

Appendix A

Responses-to-comments Table

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System)
in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

Index Page

1.	Comments of Buildings Department (received on 6.2.2025)	Pages	1
2.	Comments of Geotechnical Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (received on 6.2.2025)	Pages	2
3.	Comments of Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (received on 6.2.2025)	Pages	2
4.	Comments of Fire Services Department (received on 6.2.2025)	Pages	3
5.	Comments of Landscape Unit, Urban Design & Landscape Section, Planning Department (received on 6.2.2025)	Pages	3
6.	Comments of Sha Tin, Tai Po and North District Planning Office, Planning Department (received on 6.2.2025)	Pages	8

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
1.	Comments of Buildings Department (BD) received on 6.2.2025	
1.1	<p>He has no in-principle objection under the Buildings Ordinance (BO) to the proposed use on the application site subject to the following comments:</p> <p>a) Before any new building works are to be carried out on the application site, the prior approval and consent of the BD should be obtained, otherwise they are Unauthorized Building Works (UBW). An Authorized Person (AP) should be appointed as the co-ordinator for the proposed building works in accordance with the BO.</p> <p>b) The site shall be provided with means of obtaining access thereto from a street and emergency vehicular access in accordance with Regulations 5 and 41D of the Building (Planning) Regulations respectively.</p> <p>c) If the site does not abut on a specified street of not less than 4.5m wide, its permitted development intensity shall be determined under Regulation 19(3) of the Building (Planning) Regulation at the building plan submission</p> <p>d) Detailed comments under the BO will be provided at the building plan submission stage.</p>	<p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted.</p>

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
2.	Comments of Geotechnical Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (GEO, CEDD) received on 6.2.2025	
2.1	Please be advised that the Geotechnical Engineering Office (GEO) has no geotechnical comment on the captioned planning application.	Noted.
2.2	Please remind the applicant that the detailed design of the proposed geotechnical works should be submitted to the GEO for review and comment.	Noted.
2.3	Should there be any water-carrying services to be constructed adjacent to slopes and/or retaining walls, please draw the attention of the applicant regarding the recommendations and requirements given in "Code of Practice on Monitoring and Maintenance of Water-carrying Services affecting Slopes" published by the Development Bureau.	Noted.
3.	Comments of Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) received on 6.2.2025	
3.1	The proposed works and operation should generate no environmental nuisance to the surroundings. Its state should not be a nuisance or injurious or dangerous to health and surrounding environment. For any waste generated from the such activity / operation, the applicant should arrange disposal properly at their own expenses.	Noted.

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
3.2	The proposed works and operation should not cause obstruction to the operation of the RCP, including but not limited to the open space in front of the RCP as well as the access road thereto.	Noted.
4.	Comments of Fire Services Department (FSD) received on 6.2.2025	
4.1	He has no specific comment on the captioned application. Detailed fire services requirements will be formulated upon receipt of formal submission of general building plans. The EVA provision shall comply with the standard as stipulated in Section 6, Part D of the Code of Practice for Fire Safety in Buildings 2011, which is administered by the Buildings Department.	Noted.
5.	Comments of Landscape Unit, Urban Design & Landscape Section, Planning Department (PlanD) received on 6.2.2025	
5.1	<p><u>General Comment</u></p> <p>Based on aerial photo of 2023, the site is situated in an area of Residential Urban Fringe landscape character comprising of medium-density residential development, G/IC facilities, and dense woodland. The proposed use is considered not entirely incompatible with the surrounding environment.</p>	Noted.

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
5.2	<p>With reference to Appendix B - Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal, 25 nos. of existing trees (including 2 large trees, T57 with DBH ~980mm and T741 with height ~25m) are identified within the site.</p> <p>a) According to section 6.0 of Appendix B, T57 is growing on slope and edge of drainage channel with roots merged with existing drainage channel where formation of healthy well-shaped rootball is not practicable. Furthermore, T57 has unbalanced crown with lateral branches hanging on other trees. The poor architecture will pose future tree failure and transplanting requires excessive pruning on the unbalanced crown and lateral branches.</p> <p>b) T741 is growing on vegetated slope and its rootball is hardly retrievable. It is also a common exotic species with fast growing and high branching in nature.</p> <p>c) All 25 nos. of existing trees are proposed to be felled due to direct conflict with the proposed development layout, and poor tree health/ structural condition. Mitigation measure including 11 no. of native new trees in light standard-standard size (compensation ratio of 1:0.44), shrubs and groundcover plantings and vertical green are proposed.</p>	<p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted.</p>

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
5.3	<p><u>Advisory Comments on Planning Statement (PS)</u></p> <p>Para 4.4.3:- Editorial error “6/2020” is observed. The captioned technical circular should be DEVB TC(W) No. 5/2020. Please revise accordingly.</p>	<p>Noted. Please refer to the revised paragraph 4.4.3 of the replacement pages of Planning Statement in Attachment 1 for consideration.</p>
5.4	<p><u>Advisory Comments on Appendix B - Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal</u></p> <p>Full justification for less than 1:1 compensatory ratio should be provided (e.g. the applicant is advised to indicate the extent of slope with gradient of over 35 degree should be indicated).</p>	<p>Justifications for tree compensation ratio for less than 1:1 in quantity are elaborated below for reference which are also consolidated in Section 7 of the replacement pages of Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal in Attachment 2 for consideration:</p> <p><u>(A) Areas reserved for necessary and basic facilities for the Proposed Pump Station</u></p> <p>Only a minimal footprint is proposed for the Pump Station with a minimum required size of 237m². Other provisions, such as hard paved circulation/ maintenance paths, loading/ unloading/ drop off areas, are considered basic and essential to the development of Proposed Pump Station.</p> <p><u>(B) Topographical constraints – Slope gradient of over 30 degrees</u></p> <p>Despite part of SIMAR Slope Feature No. 7SW-D/FR54 being re-levelled, around 10% of the slope in the vicinity remains at a slope gradient of over 30degrees. According to GEO Publication No. 1/2011, this gradient is not suitable for tree planting. Please refer to the Tree Planting Plan of Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal which indicates the extent of the slope gradient of over 30 degrees. For healthy and sustainable tree growth on slope gradient of over 30 degrees, sufficient spacing for new tree planting has to be considered to achieve future optimal landscape value on slope.</p>

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments													
		<p>(C) Utilization of available planting space</p> <p>The Applicant has fully utilized all available and feasible spaces for tree planting within the development limits and constraints mentioned above. All areas previously required for the construction of Proposed Pump Station have been allocated for new tree planting. Provided that a 1:1 compensation ratio in terms of quantity is adopted (i.e. 25 nos. new trees), it would occupy at least four times the current available planting space. With the principle of “right tree right place”, the Applicant aims to achieve high-quality landscaping, tree planting with sufficient planting space should be prioritized.</p> <p>Given the above site constraints, 11 native trees are the optimal number to be achieved. Please refer to the “Space Allocation Diagram” in Table 4 (also provided below) and “Tree Planting Plan” (<i>dwg. no. TPP-PR-01, rev. B</i>) in Appendix 4 of the replacement pages of Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal in Attachment 2 for consideration</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th colspan="2">Space Allocation Diagram</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Items</th> <th>Area (approx. %)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td> (A) Area reserved for necessary and basic facilities for the Proposed Station <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building footprint • Loading / unloading / drop off area • Hardscape & maintenance / circulation path </td> <td> 64% 42% 7% 15% </td> </tr> <tr> <td> (B) Topographical constraints - Slope gradient of over 30 degrees </td> <td> 10% </td> </tr> <tr> <td> (C) Utilization of available planting space <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Available and feasible tree planting area </td> <td> 26% 26% </td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="text-align: center;"> Total Site Area = (A) + (B) + (C) </td> <td style="text-align: center;"> 100% </td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Space Allocation Diagram		Items	Area (approx. %)	(A) Area reserved for necessary and basic facilities for the Proposed Station <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building footprint • Loading / unloading / drop off area • Hardscape & maintenance / circulation path 	64% 42% 7% 15%	(B) Topographical constraints - Slope gradient of over 30 degrees	10%	(C) Utilization of available planting space <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Available and feasible tree planting area 	26% 26%	Total Site Area = (A) + (B) + (C)		100%
Space Allocation Diagram															
Items	Area (approx. %)														
(A) Area reserved for necessary and basic facilities for the Proposed Station <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building footprint • Loading / unloading / drop off area • Hardscape & maintenance / circulation path 	64% 42% 7% 15%														
(B) Topographical constraints - Slope gradient of over 30 degrees	10%														
(C) Utilization of available planting space <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Available and feasible tree planting area 	26% 26%														
Total Site Area = (A) + (B) + (C)		100%													

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
5.5	Tree photo of T741 could not show the full extent of the tree height. Please provide additional photos and/ or annotation indicating the extent of the tree height.	Please refer to the additional photo of T741 in Appendix 3 - Photographic Record of Existing Trees of the replacement pages of the Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal in Attachment 2 for consideration.
5.6	No vertical green is observed in DWG No. 2017205-S16-PR-LMP-01a. Please review. The applicant is also advised to provide elevation indicating the extent of vertical green to demonstrate the effectiveness of proposed landscape treatments.	Please refer to the revised Landscape Proposal in Appendix 4 and revised Slope Tree Planting Section and Elevation (dwg. Nos SEC-S16PR-01, rev. C) in Appendix 5-4 of the Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal in Attachment 2 for consideration.
5.7	DWG No. 2017205-S16-PR-LMP-01A:- It is noted that some proposed new trees are located on lawn area and in the immediate vicinity of the proposed pump station/ its foundation. The applicant is reminded that sufficient growing space should be provided to avoid conflict between trees and building/ structure and ensure healthy tree growth.	Sufficient spacing between trees and the Proposed Station has been reserved. Please refer to the revised Slope Tree Planting Section and Elevation (dwg. Nos SEC-S16PR-01, rev. C) in Appendix 5-4 of the Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal in Attachment 2 for consideration.
5.8	DWG No. 2017205-S16-PR-LMP-01a:- Some planting area for shrubs and groundcovers are observed at the southern and northern periphery of the site. The applicant is advised to maximize opportunities for tree plantings to mitigate the loss of existing trees.	<p>Please refer to the above response 5.4. Apart from tree planting, area feasible for under-storey planting, such as shrubs and groundcovers, are introduced as a means of landscape enhancement. To promote ecological value in the vicinity of site, native species is introduced.</p> <p>Vertical greening such as self-clinging climbing plants is proposed on the southern façade of the proposed station for better screening when viewing from downhill of Tung Lo Wan Hill Road.</p> <p>With adoption of multiple landscape measures, it is envisioned that the existing greenery and the green backdrop can be maintained and enhanced. Please refer to Landscape Proposal in Appendix 4 of the Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal in Attachment 2 for consideration.</p>

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
5.9	The applicant is advised that landscape information outside the application boundary is for reference only and would not be reviewed by PlanD.	Noted.
5.10	The applicant should be advised that approval of the application does not imply approval of tree works such as pruning, transplanting and felling. The applicant is reminded to seek approval for any proposed tree works from relevant departments prior to commencement of the works.	Noted.
6.	Comments of Sha Tin, Tai Po and North District Planning Office, PlanD received on 6.2.2025	
6.1	Please provide revision pages to remove the inaccurate statements in English and Chinese about government department’s agreement on the proposed use.	Noted. Please refer to the updated executive summary of the replacement pages of the Planning Statement in Attachment 1 for consideration.

Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (A/ST/1036)

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
6.2	Please also provide graphical illustration to demonstrate the appearance of the proposed installation and the effectiveness of the visual mitigation measures as mentioned in para. 4.4.9 of the Planning Statement.	As enclosed in the Planning Statement submitted in December 2024, a photomontage (extracted and enclosed again in Attachment 3 for easy reference) has already been included to visually illustrate the public view from a point easily accessible by the public from Tung Lo Wan Hill Road Garden towards the Proposed Station. It has already demonstrated that the Proposed Station will be largely screened off by the existing trees, by the public toilet, as well as by the RCP. To further provide graphical illustration to demonstrate the appearance of the Proposed Station and the effectiveness of the visual mitigation measures, please find a coloured graphical illustration (enclosed in Attachment 3) prepared based on Section C as enclosed in the Tree Survey and Tree Treatment Proposal submitted in December 2024 for consideration. It should be highlighted that the visual impact of the Proposed Station is considered to be negligible as demonstrated in the photomontage and the coloured graphical illustration based on Section C.