

---

Table | 1

Response-to-Comments table

**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

**Responses-to-Comments Table**

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
28.6.2024	Transport Department	<p><b><u>Traffic Impact Assessment Report</u></b>  <b>Table 2.8 and Table 2.9 –</b>            CTB 78X operates on Mondays to Fridays only. Please suitably add note (4) in the column of frequency.</p>	Noted and Table 2.8 is amended.
		<p><b>Para. 2.25 –</b>            Please replace “short walking distance” by “reasonable walking distance”.</p>	Noted and amended.
		<p><b>Para. 2.25 and Table 2.9 (Note) –</b>            Please supplement that the proposed carrying capacity has taken into account the latest government policy on promoting the use of electric/ new energy buses.</p>	Noted and amended.
		<p><b>Para. 2.28 and 2.29 –</b>            Please also present the range of actual occupancy apart from the average occupancy of franchised bus and GMB services.</p>	Noted and amended.
		<p><b>Para. 4.6</b>            Please also use similar existing developments in the North District to substantiate the trip rates adopted for the proposed developments.</p>	Additional trip rates from existing development in the North District are substantiated in Paragraph 4.6 to 4.8, and Table 4.3.
		<p><b>Table 4.4 –</b>            Please advise the trip rates adopted for the other known planned/committed major developments. Please also liaise with PlanD to check whether all the planned and committed</p>	Adopted trip rates and the estimated traffic generation are supplemented in Appendix B of the updated TIA.

**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
		developments in the AOI have been included.	<p>PlanD comment on this specific topic was sought, and the following reply was received:</p> <p><i>“All technical assessments should include the existing developments and the planned/committed developments including approved valid planning applications and planning and engineering studies which could be found within the public domain via Town Planning Board's Statutory Planning Portal 2, the Planning Department's website and the Planning Enquiry Counters.”</i></p> <p>In additional to the information obtained from the Town Planning Board's Statutory Planning Portal 2, and Planning Department, new developments listed in the revised TIA are also obtained from other public domains including the website of District Council, Housing Department, Civil Engineering and Development Department etc. Hence, the list of new developments included is opined comprehensive</p>
		<p><b>Table 4.8 –</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is noted that green minibus service is excluded from the mode share. Please clarify.</li> </ul>	<p>GMB services are excluded in the calculation in view the existing GMB services is found to have little spare capacity to serve the Proposed Development (Table 2.8 of the updated TIA refers).</p>

**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="568 325 1308 453">Please add a separate table summarizing the mode share of each transport mode, including Rail (feeder), franchised bus (long-haul), green minibus, taxi and private car.</li> <li data-bbox="568 517 1308 1027">It is noted that the mode share of “Road-based Public Transport (Local within North District)” is on the high side (same as Rail-based feeder service (i.e. 35%), while the mode share of rail feeder service is relatively low when compared to other studies. With reference to the public housing development in Queen’s Hill, it is noted that the mode share of rail feeder service is high. Please advise the reason of such high proportion and your calculation of the mode share of various road-based transport services, and make suitable adjustment taking into account the above comment.</li> </ul>	<p data-bbox="1330 325 2134 501">The mode of transport, i.e. rail (feeder), franchised bus (long haul), franchised bus (local), taxi and private car, is specified in amended Table 4.8, and Table C6 in Appendix C of the updated TIA. For GMB, see above.</p> <p data-bbox="1330 517 2134 836">In view existing public transport services available on Sha Tau Kok Road serve both Fanling and Sheung Shui Stations, and the Proposed Development is not directly served by rail-based public transport, hence, local trips within North District are expected to complete by road-based public transport only, and use of rail-based service for local trips is not anticipated. Therefore the mode share of rail-based services, and rail feeder services, are lower.</p> <p data-bbox="1330 900 2134 1315">These percentages on mode share are derived based on data obtained from Population Census 2021, Table B203, “Persons Attending Full-time Courses in Educational Institutions in Hong Kong by District Council District, Place of Study, Year and Main Mode of Transport to Place of Study”, and Table C204, “Working Population with Fixed Place of Work in Hong Kong by District Council District, Place of Work, Year and Main Mode of Transport to Place of Work.” The detail calculations are summarised in Appendix C of the updated TIA for reference.</p>

**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
		<p><b>Para. 4.23-4.25 Table 4.9 and Figure 4.4 –</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• While a feeder service is proposed to / from Kwu Tung Station, please advise the alternative service to Fanling / Sheung Shui Station, if any.</li> </ul>	<p>At this stage, feeder service to/from Fanling / Sheung Shui is not proposed.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Please advise the routing of the feeder service for our information.</li> </ul>	<p>The preliminary routing of the proposed feeder service to/from Kwu Tung Station is demonstrated in Figure 4.4 of the updated TIA.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Please advise the availability of transport facilities and passenger queuing space at Kwu Tung Station to accommodate the proposed feeder service and transport demand.</li> </ul>	<p>According to the Approved Kwu Tung North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/KTN/4, a commercial / residential development with public transport interchange is planned at Kwu Tung Station. Similar to other new public transport interchanges at rail stations constructed in recently years, it is believed that sufficient transport facilities and passenger queueing space shall be incorporated into the design of the PTI by Others to fulfil the expected district-wise passenger demand.</p> <p>Nevertheless, the Proposed Development is estimated to only generate peak passenger demand from Kwu Tung Station of only 382 passengers during the PM peak hour serving with f5 double decker buses, i.e. an average queuing demand of some 76 passengers in between services, which only requires some 13m<sup>2</sup> of queueing space within the PTI, and is opined insignificant.</p> <p>[Cal: 76 pax ÷ 5 pax / 1.2m<sup>2</sup> = 13m<sup>2</sup>]</p>

**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Please advise why no feeder service to Fanling / Sheung Shui Station is proposed and the availability of alternative service.</li> </ul>	<p>It is understood the existing PTI at both Fanling and Sheung Shui Stations are very busy during the AM and PM peak hours, hence, to minimise the impact associated with the Proposed Development, the new feeder service is proposed to operate to and from Kwu Tung Station.</p> <p>Alternatively, public transport to and from Fanling / Sheung Shui Station are currently available with KMB and GMB services at Sha Tau Kok Road fronting the Subject Site.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Based on your current estimation on the transport demand on rail feeder service (i.e. 611) during the peak hour, the proposed feeder service should operate at 8-minute headway to cope with the transport demand. Please advise the journey time of the proposed feeder service and the fleet size required to demonstrate that provision of an on-street 26m bus bay is sufficient to cope with the transport demand. Under your proposed arrangement as shown in Figure 4.4, the proposed bus lay-by could only accommodate two buses.</li> </ul>	<p>The expected round trip journey time is approximately 50 minutes, including 5 minutes boarding and alighting time at each end of the route; hence, the estimation on fleet size is 7 vehicles during the AM peak hour, and 5 vehicles during the PM peak hour. The details are summarized in Table 4.9 of the updated TIA.</p> <p>Based on Table 2.7.6.1 in Volume 9 Chapter 2.7 of the TPDM, a single stand terminal has a capacity of maximum 12 departures per hour, which is more than the peak frequency of the proposed feeder service, i.e ; hence, the proposed bus lay-by will be able to serve the expected demand.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Please advise the bus stacking arrangement and boarding &amp; alighting arrangement.</li> </ul>	<p>It is proposed to operate the proposed feeder as circular route between Kwu Tung Station and the Proposed Development, with Kwu Tung Station as the terminal point, hence, no bus stacking</p>

**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
			<p>within the Proposed Development is necessary.</p> <p>Boarding and alighting within the Proposed Development will be carried out at the 26m-long bus layby.</p>
		<p><b>Para. 4.26 and Table 4.10 –</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The passenger queuing arrangement should be further reviewed subject to the updated demand on various transport services in response to the above comments.</li> </ul>	<p>Passenger demand for each mode of transport is reviewed per above comments, and concluded with no changes; hence, Table 4.10 in the updated TIA remains valid.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Similar to other projects, the project proponent is responsible for providing public transport facilities such as shelter to provide better waiting environment to passengers.</li> </ul>	<p>Noted and these facilities shall be incorporated in the detail design stage.</p>
		<p><b>Para. 4.27-4.29 and Tables 4.11 and 4.12 –</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Please advise the details of the said “various bus-bus interchange” mentioned in para.4.27.</li> </ul>	<p>Noted, and the relevant paragraphs and tables are amended in the updated TIA.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The estimation and assessment should be further updated in response to our comments about the modal split of different transport mode above.</li> </ul>	<p>Passenger demand for each mode of transport is reviewed per above comments, and concluded with no changes; hence, the relevant estimation and assessment remain valid in the updated TIA.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>As mentioned before, you should conduct analysis on route/ destination basis instead of simply comparing the overall surplus capacity and aggregated passenger demand arising from the proposed development in order to better reflect the actual situation.</li> </ul>	<p>Noted, and the relevant paragraphs and tables are amended in the updated TIA to include specify information on each local service route.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Please advise if the passenger demand of other bus</li> </ul>	<p>Passenger demand of other bus services/ GMB services are</p>

**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
		<p>services/ GMB services, apart from KMB 78K and 79K, observing the bus stop concerned presented in Table 4.12 has been taken into consideration in your assessment on the queuing space of the existing bus stop.</p>	<p>considered in the revised assessment presented in Tables 4.15, of which is negligible at present.</p>
		<p><b>Para. 4.30-4.33 and Tables 4.13 and 4.14 –</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The estimation and assessment should be further updated in response to our comments about the modal split of different transport mode above.</li> </ul>	<p>Passenger demand for each mode of transport is reviewed per above comments, and concluded with no changes; hence, the relevant estimation and assessment remain valid in the updated TIA.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Please advise the walking distance from the proposed development to the bus stop concerned.</li> </ul>	<p>The bus stops are located some 200m from the Proposed Development on both sides of Sha Tau Kok Road.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• As mentioned before, you should conduct analysis on route/ destination basis instead of simply comparing the overall surplus capacity and aggregated passenger demand arising from the proposed development in order to better reflect the actual situation.</li> </ul>	<p>Noted, the relevant analyses are revised based on route / destination basis. The relevant paragraphs and tables have been amended in the updated TIA.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Please advise if the passenger demand of the intra-district bus services/ GMB services, apart from those long-haul service to urban areas, observing the bus stop concerned presented in Table 4.14 has been taken into consideration in your assessment on queuing space of the existing bus stop.</li> </ul>	<p>Passenger demand of other bus services/ GMB services are considered in the revised assessment presented in Tables 4.16, of which is negligible at present.</p>



**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
		<p><b>Para. 4.35 and 4.36 –</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The proposed Queen’s Hill Station is just a concept that is still in the initial planning stage. Even if there would be a Queen’s Hill Station, it is anticipated that the target commissioning year would be beyond 2040. In view that the target population intake of the proposed development is 2031, we do not consider that the proposed railway station could cater for the transport demand arising from the proposed development upon its population intake. The residents would still largely rely on road-based transport (i.e. feeder service to Fanling/ Sheung Shui/ Kwu Tung Station and longhaul franchised bus services to urban area).</li> </ul>	<p>Noted. The implementation of Queen’s Hill Station was not considered in the analyses conducted in the TIA, and the transport demand arising from the Proposed Development is assumed to rely on road-based public transport services only, and the details are presented in the updated TIA.</p>
		<p><b>Para. 4.23 to 4.25 and Table 4.9 –</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Similar to the comments above, you should conduct further analysis regarding the passenger split to / from different destinations based on the survey results of different longhaul routes, instead of simply comparing the overall surplus capacity and aggregated passenger demand arising from the proposed development.</li> </ul>	<p>Noted, the relevant analyses are revised based on route / destination basis. The relevant paragraphs and tables have been amended in the updated TIA.</p>
		<p><b>Para. 5.6 –</b></p> <p>Please subtly update this paragraph with your revised assessment taking into account our comments mentioned above.</p>	<p>Noted.</p>

**Section 12A Planning Application No. Y/NE-LYT/16**

Request for Amendment to the Approved Lung Yeuk Tau and Kwan Tei South Outline Zoning Plan No.S/NE-LYT/19 from “Residential (Group C)” Zone and “Agriculture” Zone to “Residential (Group A)2” Zone at Various Lots in D.D. 83 and Adjoining Government Land in D.D. 83, Lung Yeuk Tau, New Territories

*Further Information (9)  
Responses-to-Comments Table*

Date	Department	Comments	Responses
		<p><b><u>Comments from Railway Monitoring Division</u></b></p> <p>As per our reply to PlanD on 5 October 2023, we have no comment on the paragraphs related to East Rail Line. However, as the Government has just confirmed the construction of NOL Eastern Extension, which falls within the subject site, the consultant should advise whether there is any impact to the calculations in the TIA.</p>	<p>Noted. The TIA has not taken account the implementation of the Queen’s Hill Station in view the expected population intake is before the new railway become operational, and hence a more conservative assessment was performed.</p>