

## **Appendix A**

### Responses-to-comments Table

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System)  
in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

**Index Page**

1.	Comments of Architectural Services Department (received on 14.2.2025)	Pages	1
2.	Comments of Lands Department (received on 14.2.2025)	Pages	2
3.	Comments of Leisure and Cultural Services Department (received on 14.2.2025)	Pages	5
4.	Comments of Transport Department (received on 18.2.2025)	Pages	6
5.	Comments of Water Supplies Department (received on 6.2.2025)	Pages	7
6.	Comments of Sha Tin, Tai Po and North District Planning Office, Planning Department (received on 18.2.2025)	Pages	8

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

	<b>Departmental Comments</b>	<b>Responses to Comments</b>
<b>1.</b>	<b>Comments of Architectural Services Department (ArchSD) received on 14.2.2025</b>	
1.1	Based on the information provided, it is noted that the proposal mainly consists of a one-storey utility building for a private project approved under a separate planning application. From the photomontages provided, it appears that the proposal has little visual impact to the surrounding environment. We have no comment on the application from visual point of view subject to Planning Department (PlanD)’s view.	Noted.
1.2	<p>It is also noted that the application site may have encroached onto a Slope Feature No.7SW-D/FR549, which is currently maintained by ArchSD. To this end, please see below comment from our Property Services Manager for your information:</p> <p><i>“Based on DWG No. PSDR-FIG-02, it is noted that a pump station would be built at Slope Feature No. 7SW-D/FR549. Based on ‘owner-maintains’ principle, it is assumed that the applicant would take up the future maintenance responsibility of whole Slope Feature No. 7SW-D/FR549. I have no comment from slope maintenance point of view on the s.16 planning application based on my assumption. Please ask the applicant to indicate clearly regarding the maintenance responsibility of the slope.”</i></p>	<p>The applicant has agreed to take up the management and maintenance responsibility for Feature No. 7SW-D/FR549. Please refer to the updated paragraph 4.1.3 of the replacement page of Geotechnical Review Report (GRR) in <b>Attachment 1</b> and extracted below for consideration:</p> <p><i>“The feature boundary of the existing feature no. 7SW-D/FR549 shall be reduced and modified to accommodate the Proposed Pump Station. The management and maintenance responsibilities for feature no. 7SW-D/FR549 upon the completion of the pump station construction shall be taken up by the project proponent.”</i></p> <p>It should be noted that the management and maintenance responsibilities of the abovementioned slope features is subject to liaisons and agreements with relevant government departments in detailed design and land exchange stages.</p>

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

	<b>Departmental Comments</b>	<b>Responses to Comments</b>
<b>2.</b>	<b>Comments of Lands Department (LandsD) received on 14.2.2025</b>	
2.1	The Application Site falls entirely within the existing permeant government land allocation No. ST-336 (“PGLA ST-336”) which is allocated to LCSD for public open space (currently known as Tung Lo Wan Hill Road Garden) and the Slope Feature No. 7SW-D/FR549 maintained by ArchSD.	Noted.
2.2	For implementation of the proposed residential development approved by TPB in Jan 2023 (“the proposed residential development”) and the proposed Pump Station under the application, the applicant has proposed to upgrade and widen the existing single-lane Tung Lo Wan Hill Road to a 2-lane carriageway as indicated on Figures 3.1 and 3.2 of the Planning Statement (“the Widened Road”). The Widened Road would encroach upon (i) the area allocated to Waters Supplies Department (“WSD”) for the use of Sha Tin North Service Reservoir; (ii) the area allocated to Food and Environment Hygiene Department (“FEHD”) for the use of the refuse collection point; (iii) the PGLA ST-336; and (iv) various registered slope features currently maintained by different government department including LCSD, ArchSD and WSD. Notwithstanding, the alignment of the Widened Road has not been finalised and is still pending for the liaison of the applicant and Transport Department (TD) according to para. 3.2.1 of the Planning Statement.	Noted.

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

	<b>Departmental Comments</b>	<b>Responses to Comments</b>
2.3	<p>For the Application, our comments are below:</p> <p>(a) The owner of the lots for the proposed residential development (same as the applicant) has applied for land exchange to implement the proposed residential development. Subject to TPB's approval for the proposed Pump Station and the relevant departments' agreement to release their areas in para. 2 and 3 above, our office may consider to integrate the Application Site in the land exchange and process the necessary statutory provisions, i.e. Road (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance (Cap 370) for the Widened Road as agreed by the relevant departments as aforesaid. However, our office would like to stress that there is also no guarantee that the land exchange will be approved. The land exchange will be considered by LandsD acting in its capacity as the landlord at its own discretion and any approval for the land exchange would be subject to such terms and conditions including, inter alia, the payment of premium and administrative fee, as may be imposed by LandsD. Moreover, it shall not be construed that the schematic designs and alignment of the Widened Road as proposed in the application will be accepted or approved under Cap 370. In particular, the extent and scale of such schematic designs and the alignment may need to be reduced/revised subject to the comments of the relevant departments for compliance with the minimum statutory requirement so as to minimize disturbance to the surrounding environment.</p>	<p>Noted. The Applicant will continue liaise and coordinate with relevant departments as part of the on-going land exchange application. The design and extent of the Proposed Station and the widen access road will be further reviewed in land exchange stage in accordance with relevant ordinances and regulations.</p>

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

	<b>Departmental Comments</b>	<b>Responses to Comments</b>
	<p>(b) Regarding the proposed responsibility of the applicant for the Widened Road in para. 3.3.3 of the Planning Statement, please note that Tung Lo Wan Hill Road is currently open for public use at all time and the Widened Road upon completion should also maintain such public use. As such, it is advised that the applicant should explore the possibility for TD and HyD to take up the future management and maintenance responsibility of the Widened Road as an alternative option for the land exchange application.</p> <p>(c) According to Table 3.2 of the Planning Statement, the applicant has intended to execute the land exchange in Q2 2026. However, LandsD is unable to commit such timeframe as the processing time of the land exchange may be subject to various factors, e.g. completion of Cap 370 procedure for the Widened Road, premium negotiation, etc.</p> <p>(d) The Planning Statement (i.e. the Executive Summary and para. 1.1.3) has stated that the Water Supply Impact Assessment (“WSIA”) submitted for the approved S12A Application for the proposed residential development contained the design of the proposed pump station and the associated rising mains, which were agreed by the relevant Government Departments. It is noted that the locality of such pump station, associated rising mains as well as the alignment of the Widened Road in the WSIA are different from the subject application. For clarity, our office did not accept nor give "no objection" comment on the locality of such pump station, associated rising mains and the alignment of the Widened Road in the WSIA when commenting the relevant S12A Application. Normally, details of such facilities would be examined when the finalised scheme or proposal is available under the land exchange application as aforesaid.</p>	<p>Noted. The applicant will liaise and coordinate with relevant departments on the management and maintenance responsibilities of the widen access road in land exchange stage.</p> <p>Noted. The tentative implementation programme outlined in Table 3.2 of the Planning Statement that provides a target timeframe for the implementation is intended for reference only.</p> <p>Noted. The relevant sections have been revised in the previous further information submitted on 14.2.2024. Please refer to the replacement pages of the Planning Statement enclosed again in <b>Attachment 2</b> for consideration.</p> <p>The Applicant will continue liaise and coordinate with relevant departments as part of the on-going land exchange application. The design and extent of the Proposed Station will be further reviewed in land exchange stage in accordance with relevant ordinances and regulations.</p>

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
<b>3.</b>	<b>Comments of Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) received on 14.2.2025</b>	
	<u>Comments from Sha Tin District Leisure Services Office (STDLSO)</u>	
3.1	LCSD has no in-principle objection to the application subject to Lands Department's decision as concerned area within Tung Lo Wan Hill Road Garden (PGLA ST-336) will be alienated to LandsD. Even though concerned area is an unattended area without public facilities, the project proponent should clearly marked the demarcation and interfacing issues including the M&M between the sites. LCSD reserves the right to provide further comment on the applications including the TPRP, design of pump station, fence-off area, arrangement of site access and underground utilities, etc.	Noted. Please refer to the Demarcation Plan of the Proposed Management and Maintenance Responsibilities in <b>Attachment 3</b> for consideration. The Applicant will take up the management and maintenance responsibilities of the Proposed Station (coloured in yellow) and the Slope Features No. 7SW-D/FR549 (coloured in green) based on the “beneficiary-maintain” principle.  It should be noted that the management and maintenance responsibilities of the concerned area is subject to liaisons and agreements with relevant government departments in detailed design and land exchange stages.
3.2	On the other hand, the application site is fall on the SIMAR Slop "7SW-D/FR549" which is maintained by ArchSD. The works may affect the structure of the SIMAR slope and the trees fall on the slope, therefore comments from ArchSD shall be sought.	Please note that the subject planning application has been circulated to ArchSD for comments. Please refer to the above responses-to-comments 1.1 and 1.2 for reference.
	<u>Comments from New Territories East Tree Team (NTETT)</u>	
3.3	On the understanding that no existing tree maintained by LCSD (NTETT) would be affected, LCSD has no specific comment on the subject.	Noted.

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

	<b>Departmental Comments</b>	<b>Responses to Comments</b>
<b>4.</b>	<b>Comments of Transport Department (TD) received on 18.2.2025</b>	
4.1	He has no objection in-principle on the application from traffic engineering point of view.	Noted.
4.2	It is noted that there would be construction vehicles accessing the Site during the construction stage, and the traffic generated is expected to be insignificant compared to that generated by the planned residential development. Significant adverse traffic impact and road safety issue are not anticipated.	Noted.
4.3	While the management responsibilities of the proposed widened section of Tung Lo Wan Hill Road is being reviewed, it should also be reviewed whether the management and maintenance of any underground utilities such as water mains underneath the proposed widened section of Tung Lo Wan Hill Road would be taken up the relevant government department.	Noted. The management and maintenance responsibilities of the widen access road and the underground utilities is subject to liaisons and agreements with relevant government departments in detailed design and land exchange stages.



**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

	Departmental Comments	Responses to Comments
5.	<b>Comments of Water Supplies Department (WSD) received on 6.2.2025</b>	
5.1	<p>From the operational perspective, it is proposed to adopt the following demarcation of responsibilities between WSD and the applicant for the proposed water mains from the existing connection to the private pumping station and then to the residential development.</p> <p>(1) Maintenance responsibility of the proposed water mains (both fresh water and salt water (FW&amp; SW)) between the private pumping station and the residential development shall rest with the applicant; and</p> <p>(2) Maintenance responsibility of the proposed water mains (both FW &amp; SW) between the existing water mains and the inlet of the private pumping station shall rest with WSD.</p> <p>Therefore, our comments on the Submission are marked in RED below for your consolidation.</p> <p>(i) <u>"TLWHR Pump Station Consolidated Planning Statement (Highlighted Changes) 20250110"</u>            In Table 3.3, the maintenance parties of the external water mains between the existing FW and SW mains and the <b>inlet of private pumping station section of the Access Road</b> would be WSD.</p> <p>(ii) <u>"A ST 1036 Pump Station Design Report"</u>            In Para. 4.3.2, the proposed external water mains between the existing FW and SW main and the <b>inlet of private pumping station section of the widened Tung Lo Wan Hill Road</b> (i.e. water mains to be laid in <b>the widened Tung Lo Wan Hill Road which is government land and maintained by the Applicant</b>) will be constructed by the Applicant and are proposed to be handed over to WSD after construction.</p>	<p>Noted. Please refer to the revised paragraph 4.3.2 of the replacement page of the Pump Room Design Report in <b>Attachment 4</b> and extracted below for consideration:</p> <p><i>"The proposed external water mains between the existing fresh water and salt water main and the inlet of private pumping station (i.e. water mains to be laid under the widened Tung Lo Wan Hill Road which is maintained by the Applicant) will be constructed by the Applicant and are proposed to be handed over to Water Supplies Department after construction."</i></p> <p>Please also refer to Table 3.3 of the replacement pages of the Planning Statement in <b>Attachment 2</b> and the illustrative plan of the proposed management and maintenance responsibilities of the water mains in <b>Attachment 5</b> for consideration. It should be noted that the extent of the water mains demarcated on the plan is for indicative purpose and reference only. The management and maintenance responsibilities of the water mains is subject to liaisons and agreements with relevant government departments in detailed design and land exchange stages.</p>

**Section 16 Planning Application for Proposed Utility Installation for Private Project (Pump Station for Salt and Fresh Water System) in “Government, Institution or Community” Zone on Government Land in D.D. 186, Tung Lo Wan Hill Road, Sha Tin (Application No. A/ST/1036)**

	<b>Departmental Comments</b>	<b>Responses to Comments</b>
<b>6.</b>	<b>Comments of Sha Tin, Tai Po and North District Planning Office, PlanD received on 18.2.2025</b>	
6.1	Please provide a plan to demarcate the relevant areas of the proposed management and maintenance responsibilities.	Please refer to the illustrative plan of the proposed management and maintenance responsibilities of the water mains in <b>Attachment 5</b> for consideration.
6.2	Please further elaborate about the trees compensation.	The Applicant has explained the site constraints and provided full justifications about the compensation ratio in the previous Further Information (1) submitted on 14.2.2025. The Applicant would like to further elaborate that opportunity will be explored at the detailed design stage for possible location for additional trees planting as far as practicable within the private residential site in the “R(B)3” zone in future.