falling within the Wong Tai Sin District is located in the vicinity of the LST site (about 350m to its northeast) (**Plan H-5**).

Tree preservation (C142)

- 6.5.3 There is one existing tree of common species at LST site (**Plan H-2a**), LSTBS would transplant the tree during the construction stage and would observe the DevB's Guidelines on Tree Transplanting. According to LSTBS, whether the tree will be transplanted back to the LST site upon completion of the redevelopment is subject to further study at the detailed design stage. Nevertheless, the tree concerned will be closely monitored during construction and post-construction stages.
- 6.5.4 For tree preservation at the KSR site, responses in paragraphs 6.3.14 to 6.3.15 are relevant.

Relaxation of BHR at R1's site (C2 to C141)

- 6.5.5 R1's site, to which C2 to C141 are related, is not the subject of any amendment items under the current draft OZP. Responses in paragraphs 6.3.1 and 6.3.2 are relevant.

7 CONSULTATION

- 7.1 The following government departments have been consulted and their comments have been incorporated in the above paragraphs, where appropriate:

- (a) DO(KC), HAD;

- (b) DEMS;
- (c) DEP;
- (d) Director of Housing;
- (e) AMO;
- (f) DSW;
- (g) C for T; and
- (h) Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, PlanD.

7.2 The following Government bureau/departments have been consulted and they have no major comment on the representations and comments:

- (a) SED;
- (b) Director of Architectural Services;
- (c) Chief Building Surveyor/Kowloon, Buildings Department;
- (d) Project Manager (East), Civil Engineering and Development Department;
- (e) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department;
- (f) Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene;
- (g) Director of Fire Services;
- (h) Chief Highway Engineer/Kowloon, HyD;
- (i) Chief Engineer/Railway Development 1-3, Railway Development Office, HyD;
- (j) District Lands Officer/Kowloon East, Lands Department (LandsD);
- (k) District Lands Officer/Kowloon West, LandsD;
- (l) Chief Estate Surveyor/Railway Development, LandsD;
- (m) Director of Leisure and Cultural Services;
- (n) Commissioner of Police; and
- (o) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department.

8 PLANNING DEPARTMENT'S VIEWS

8.1 The supportive view of **R1 (part)** on Item A is noted.

8.2 Based on the assessments in paragraph 6 above and for the following reasons, PlanD does not support R1 (part), R2 to R6 and considers that the OZP should not be amended to meet the representations:

Item A

- (a) the relaxation of the building height restriction (BHR) for the Lok Sin Tong (LST) site will facilitate the proposed social welfare complex development to provide the much needed social welfare facilities for the community. With suitable mitigation measures, the proposed redevelopment would not be subject to adverse environmental impacts and will induce no significant traffic, visual and air ventilation impacts onto the surrounding area (**R3 to R6**);
- (b) the historic elements of the LST site will be preserved, retained and exhibited in the redevelopment. The redevelopment is not contrary to and will not jeopardise the recommendation of the Urban Renewal Plan for Kowloon City (**R2**);

Item B

- (c) land suitable for housing development in Hong Kong is scarce and there is a genuine need for optimising the use of land available to meet the pressing demand for public housing. The Ko Shan Road (KSR) site is considered suitable for public housing development. It is compatible with the surrounding environment, and sustainable from traffic, environment, air ventilation, visual and landscape perspectives (**R2 to R6**);
- (d) there is surplus provision of district open space in Ma Tau Kok area as well as the wider Kowloon City district. Sufficient local open space will be provided within the KSR site. The planned provision for community facilities in Ma Tau Kok is generally sufficient. Public car parking facilities will be provided at KSR site and social welfare facilities will be provided at the LST site to serve the local residents and community (**R2 to R6**);

Item C2

- (e) The amendment under Item C2 covers part of the podium of an existing development. It is to reflect the existing as-built residential use, and there is no tree at that strip of land (**R2**); and

R1

- (f) the site at 40 Lung Kong Road is not the subject of any amendment items under the current draft OZP (**R1**).

9. DECISION SOUGHT

The Board is invited to give consideration to the representations and comments taking into consideration the points raised in the hearing session, and decide whether to propose/not to propose any amendment to the draft OZP to meet/partially meet the representations.

10. ATTACHMENTS

Annex I	Draft Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/23 (reduced size)
Annex II	Schedule of Amendments to the Approved Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/22
Annex III	Lists of Representers and Commenters in respect of the Draft Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/23
Annex IV	CD-ROM containing submissions of Representers and Commenters and hard copy of R1's report (for Members Only)
Annexes Va & Vb	Summary of Representations and Comments on Representations and PlanD's Responses
Annex VI	Extract of the Minutes of the HIC Meeting of KCDC held on 8.1.2018 (Chinese Version Only)

Annex VII	Provision of Open Space and Major GIC Facilities in Ma Tau Kok OZP Area
Drawing H-1	Recommendation of URP for Kowloon City by Kowloon City DURF (Issued in January 2014)
Plan H-1	Location Plan of Representation Sites
	<u>Item A (LST site)</u>
Plan H-2a	Site Plan
Plan H-2b	Aerial Photo
Plans H-2c & 2d	Site Photos
Plan H-2e	Layout Plan
Plans H-2f to 2g	Section Plans
Plan H-2h to 2i	Photomontages
	<u>Items B & C2</u>
Plan H-3a	Site Plan
Plan H-3b	Aerial Photo
Plans H-3c to 3e	Site Photos
Plan H-3f	Layout Plan of KSR Site
Plans H-3g to 3h	Section Plans of KSR Site
Plans H-3i to 3j	Photomontages of KSR Site
Plan H-3k	Site Constraints Plan of KSR Site
	<u>R1's Site</u>
Plan H-4a	Location Plan
Plan H-4b	Site Photo
Plan H-5	Location Plan of Major Existing Open Space and GIC Facilities in Ma Tau Kok and Vicinity Area